Ms. Edinberg,

On behalf of Northern Plains Resource Council (Northern Plains) and its members, I am submitting the following comments to the Montana Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) in response to the October 2019 Revised Remedy Evaluation Report (RER) Part 1 for the Units 1&2 ponds at Colstrip, which was submitted to DEQ by Talen Energy.

Northern Plains is a grassroots conservation and family agriculture non-profit organization based in Billings, Montana. Northern Plains organizes Montana citizens to protect our water quality, family farms and ranches, and unique quality of life. Northern Plains is dedicated to providing the information and tools necessary to give citizens an effective voice in decisions that affect their lives.

Northern Plains formed in 1972 over the issue of coal strip mining and its impacts on private surface owners who own the land over federal and state mineral reserves, as well as the environmental and social impacts of mining, burning, and transporting coal. We have many members who live and own ranches in the Colstrip area. Those members’ livelihoods depend entirely on clean air and water, native soils and vegetation, and lands that remain intact.

Furthermore, members outside the Colstrip area recognize the negative impacts that legacy groundwater pollution from the leaking coal ash ponds will have on Eastern Montana and adamantly support a thorough and responsible cleanup there. Insofar as the waters of the State of Montana belong to all of the people of our state and insofar as any legacy pollution clean-up costs that remain after plant owners’ remediation efforts end could be borne by Montana taxpayers, all of our members have a strong vested interest in ensuring thorough clean-up of Rosebud County’s water resources and a bright future for the region.

Attached to these comments, you will find a technical analysis prepared on our behalf on December 4, 2019 by KirK Engineering & Natural Resources, Inc. (KirK). We encourage you to thoroughly review these findings, and while they are not all additionally mentioned or detailed in these comments, we incorporate KirK’s findings by reference.
Background

In January of 1973 at a hearing in Miles City on the proposed coal ash disposal ponds for Colstrip Units 1&2, then-Northern Plains Board of Directors’ Chair Ellen Pfister testified that wet disposal of coal ash in scoria soil would result in leakages. In subsequent years, Northern Plains’ members in the area continued to raise this issue and to demand that state agencies evaluate how Montana Power Company would control the leaking ash ponds. During hearings prior to the initial construction of Units 3&4, local landowners gave examples of stock reservoirs not holding water due to porous substrate and soils, and recommended that dry storage methods be used to contain the contaminants in the coal ash. These recommendations were dismissed by the Colstrip plant owners and largely ignored by state agencies permitting the ponds.

The current system to control groundwater pollution at all Colstrip coal ash ponds relies on pump-back wells and is a temporary solution that does not address the root cause of the pollution – the leaking coal ash ponds. The pumps pull roughly 750 gallons of groundwater per minute, or 1,080,000 gallons per day, out of the aquifer to prevent the pollution from spreading according to capture-well data contained in Talen Energy’s Site Characterization reports. While we appreciate that perpetual pumping may now be a necessary element of pollution control, it is not enough in-and-of-itself. The source of pollution must be eliminated. The owners have been allowed to operate for four decades in direct violation of Montana water quality law and the plant’s original Major Facility Siting Act permit. The owners’ and state’s failure to act has made a bad problem worse.

What is infuriating for adjacent landowners is that during the last four decades this band-aid approach to simply contain pollution with capture wells rather than stop the pollution at its source has created a permanent (and once-avoidable) problem in the form of bedrock aquifer contamination. We believe the state cannot afford a “wait-and-see” approach with this cleanup. It is time to address the problem head-on with aggressive source-control measures that dig out coal ash sitting in the groundwater and move the coal ash to a lined landfill above the water table. To protect groundwater, DEQ cannot leave unlined or leaking coal ash ponds sitting in the water table. We believe DEQ will need to exercise the agency’s authority as outlined in Article XIII, Section D, of the AOC [Administrative Order of Consent] throughout the RER approval process in order to protect the community’s long-term health and safety and to require that Talen Energy execute a responsible cleanup.

Agricultural operations in the Armells Creek watershed have suffered from coal ash pond leakages that have introduced high sulfate and Total Dissolved Solids (TDS) concentrations into the aquifer and from the excessive pumping of uncontaminated groundwater in order to limit the spread of the contamination plume. While pumping may now be situationally necessary, it comes at a meaningful cost. The capture system daily contaminates ever more groundwater, as virgin groundwater is pumped out from the ground via capture wells and piped into storage ponds where it mixes with coal ash. According to DEQ’s leakage estimates, 367 gallons of contaminated water leak per minute from the Colstrip coal ash ponds. The capture system, however, pumps an estimated 750 gallons of water per minute out of the aquifer according to Talen Energy’s estimates in the Site Characterization Reports. We are then needlessly
contaminating roughly 483 gallons of fresh groundwater per minute just to control the spread of pollution as virgin groundwater is pumped out from the aquifer and transported for storage in the coal ash ponds where it becomes contaminated.

Citizen lawsuits from adjacent landowners to the Units 1&2 ponds in 2008 resulted in a $25 million settlement for damages caused by pollution from the leaking coal ash ponds. The lawsuits, however, did not result in a permanent fix to eliminate future leakages. The state regulatory agencies, currently DEQ, have never required a permanent fix, only requiring expansion of the capture system to remove more groundwater in an effort to control the spreading pollution. It is encouraging to see the active remediation proposals in the RER, including in-situ flushing (which we view as critical), but the Preferred Alternative does not include the single most important strategy needed to remediate pollution at the Units 1&2 ponds — **source removal of coal ash**. Source removal is the only proven strategy that will keep coal ash at the Stage Two Evaporation Ponds (STEP) out of contact with groundwater in the long term and safeguard the region’s water resources.

It is clear from DEQ comments to Talen Energy dated April 22, 2019, that DEQ requested source removal be thoroughly evaluated as a remediation technology for the Stage One Evaporation Ponds (SOEP). However, no alternatives in this RER evaluate source removal for the other pond complex associated with Units 1&2 – STEP – despite the fact that the water table also intercepts coal ash at that complex. For the same reasons that SOEP ash will remain a continual, long-term source of contaminants of interest (COIs) if left in place, STEP ash will continue to release COIs for hundreds of years unless it is moved to a new landfill above the water table.

DEQ is not limited to approving only alternatives that are provided by Talen Energy. Indeed, Talen Energy has provided no alternative that guarantees a healthy future for Colstrip and meets clean-up criteria within the AOC boundary for the Units 1&2 site, as defined in the Cleanup Criteria and Risk Assessment report (for example, bringing concentrations of boron and sulfate down below 4 mg/L and 3000 mg/L, respectively, in the alluvium). Even Talen Energy admits that their seemingly preferred alternative, Alternative 5, will result in pollution levels exceeding preliminary clean-up criteria 50 years after they have begun their remediation efforts (see, for instance, page xiii in the RER which states, “As such, Alternative 5 includes MNA [monitored natural attenuation] and institutional controls to address the small isolated Near-Source areas that do not attain the PCC [proposed cleanup criteria], and the Distal Areas within the Plant Property boundary where the boron plume reemerges after the injection/capture system is shut down.”)

To be clear, Northern Plains supports the goals of the AOC and believes the plume remediation technologies outlined in this RER are meaningful steps to help achieve those goals. However, without adequate source controls regarding the coal ash itself, any progress made through plume remediation stands to be reversed in future decades as a long-term source of pollution rebounds.
Deficiencies in the RER

These comments, and the attached review by KirK Engineering, lay out myriad deficiencies in Talen Energy's draft RER. In the next several pages, we would like to further explore four deficiencies of particular note:

- the RER lacks an alternative where source removal of all coal ash at STEP is evaluated;
- pond liners will not act as a permanent barrier between groundwater and coal ash;
- long-term leaching from STEP is not accurately characterized; and
- the RER lacks a plan for long-term pumping beyond 2070.

The RER lacks an alternative where source removal of all coal ash at STEP is evaluated.

We are heartened by DEQ’s April 22, 2019, letter to Gordon Criswell that states that “DEQ will not accept a remedy that leaves a long-term source in place if it is in contact with groundwater.” Talen Energy’s present failure to evaluate source removal in the RER means they cannot possibly show they will meet this important standard. The water table is elevated above coal ash at the Units 1&2 ponds, and capping any of these ponds in place will leave coal ash in contact with groundwater long-term, making it impossible to meet AOC cleanup goals in the future.

We believe the final remedy must include source removal of coal ash at STEP and that DEQ should require this be evaluated in Part 2 of the RER. The alternatives presented by Talen Energy in this report do not allow DEQ to truly evaluate how STEP coal ash continues as a long-term source of COIs if it is capped in place. An alternative where both STEP and SOEP coal ash are removed must be evaluated in the Units 1&2 RER Part 2 and weighed against capping any of the coal ash in place. The AOC includes a clear requirement in Article XI that the Remedy Evaluation Reports must contain, among other things, an “Identification and summary of feasible remedial alternatives” (Section C.2.a). Source removal of coal ash is a standard practice for coal ash ponds that sit below the water table. In fact, state legislatures in North Carolina, South Carolina, Virginia, and Illinois have all passed laws mandating this as a requirement. Talen Energy’s failure to identify source removal of STEP coal ash as a feasible remedial alternative in this report means they are not meeting this important standard in the AOC.

We also note that none of the alternatives presented in the report achieve the cleanup criteria as identified in the Units 1&2 Cleanup Criteria and Risk Assessment report within all AOC boundaries at the Units 1&2 site. Meeting cleanup criteria is the main point of the AOC process. DEQ issued the AOC as an enforcement action for cleaning up the leaking Unit 1&2 ponds, but the RER as written does not prevent the ponds from leaking into the future as it leaves coal ash sitting below the groundwater table.

The Colstrip owners have had four decades to resolve this issue and have failed to implement a successful strategy. A RER that includes cap-in-place closure for any of the Units 1&2 ponds that are below the water table constitutes a “kick the can down the road” approach and will result in area groundwater contamination continuing into the future. Adjacent
landowners have waited for 40 years for the DEQ, the responsible state agency, to enforce Montana water quality law and require permanent storage of coal ash in a safe, dry landfill. We cannot push the real work of the AOC – digging up coal ash – off into the future and play out a scenario where the state is forced to claw back funding from companies that no longer have active operations in Montana.

We are steadfast in our belief that DEQ must use any means necessary to require Talen Energy to include a source removal alternative in Part 2 of the report. The AOC process is itself an enforcement action, and the RERs are the single largest and most important decision-making part of that process. It is therefore critical that DEQ view enforcement as a central theme of the RER-approval process and ensure that a source removal alternative is included for evaluation in Part 2.

**Pond liners will not act as a permanent barrier between groundwater and coal ash.**

We know that the liners beneath STEP have been leaking for decades and will not act as a permanent barrier between groundwater and coal ash as Talen Energy falsely claims in the RER. The water table at the Units 1&2 ponds is elevated above the bottom of STEP ponds. Therefore, coal ash capped in place ensures coal ash will remain in contact with groundwater and be a long-term source of COIs. Even if the ponds are completely dewatered and all STEP coal ash is temporarily dried out, that situation won’t last. Clean groundwater will well up through pathways in the liners where pond water is currently leaking. That groundwater will mix with coal ash again, become contaminated, and finally leak back out, carrying COIs into the aquifer. Talen Energy estimates the high-density polyethylene (HDPE) liners are rated for 400 years in unexposed conditions and 36 years in exposed conditions. No matter how long it takes, when the liners eventually fail, there will be a large mass of coal ash freshly exposed to groundwater.

In comments to Talen Energy dated April 22, 2019, DEQ requested Talen Energy account for horizontal groundwater flows into coal ash when modeling seepage from the Units 1&2 ponds. Talen Energy’s response, that “…the presence of the liners in the STEP ponds should eliminate saturated advective flow through the ash,” is inadequate. A plastic liner simply will not permanently eliminate groundwater contact with coal ash. When the liners eventually fail, groundwater contact with coal ash will be significant and result in a continual, long-term source of COIs. Talen Energy’s failure to accurately account for horizontal groundwater flows in the modeling means DEQ cannot truly evaluate how capping STEP coal ash in place will impact long-term AOC cleanup goals. We reiterate that horizontal flows into the STEP ponds is underestimated in the RER and this prevents DEQ from evaluating the negative impacts of leaving coal ash in place.

**Long-term leaching of COIs from STEP ash is not accurately characterized.**

Long-term leaching of COIs from STEP coal ash is not accurately characterized in the report. This makes it impossible for DEQ to evaluate how capping these ponds in place will impact cleanup goals. Please see KirK Engineering’s comments for more explanation on this point. To summarize, Talen Energy argues that the major source of COIs that contribute to future plume reemergence are from SOEP coal ash, and therefore that aggressive source controls
are not needed at STEP. However, this does not make sense as it assumes contamination is only coming from SOEP coal ash but not from STEP coal ash. If two sacks of garbage are sitting in a bathtub, pulling only one of them out does not fully fix the problem of there still being garbage in the bathtub. Leaving SOEP coal ash in place in Talen Energy’s models in the RER is a clear attempt to downplay the negative impacts that capping STEP coal ash in place has on long-term cleanup goals.

Northern Plains supports DEQ approving the dewatering of all STEP ponds as a needed first step toward excavation. Along with Cells A and E, dewatering of the Old Clearwell should be included and approved in Part 1 of the report because that cell is currently being filled with coal ash. However, while we support DEQ approving the dewatering in Part 1 of the RER, there should be clear language in the approved RER stating that this approval does not constitute a long-term source control plan for the STEP ponds. Contact between groundwater and coal ash at all Units 1&2 ponds must be addressed in Part 2 of the report and that report must include an alternative that evaluates source removal at all ponds.

The RER lacks a plan for long-term pumping beyond 2070.

The RER should include financial assurance to cover the costs of long-term, likely perpetual, pumping at the Units 1&2 ponds site in order to control the spread of contaminants that in-situ flushing does not remove, including, for instance, through the endowment of a trust fund. Talen Energy’s preferred alternative is not capable of meeting cleanup standards within all AOC boundaries for the Units 1&2 site. The low-flow nature of the aquifer and decades of contaminant leakage make it difficult to remediate the groundwater. We acknowledge that freshwater flushing is an important tool toward removing much of the contamination, but in reviewing groundwater models in the RER it is clear there will be a need for permanent pumping to control the boron plume from rebounding and spreading beyond AOC boundaries after the capture system shuts down.

Talen Energy states several times in the RER that “…it should be noted that monitoring in perpetuity is not required for waste disposal sites.” We ask DEQ for a written response to this claim and to assess its validity. Several references are made in the report to “…small isolated Near-Source areas that do not attain the PCC.” If Talen Energy is not required to monitor the Units 1&2 site in perpetuity and DEQ approves a plan that does not attain cleanup criteria in the AOC boundary, we believe DEQ has formally enabled a violation of Montana water quality law in perpetuity.

DEQ must acknowledge the hard fact that this site will require perpetual pumping and monitoring and that the owners must provide financial assurance to cover those costs. New remediation technologies may be available in the future that can remove the less mobile constituents from the plume and prevent the need for perpetual pumping, but DEQ must not approve a plan that is based on that assumption. Perpetual groundwater pumping is a centerpiece of ongoing cleanups at Butte, Zortman-Landusky, and other industrial mining sites in Montana. The Colstrip power plant owners have had plenty of opportunities to prevent a permanent pollution problem from unfolding if they had only voluntarily switched to dry storage. Choosing
to store the coal ash in ponds has resulted in enormous pressure, forcing contamination deep into the aquifers beneath the ponds for decades. There is no proof that removing those contaminants to background concentrations will ever be possible, and while DEQ must require a plan to maximize water quality, minimize degradation, and meet pollution criteria, DEQ must also prepare for the reality of ongoing water pollution by collecting a bond that will cover the cost of long-term pumping at the site. If prepared properly, the MNA study that Talen Energy is completing in the coming year will be helpful in evaluating if MNA is appropriate for the Units 1&2 site, but with the data that is available today, DEQ must have a plan in place to control the pollution long-term.

Things rarely go as planned in industrial remediation projects. For example, the Butte cleanup plan of Silverbow Creek has undergone major revisions since the project began in 1983. We believe there must be several explicit contingency plans to reflect the uncertainty surrounding the effectiveness of the STEP underdrain in fully draining the ponds and limitations on the Hydrologic Evaluation of Landfill Performance (HELP) model used to justify meeting long-term cleanup goals. The models supporting the preferred alternative are not qualified for predictive purposes as stated by Geosyntec in the RER. DEQ must approach remediation at the Units 1&2 site by bonding for the reasonable worst-case scenario – including, though not limited to, perpetual pumping – or accept that the state will be forced to try to collect funding in the future from companies that may no longer exist. We know, and Talen Energy has admitted, that the massive pump-back well system is the only thing keeping the pollution plume from spreading into nearby Armells Creek. This begs the question: what happens when there is no more bonding to keep the pumps running?

**Impacts of Sulfates on Agriculture**

High sulfate levels in the coal ash ponds must be controlled to safeguard water quality for downstream livestock producers. Average sulfate concentrations in the STEP ponds range from 20,000-50,000 ppm [parts per million], with a maximum value of 155,000 ppm according to the latest Cleanup Criteria and Risk Assessment report. This is more than concerning to livestock producers in the area, as concentrations of sulfates over 3,000 ppm negatively impact conception rates, result in decrease weight gain and polioencephalomalacia or “brain softening,” and lead to death in cattle. In an attached 2009 field study produced by the Fort Keogh Agriculture Research Center in Miles City, 47% of cattle exposed to water with sulfate levels between 2,900 ppm and 4,600 ppm had symptoms of polio, and 33% died. The Units 1&2 ponds are leaking 31,000 gallons each day of water containing 50,000 ppm!

Livestock producers do not just rely on clean water; they exist solely because useable water is available. Northern Plains underscores the need for a plan that permanently controls leakages from the coal ash ponds and prevents migration of sulfates into the aquifer.

There is anecdotal evidence from landowners downstream from the Units 1&2 ponds on Armells Creek that water quality has been in a steady state of decline for 40 years. Ranchers have leveled fields in preparation for flood irrigation but then abandoned using that irrigation.
strategy on those fields because of poor water quality in Arnells Creek and its negative impacts on soil health and crop production, notably from high sulfates. Landowners have also observed steep declines in aquatic life (large fish, turtles, frogs, and other life forms) during the last 40 years in Arnells Creek. It is extremely difficult to prove that declines in both water quality and aquatic life in the watershed are a direct result of Colstrip’s coal ash ponds leaking, but we note both of these observations to make DEQ aware of on-the-ground, long-term observations from residents in the area.

We also note that while sulfates, like boron, is used as an indicator pollutant in Talen Energy’s submission, the list of contaminants ultimately contained in coal ash – lithium, manganese, cobalt, selenium, radium, and more – is long and many of these contaminants pose meaningful threats to water and its uses in southeastern Montana.

Violations of the Federal Coal Combustion Residuals Rule

As written, the RER does not meet key standards contained in the 2015 Coal Combustion Residuals (CCR) Rule, and DEQ must consider this to ensure that the AOC remedy is executed and that water and its uses are protected. Specifically, the CCR rule requires that free liquids be fully drained from ponds prior to capping (40 CFR § 257.60, 2015) and that the base of existing CCR impoundments be 5 feet above the upper limit of the uppermost aquifer (40 CFR § 257.60, 2015). Groundwater elevations at the Units 1&2 site are above the bottom of STEP ponds, and therefore DEQ approval of a cap-in-place remedy would mean that the agency policy does not comply with both of these key federal standards. Anything short of source removal at these ponds provides uncertainty, risk, and delays addressing the problem to the future – likely a time when owners may not exist or, conceivably, agency leadership may seek to undermine the goals of the AOC and state and federal law.

We respect that DEQ staff, more than anyone, want to approve a permanent remedy that meets federal and state standards and do not want this remediation plan to end up in the courts. Northern Plains agrees and urges the DEQ to carefully evaluate how this RER complies with the CCR rule.

Conclusion

The Arnells Creek drainage supports more than 15 agricultural businesses downstream from the Colstrip Units 1&2 coal ash ponds and is an ancestral waterway of the Northern Cheyenne people. When the ponds were proposed and under construction, landowners raised concerns that the reservoir(s) would not hold water and that storing wet coal ash in a scoria hillside would create an enormous and expensive pollution problem. The Colstrip owners dismissed these concerns with testimony from licensed hydrologists, geologists, and engineers who argued that the ponds would be sealed and leakages minimized. State agencies assured our members and others that if the ponds did leak, extreme measures would be taken to correct the problem. Today, the aquifer continues to receive 500,000 gallons of contaminated water each day from the
Colstrip coal ash ponds. The RER is the latest proposal from the company to address the problem and, in our opinion, does not qualify as an “extreme” approach by any means. Indeed, it fails to meet basic protective standards or comply with the AOC.

We are encouraged by and very much appreciate the dedicated work that DEQ has, in recent years, put into the AOC process leading up to this RER, but we believe that there are outstanding issues that the company is refusing to address – issues that MUST be addressed – before DEQ approves this report. These issues include, but are not limited to: Will the aquifer be in contact with coal ash long-term? Has Talen Energy met the AOC requirement to identify and summarize feasible remedial alternatives, as required under Article VI? What happens when the pumps turn off in 2070 and pollution controls are still needed?

DEQ is the responsible state agency that is required to hold the corporate owners of Colstrip accountable for this pollution. These owners have made billions of dollars while operating the power plant through the years even while they have failed to ever propose an effective solution to the leaking coal ash ponds. The AOC assigns clear authority to the DEQ Director under Article XIII, Section D, that, “In the event that the parties are unable to resolve a dispute within this period, the Department’s Director shall issue a final decision.” While Northern Plains hopes that a better plan can be developed that addresses these critical issues, we also realize that DEQ may need to assert this authority in order to protect the permanent health and well-being of the surrounding community members, businesses, and the environment – and we would vigorously defend that decision. The aquifers that are impacted by the Colstrip Units 1&2 ponds support the springs, wells, and creeks that make agricultural livelihoods in this area possible and are irreplaceable. We thank you for the opportunity to comment and are available for further discussion.

Sincerely,

Jeanie Alderson
Chair, Northern Plains Resource Council

Attachments

KirK Engineering and Natural Resources Comments
KirK Engineering and Natural Resources Comment Attachment
2009 Fort Keogh Livestock Water Quality Study
LIVESTOCK WATER QUALITY

STORY IN BRIEF

Water is the most important nutrient for range cattle. It is required for all life processes. A loss of 20 per cent of the body's water will be fatal. Total body water of cattle is 56 to 81 per cent of body weight. Physiologic stage and body composition affects the body's water content. Lactating cows possess the greatest amount of body water (from 62 to 69%). Fat cows contain less water than thin lactating cows and younger animals have higher water content than older animals.

Loss of body water occurs through milk production, fecal excretion, urine excretion, sweat and vapor loss. Water losses through milk production are equal to approximately 33% of the cow's daily consumption. Fecal losses are usually comparable to milk losses and urinary losses are approximately 50% of fecal losses. Fecal water losses are affected by intake, dry matter content of the diet and digestibility. Urinary losses range from 1 to 9 gallons per day. Urinary water excretion is related to water availability, water absorbed, nitrogen and potassium content of urine and dry matter content of the diet.

Water intake - Cattle can meet their water requirement from 3 sources;

- Drinking free water
- Ingestion of water contained in feed
- Water produced by the body's metabolism

It has been estimated that cows;

- require 2.6 to 3.0 lbs of water for every lb of milk produced
- in moist pastures cattle may consume only 40% by drinking
- Salt availability influences consumption
- High salt - protein may stimulate water consumption. For every gram of sodium consumed (28 grams=1 ounce) water intake generally will increase 0.1 lb.

Water is especially important during periods of heat stress.

- Properties for cooling include heat conductivity and vaporization
- As effective temperatures raises from 65 to 86 F consumption increases by 30%
- Losses from urine, sweating & respiration
- No shade during the summer will increase water consumption by 18%

Water quality - Five criteria might be combined to encompass the characteristics of water quality. They are;

1. Odor and taste
2. Chemical properties (pH, dissolved solids, total dissolved oxygen and hardness)
3. Toxic compounds (heavy metals, toxic minerals, organophosphates and hydrocarbons)
4. Presence of excess minerals (nitrates, sodium, sulfates and iron)
5. Presence of living organisms (bacteria)

Salinity — total dissolved solids (TDS) expressed as mg/liter or parts per million (ppm). This is a measure of total dissolved salts;

- sodium chloride, carbonates, nitrates, sulfates, calcium, magnesium and potassium.

The primary symptom of high salinity water is diarrhea. If the TDS is high, cattle will be reluctant to drink then, drink a large amount at once. This can cause the animal to become very sick and potentially die. Guidelines are;

- Greater than 1000 ppm. May cause some diarrhea. May reduce availability of other minerals. May reduce performance.
- 5000 to 7000 ppm. Poor water. Performance and health slumps especially when temperatures are high. Test for sulfates. Use with low value stock
- 7000 plus ppm. Unsuitable. Performance and health effects expected. Limit use with lactating and pregnant stock. Sulfates mostly likely high

Sulfates — commonly high in ground water in South Dakota and Montana. Adult cattle seem to be more resistant to the effects of sulfates than calves. Sulfates can cause secondary deficiencies of;

- copper, zinc, iron and manganese.

The form of the sulfates can vary. All forms are a laxative.

- They will drink less, have diarrhea at a lower sulfate concentration with sodium.
- 2,000+ppm diarrhea may start but cattle will adapt.
- Most common forms are sodium sulfate and magnesium sulfates.
- Iron sulfate may cause the most severe rejection of drinking water. Guidelines for interpretation of sulfate results;

Less than 1000 ppm. Safe.

- 500 to 1500 ppm. Generally safe. Trace mineral availability may be reduced. Decreased performance of confined cattle.
- 1500 to 3000 ppm. Marginal. Poor for confined cattle during hot weather. Sporadic cases of polio may be seen in confined cattle. Performance maybe reduced.
- 3000 to 4000 ppm. Poor water. Sporadic cases of polio are probable, especially in confined cattle. Performance of grazing cattle maybe affected.

Results of studies evaluating water quality on cattle performance - Two South Dakota studies were conducted with yearling cattle in pens fed a roughage diet. Three groups of cattle received different quality of water:

1. Good – 400ppm sulfate/1000ppm TDS
2. Poor – 3100ppm sulfates/4800ppm TDS
3. Poorer - 3900ppm/6200ppm TDS

Steer average daily gain declined from 1.4 lb to 1 lb per day.

The steers drinking the 3100 and 3900ppm sulfate water had;

- reduced water intake, dry matter intake feed efficiency
- 15% of the cattle on the high sulfate water exhibited polio.
- daily sulfur content of diet was 0.27, 0.74 and 0.93%. Requirement is near 0.2%.

In another set of studies steers had access to four sources of water with either;

1. 4.0400ppm sulfates/1000ppm TDS
2. 1.7000ppm sulfates/3000ppm TDS
3. 2900ppm sulfates/5000ppm TDS
4. 4600ppm sulfates/7000 TDS

Steer gains were 1.8, 1.6, 1.5 and 0.6 lbs per day for each sulfate treatment (400, 1700, 2900 and 4600 ppm).

47% of steers on the two highest sulfates levels had symptoms of polio and 33% died.

Summary

Water quality especially sulfates can affect animal gain and health. If animal performance is disappointing a water analysis may be indicated. Start with a TDS analysis. If the concentration is over 3000ppm TDS, then further analysis of sulfates should follow. Research shows that cattle prefer to drink out of troughs rather than the dirt tanks. Knowledge and management of stock water quality can be an important part of an effective ranch plan.
Comments on the
Revised Remedy Evaluation Report -
Part One Units 1 & 2 Stage I and II Evaporation Ponds

December 4, 2019

This report provides technical comments on the revised Part 1 Remedy Evaluation Report (RER) (Geosyntec Oct. 2019). KirK Engineering & Natural Resources, Inc. prepared these comments as an advisor to Northern Plains Resource Council. The goal of our review is to provide a thorough evaluation of the technical accuracy of the revised RER and if needed provide recommendations for changes or additional analysis.

The RER is required by the Administrative Order on Consent (AOC) between PPL Montana and the Montana Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ), a legal settlement requiring Talen to address environmental impacts from the coal ash ponds and other wastes at the Colstrip Plant (DEQ and PPL Montana, 2012). The AOC is an enforcement action taken by DEQ under the Montana Water Quality Act and the Major Facility Siting Act to address groundwater contamination at the Colstrip Plant. The AOC requires Talen to prepare Site Characterization Reports, Remedy Evaluation Reports, and Facility Closure Plans. Talen’s plans for groundwater remedy are contained in the Remedy Evaluation Reports. DEQ approval of the RER constitutes DEQ’s approval for Talen’s proposed groundwater cleanup plan. The focus of our review and comments in this report is the revised RER Part 1, for Units 1&2 Stage I and II Evaporation Ponds, otherwise known as the SOEP and STEP. Part 1 addresses all components of the remedy for this area with the exception of source control for coal ash, otherwise known as coal combustion residuals (CCR), at the Stage One Evaporation Pond.

Detailed comments are provided below. The deficiencies we consider most significant are summarized here:

Talen proposes a ‘wait and see’ approach to leaving CCR in place at the STEP where a single-layer HDPE plastic liner separates the ash from groundwater. Talen provides credible evidence (scientific literature) in the RER that the liners will eventually fail. Talen is also explicitly stating they won’t be undertaking the ‘see’ part of wait and see because they don’t believe perpetual monitoring should be required. Any remedy that will fail at some point in the future with no plan for monitoring and contingency kicks the can down the road so that the public would have to assume responsibility for the contamination when liner failure eventually occurs. This is unacceptable. The Montana Water Quality Act does not allow a groundwater remedy which is temporary and guaranteed to be insufficient long-term. Talen either needs to plan for perpetual maintenance of CCR left below the groundwater elevation or needs to provide a remedy which separates CCR from groundwater.
The table of comments for the detailed comments follows.

Contents

Comments .................................................................................................................................................. 3

1. General comments ................................................................................................................................ 3

1-1. The groundwater modeling needs to include removal or control of the SOEP contamination for us to evaluate the remedy performance of the alternatives presented. .................................................. 3

1-2. Talen should have a plan for perpetual monitoring and maintenance of the STEP if CCR is left in place below the groundwater elevation. ........................................................................................................... 4

1-3. Data and modeling used to evaluate contaminants which are trapped in the unsaturated zone need to be described in the RER. ............................................................................................................. 4

1-4. Talen should evaluate whether removal of STEP D cell will lead to further increase in the elevation of groundwater under the STEP. .......................................................................................................... 4

1-5. Talen should use the STEP Clearwell and D Cell for contaminated water management and plan for water treatment capacity sooner. ........................................................................................................... 5

1-6. The SOEP source concentration needs to be accurately modeled. ...................................................... 5

1-7. The pond seepage calculations are in error. ............................................................................................. 6

1-8. Model calibration needs to include the boron retardation factor. ........................................................ 6

1-9. Groundwater elevation at the STEP should be compared to the CCR elevation at the STEP. ........................................................................................................................................ 7

1-10. Talen should include the STEP Old Clearwell in plans for dewatering and source control. .......... 7

1-11. Talen’s ISS evaluation needs to consider that groundwater may be further backed up with ISS treatment. .................................................................................................................................................. 7

1-12. Talen’s contaminant mass flux calculation from the SOEP is in error. ............................................... 7

1-13. STEP underdrain performance needs to be described in the RER. ...................................................... 8

1-14. The RER should indicate if MNA will be required outside of the Plant Property boundary. .......... 8

1-15. All contaminants of potential concern and constituents of interest should continue to be monitored during active remediation. ............................................................................................................. 8

2. Specific comments ................................................................................................................................ 8

References .................................................................................................................................................... 10
Comments

1. General comments

1-1. The groundwater modeling needs to include removal or control of the SOEP contamination for us to evaluate the remedy performance of the alternatives presented.

The predictions about remedy performance in the part 1 RER are evaluated and visualized in the figures assuming the SOEP will remain capped in place with CCR remaining in contact with groundwater below the water table. The predictions thereby show a large area of perpetually contaminated groundwater both on Talen property and downstream on private land along East Fork Armells Creek. It’s impossible to evaluate remedy performance of the five alternatives because the predicted outcomes are all clouded by the SOEP being a perpetual source of contamination.

The Montana Water Quality Act does not allow the SOEP CCR to be left as a perpetual contaminant source and we know the part 2 remedy will require source controls at the SOEP. The modeling should be run assuming the SOEP source is controlled by eliminating contact between CCR and groundwater. Conceptually this could be done by eliminating the modeled recharge boundary conditions associated with leaving the SOEP in contact with groundwater and running two difference scenarios, one where the SOEP CCR seepage is entirely eliminated and one where only vertical seepage through a type IV cover occurs. This would allow us to compare the actual remedy performance of the part 1 remedy (flush, capture, and dewatering) with two SOEP source control scenarios, one where the CCR is excavated/removed, and the second where hydraulic controls dewater the SOEP CCR which is capped in place with a type IV cover.

Additionally, Geosyntec’s statement that contaminant plume reemergence is primarily from the SOEP needs to be evaluated with modeling. This can be done at the same time source control of the SOEP is modeled. When this is done, accurate seepage from the STEP due to perpetual CCR saturation at the A, E, and Old Clearwell cells need to be included in the modeling, as discussed in comment 1-7.

The limitations of the RER in its current form is clear in section 7.5.2.1 which evaluates performance of the preferred alternative. This section evaluates performance of Alternative 5 but for some reason does not discuss the contamination that is shown in the current model results as being transported into the Distal Area Outside Plant Property (i.e. private properties and the East Fork Armells Creek) and remaining above the cleanup criteria long after active remediation measures are complete. Section 7.5.2.1 states “The model simulations for Alternative 5 (Figures 6-45 through 6-54 of Appendix D-6) provide a visualization of the performance of Alternative 5 with respect to boron and sulfate… from the beginning of 2019 to 2150.” But they do not. Figure 6.45 to 6.49 now stop at 2050, prior to the plume rebounding and migrating off the property. The animation now includes a note “By 2050, except for a few small areas, the PCC are achieved at the POC. Following cessation of pumping, the only remaining source loading is at SOEP.” The model was not used to prove this. This statement also appears to not account for contaminant mass trapped in the unsaturated zone and continued leakage from the groundwater saturated STEP A, E, and Old Clearwell as discussed in comment 1-7. Figures 6.50 to 6.54 have the same deficiency in prediction of sulfate remedy performance. This section should evaluate an actual remedy proposal. As currently written, it doesn’t show us the performance of any actual proposed alternative.
1-2. Talen should have a plan for perpetual monitoring and maintenance of the STEP if CCR is left in place below the groundwater elevation.

Synthetic liners such as those used at the STEP ponds will eventually break down; this is why current Federal CCR regulatory criteria requires a 5-foot separation from groundwater. It is difficult to predict with accuracy the current condition of the STEP HDPE liners or the tensile stresses caused by CCR settling against the liner subgrade, both of which may cause liner deterioration. What is clear is that scientific literature shows that HDPE liners will eventually deteriorate.

Talen argues that the HDPE liners eliminate advective flow through ash. This may be true while the liners are relatively intact, but it ignores two serious issues:

1) The lined cells will likely continue to leak forever because the cells will never drain completely due to elevated groundwater (see comment 1-7).

2) When the liners eventually fail there will be a large mass of CCR freshly exposed to leaching with groundwater.

Talen either needs to plan for perpetual maintenance of CCR left below the water table/potentiometric surface or needs to provide a remedy which separates CCR from groundwater.

1-3. Data and modeling used to evaluate contaminants which are trapped in the unsaturated zone need to be described in the RER.

The RER alludes to contaminants which are trapped in the unsaturated zone and which remobilize after capture system shut off and contribute to contaminant plume reemergence.

For instance: “In addition, some re-saturation of previously desaturated zones with residual pore water and sorbed mass would occur after the capture system is shut down and contribute to the re-emergence of the plume. Plume re-emergence is primarily due to the re-saturation of ash in the SOEP and is not addressed in Part 1 of this report.” RER Pp x

However, no information is given in the modeling reports as to how the unsaturated zone was modeled. The RER also states that data on the unsaturated zone contaminants was not available for the modeling and remedy performance predictions.

“Although soils beneath the ponds generally have not been assessed, it is possible that there are salts of inorganic solutes, dissolved solutes in residual pore water, sorbed mass in the unsaturated zones beneath the ponds, and remobilization of those materials due to rebounding water tables after the capture system is shut off could be a mechanism for plume re-emergence.” RER Pp xii

Contaminants trapped in the unsaturated zone are critical to understand in evaluating whether the remedy will achieve cleanup criteria. The data and modeling methods used to evaluate this need to be provided. The description should be clear how Geosyntec differentiates between SOEP CCR becoming resaturated and secondary contamination (contaminant salts and other contaminants temporarily attenuated) in the unsaturated zone.

1-4. Talen should evaluate whether removal of STEP D cell will lead to further increase in the elevation of groundwater under the STEP.

The RER states the STEP D Cell will be decommissioned and removed in 2023. No details are provided as to stormwater runoff controls or water management in the pit left with D Cell removal. The groundwater table is already too high beneath the adjacent CCR containing impoundments (A, E, and Old Clearwell cells), which will lead to perpetual saturation of CCR contained in those cells.
Accumulation of precipitation in D Cell will further recharge the groundwater in the area and raise the water table behind the STEP main dam, further exacerbating this problem.

1-5. Talen should use the STEP Clearwell and D Cell for contaminated water management and plan for water treatment capacity sooner.

Talen plans to decommission both the STEP Clearwell and D Cell and move contaminated water storage to the new Captured Groundwater Storage Pond at the Plant Site, to be completed in 2019. The Clearwell and D Cell are the only double-lined impoundments with leachate collection at the STEP and decommissioning them years before adequate storage is available for all groundwater cleanup required by the AOC doesn’t make any sense.

The new storage pond should also be targeted for receiving flow from the Unit 3&4 EHP underdrain, which Talen currently does not plan to pump until 2021 due to lack of storage (Geosyntec, 2019b). Unit 1&2 captured groundwater should be management in these existing double-lined cells at STEP as possible. To further reduce water inventory, Talen should be planning for rapid installation of expanded forced evaporation or other water treatment techniques such as Solar Multiple technology described in KirK Engineering (2018).

Until the new treatment system is up and running, Talen should use the current Unit 1&2 VSEP system for STEP dewatering or treatment of flows from the EHP underdrain. If there is an ownership issue between Unit 1&2 and Unit 3&4 water treatment equipment, then the owners of 3&4 should be required to purchase the VSEP system for treatment of EHP underdrain flow.

1-6. The SOEP source concentration needs to be accurately modeled.

The RER states “The results [of the source evaluation of saturated ash at the SOEP] will be used to update the fate and transport modeling if the source strength is less than that assumed in the model” (page xv and 127). Talen needs to accurately model the source concentrations at the SOEP and STEP regardless of whether they are less or more than their current assumptions. Instead of adjusting the source concentration during model calibration, sampled water quality and leach testing results need to be used as the source concentration.

The modeled source concentrations are already based on questionable data. Section 5.2.2 of NewFields (2019) discusses that during model calibration source area concentrations were adjusted even lower than Hydrometrics’ (2016) sampled data. We reviewed calibrated source area concentrations and found that Table 8-1 shows the calibrated model assumes an extremely variable source concentration from single CCR impoundments. For instance, the modeled SOEP boron concentrations vary from 6 to 50 mg/L, A Cell from 18 to 100 mg/L, and E Cell from 4 to 65 mg/L. This assumption that seepage concentrations vary by over a magnitude within a single cell are suspect and shows the need for additional focus on sampling and characterizing source area concentrations. It also shows the need for evaluating the uncertainty of other model parameters which may need further calibration instead of source area concentration. For instance, the calibration may have been possible by increasing groundwater flow in the model, such as by increasing the hydraulic conductivity, seepage rate, or adjusting the boron retardation factor within reasonable values.

In addition to the leach testing which Talen is performing, CCR pore water must be adequately characterized in the ponds. Pore water should be sampled for at discrete depths including near the pond bottom to characterize how chemistry changes with depth. Sampling must include the closed ponds (SOEP and A Cell) to characterize the seepage from ponds which are not actively receiving
water from other sources. Sample size must be statistically supportable and not rely on a small number of samples. This is extremely important data for the model which should be supported with good data quality.

We agree with DEQ’s 22 April General Comment 4 which states, “this [NewFields reduction of model concentration loading rates during calibration] may underestimate the mass of COIs actually leaching from the ponds and could significantly underestimate the predicted remediation timeframe.” We believe this shows that model flow parameters or boron retardation factor should be adjusted during calibration (see comment 1-8).

1-7. The pond seepage calculations are in error.
The HELP model that Geosyntec uses is intended to be used for lined municipal landfills which are above the water table, not unlined CCR ponds sitting in groundwater. Appendix J-1 through J-3 uses EPA’s HELP model to estimate current and future seepage from the SOEP and STEP ponds. The HELP simulations assume that the SOEP and STEP are free draining ponds (i.e. are not in contact with groundwater) and that flow is entirely vertical through the landfill. Both of these assumptions are incorrect because the SOEP is currently saturated with groundwater and the STEP pond bottoms are in contact with groundwater.

Although HELP has a groundwater component it is not intended to be a dynamic head-dependent part of a model simulation. Rather subsurface inflow (groundwater source) in HELP is a simple fixed parameter to be used if it is known that groundwater infiltrates a landfill at a specific rate. The HELP User Guide for Version 3, EPA (1994) states “If subsurface inflow is specified for the bottom layer, the program will assume no leakage through the bottom of the landfill.” This specifically shows that HELP is not intended to model seepage when the bottom of the landfill is in contact with groundwater.

Under the actual field conditions, it is likely that seepage from the STEP cells would be lower than if the ponds were free draining because the vertical gradient is lower and seepage may last much longer because the ponds will take longer to drain or may never completely drain. The length of time that the ponds leak has major implications for how long active groundwater capture and remediation should last and perpetual maintenance needs.

Seepage from STEP A, E, and Old Clearwell Cells should be modeled in a head dependent manner with a platform that allows for modeling of unsaturated/saturated flow through a waste repository in contact with groundwater.

1-8. Model calibration needs to include the boron retardation factor.
Section 8.4 of NewFields (2019) modeling report states “Empirical data presented in Appendix D show retardation factors in the Stage I and II areas that range from 4.1 to 1.96, with an average retardation factor of 3. Because the range of retardation factors was based on limited data from three wells...”. Retardation factor is the critical modeling parameter controlling boron and other less mobile contaminant transport and predictions of remedy performance. This factor is the most poorly supported data used in the model. A static retardation factor is used to model the very complex hydrogeology in this setting which does not make conceptual sense.

Retardation is a parameter that needs to be calibrated. NewFields has currently calibrated the model by only adjusting the seepage source concentration. Seepage concentration should be fairly well constrained by the sampling and leach testing discussed in comment 1-6.
1-9. **Groundwater elevation at the STEP should be compared to the CCR elevation at the STEP.**

Newfields figure 6-57 shows the depth of saturated CCR at the SOEP. A similar figure should be prepared for the STEP which compares the elevation of the potentiometric surface to the elevation of the bottom of the STEP. This is needed to evaluate the volume of CCR in the STEP which may stay permanently saturated and to evaluate groundwater contact when the STEP liners eventually fail.

1-10. **Talen should include the STEP Old Clearwell in plans for dewatering and source control.**

Talen’s current preferred alternative includes only dewatering STEP A and E cells. Our analysis shows that water elevation in well 923A which is adjacent to the Old Clearwell is 12-14 feet above the Old Clearwell bottom elevation, shown in drawings in Geosyntec (2016). This water elevation comparison is shown in Table 2.1-3 of Kirk Engineering (2018) which is attached. The Old Clearwell is currently being filled with CCR and should be treated the same as A and E cells. These CCR impoundments should be actively dewatered and the remedy should plan for providing source control in perpetuity.

1-11. **Talen’s ISS evaluation needs to consider that groundwater may be further backed up with ISS treatment.**

Talen plans to evaluate in-situ solidification and stabilization for the SOEP. Treatment of the CCR in the SOEP will likely further slow groundwater flow through the area and back up groundwater higher. The ISS plan should include fully encapsulating the CCR and not simply treating the CCR that is saturated today. Complete encapsulation can sometimes be accomplished by treating the pond perimeter with ISS, creating a bathtub. However, the 3-D shape of the SOEP will make this difficult to accomplish and ISS treatment plans are needed to account for this.

1-12. **Talen’s contaminant mass flux calculation from the SOEP is in error.**

Talen provides a mass flux in their response to DEQ’s 22 April 2019 General Comment 8 to show that the saturated CCR in the SOEP is a relatively small source of contamination. Their calculations neglect that groundwater is flowing at higher rates in the alluvium which is located at the bottom of the SOEP. The flow along the base of the CCR will leach contaminants from the ash.

As an estimate we calculate the groundwater discharge in the alluvium using the same methods as Talen but with the following data:

- Alluvium $K = 7.2$ ft/d (page 9 of NewFields, 2016 Appendix A to the Units 1&2 Site Report)
- Alluvium width = 800 ft (figure 2-2 of NewFields, 2016)
- Alluvium thickness = 15 ft (figure 2-4 of NewFields, 2016)
- Hydraulic gradient = 0.0071 (assumed equal to Talen’s value for SOEP transect B-B)

Given these values, the Darcy flux through the alluvium is 3.2 gpm or 68 times the flux Talen calculates through the ash itself.

This is a textbook preferential flowpath and one which likely greatly factors into leaching of CCR from the SOEP. This preferential flowpath for CCR leaching will not be removed by simply capping the SOEP.
Talen should use zonebudget in MODFLOW for the SOEP alluvium to arrive at a better estimate of the flow through the alluvium and include this in any their analysis of source control requirements for the SOEP.

**1-13. STEP underdrain performance needs to be described in the RER.**

The section from the January 2019 version of the RER (Geosyntec 2019a) “Water was not present in the underdrain collection systems for STEP B Cell in 2017, and a minimal amount of water was pumped from the underdrain collection systems for STEP D Cell, indicating that the upper (primary) liners for both cells are intact (Hydrometrics, 2017)” was removed from the RER. Underdrain performance data needs to be described in the RER and whether it indicates there is a problem with the liners in those cells.

**1-14. The RER should indicate if MNA will be required outside of the Plant Property boundary.**

The RER pp xiii states “As such, Alternative 5 includes MNA and institutional controls to address the small isolated Near-Source areas that do not attain the PCC, and the Distal Areas within the Plant Property boundary where the boron plume reemerges after the injection/capture system is shut down.” (underline added). The modeling provided in the RER clearly shows distal areas including private property outside the Plant Property will be impacted by perpetual boron contamination. This statement needs to be updated to reflect this fact unless the remedy and modeling has been updated to eliminate the boron contaminant plume from areas outside of the Plant Property.

**1-15. All contaminants of potential concern and constituents of interest should continue to be monitored during active remediation.**

Talen will likely seek to use flushing, capture, and treatment for the groundwater remedy. Although current data supports that radium, cobalt, lithium, and manganese appear are attenuating close to the CCR cells, this may change with flushing and associated changes in chemical conditions and groundwater flow. All of the contaminants of potential concern and constituents of interest should continue to be monitored for the duration of the active remedial measures.

2. **Specific comments**

2-1. Page ix of the part 1 RER states, “This Revised Remedy Evaluation Report – Part 1 incorporates the following: New data collected under the Federal Coal Combustion Residuals (CCR) Rule” but the list omits radium. DEQ indicated in their conditional approval letter of the CCRA Report (Canty December 2018) “Please add text that specifies radium will be sampled under the AOC in addition to CCR Rule requirements, and that radium will be retained as a COPC until an appropriate number of samples (including background samples) have been analyzed.”

2-2. Section 2.6.5 states: “The Revised CCRA Report did not identify radium as a groundwater COI/COPC because radium concentrations in groundwater at the SOEP/STEP area are not due to a release from the cells.” This should be updated to reflect that radium is a COPC which is still being monitored and evaluated.

2-3. Section 6.6 states: “It is estimated that the ash in those two cells would be substantially dewatered by 2050 after which it is assumed that little or no water would drain to the dewatering pipes (discussed in Appendix J-3).” The groundwater data is clear that the ash in these cells is below the groundwater elevation unless groundwater hydraulic controls are included in the remedy. This
statement should be updated to discuss if the leaky HDPE liner will allow groundwater to keep the CCR saturated in perpetuity.

2-4. Section 7.5.1 states: “The STEP cells do not contribute to this plume in Alternative 5 because of the dewatering of STEP A Cell and E Cell.” This is not accurate; the model is based on flawed HELP seepage modeling. In reality, without continued dewatering the STEP cells will continue to leak because they are not able to be permanently dewatered because groundwater will leak through the liner into A, E, and Old Clearwell. This statement should be updated to reflect this unless groundwater hydraulic controls are included in the remedy.

2-5. Section 7.5.1.3 states: “The seepage rate from the STEP cells combined would be reduced from ~14 gpm in 2020 to ~1 gpm in 2050. Therefore, STEP cells are not a long-term source and do not contribute to plume re-emergence.” The seepage calculations are incorrect due to a misapplication of the HELP model. This statement should be updated to reflect results of head dependent seepage modeling for the STEP cells.

2-6. Newfields figure 6-57 shows the depth of saturated CCR at the SOEP is 5 ft greater in alternatives 4 & 5 vs 2 & 3 (30 vs 35 ft contour at deepest part of SOEP). Figure 6-58 shows the saturated volume being the same in all of these alternatives. This needs to be reconciled. If the depth of saturation is thicker than the volume is greater.
References


### SOEP-STEP Site

**Table 2.1-3 Pond groundwater level worksheet**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Well 1</th>
<th>Well 2</th>
<th>Well 3</th>
<th>Well 4</th>
<th>Water level (earliest available measurement)</th>
<th>Water level (May 2017)</th>
<th>Saturated CCR thickness (earliest available measurement)</th>
<th>Saturated CCR thickness (May 2017)</th>
<th>Cell bottom separation from groundwater (earliest available measurement)</th>
<th>Cell bottom separation from groundwater (May 2017)</th>
<th>Date nearest capture well began</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6/21/01</td>
<td>840P</td>
<td>641P</td>
<td>641P</td>
<td>641P</td>
<td>6/21/01 3231.46</td>
<td>6/21/01 3232.02</td>
<td>6/21/01 3231.48</td>
<td>5/9/11 3233.02</td>
<td>6/21/01 3233.02</td>
<td>5/9/11 3233.02</td>
<td>6/21/01 3233.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/9/01</td>
<td>5/14/01</td>
<td>5/14/01</td>
<td>5/14/01</td>
<td>5/14/01</td>
<td>7/9/01 3272.25</td>
<td>7/9/01 3272.25</td>
<td>7/9/01 3272.25</td>
<td>6/23/00 3239.30</td>
<td>7/9/01 3272.25</td>
<td>6/23/00 3239.30</td>
<td>7/9/01 3272.25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### SOEP-STEP Site

**Notes:**
- Yellow indicates impermeable (i.e., from uppermost aquifer or capping). Pond levels saturated from drawdown on History of Construction Report Per Requirements of 40 CFR §307.73, Appendix C-3 (Geosyntec 2016)
- Water levels earliest available measurement from well log, Unit I & E Evaporation Pond Site Report (Hydrometrics, 2018), Stage I & E Evaporation Ponds Area Groundwater Conceptual Model and Expanded Numerical Model Appendix C (Newfields 2016), or NMAG GWIC.
- Converted to deep aquifer (new measurement)
### Table 2.1-3 Pond groundwater level worksheet

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Plant Site</th>
<th>Well</th>
<th>Units 1&amp;2 A Pond</th>
<th>Units 1&amp;2 B Pond</th>
<th>Units 1&amp;2 Bottom Ash Pond</th>
<th>Units 3&amp;4</th>
<th>Units 3&amp;4 Bottom Ash Pond</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A3-S</td>
<td>AB-33</td>
<td>AB2-35</td>
<td>AB200M</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Units 1&amp;2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>9/5/96</td>
<td>3239.61</td>
<td>9/5/96</td>
<td>3254.61</td>
<td>10/1/96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B Pond</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
<td>3231.0</td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
<td>3243.8</td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Units 1&amp;2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>9/5/96</td>
<td>3239.61</td>
<td>9/5/96</td>
<td>3254.61</td>
<td>10/1/96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B Pond</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
<td>3231.0</td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
<td>3243.8</td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Units 1&amp;2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>9/5/96</td>
<td>3239.61</td>
<td>9/5/96</td>
<td>3254.61</td>
<td>10/1/96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B Pond</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
<td>3231.0</td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
<td>3243.8</td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Units 1&amp;2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>9/5/96</td>
<td>3239.61</td>
<td>9/5/96</td>
<td>3254.61</td>
<td>10/1/96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B Pond</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
<td>3231.0</td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
<td>3243.8</td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Units 1&amp;2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>9/5/96</td>
<td>3239.61</td>
<td>9/5/96</td>
<td>3254.61</td>
<td>10/1/96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B Pond</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
<td>3231.0</td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
<td>3243.8</td>
<td>5/1/14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note 1:** B Pond underdrain is currently preventing CCR saturation with groundwater, value is height of water table above pond bottom.

**Pond bottom elevation from drawings in History of Construction Report Per Requirements of 40 CFR §257.73, Appendix C.2 (Geosyntec, 2016)**

**Water levels earliest available measurement from well logs obtained from MBMG GWIC or from Plant Site Groundwater Conceptual Model and Numerical Model Update Appendix E (Newfields, 2015)**

**Water levels April 2014 from Plant Site Characterization Report Figure 3-15.**

**Water levels May 2017 from Evaluation of 2017 Hydrologic Monitoring Data from Colstrip Units 1 through 4 Process Pond system, Appendix A (Hydrometrics, 2018).**

---

**Date nearest capture well began:**

- **SRP-B:** 10/7/97
- **SRP-B:** 10/7/97
- **B Pond underdrain:** 2004
- **B Pond underdrain:** 2004
- **B Pond underdrain:** 2004
- **51SP capture system:** 6/14/02
- **51SP capture system:** 6/14/02
- **51SP capture system:** 6/14/02

**Note 1:** NA capture system

---

**Saturated CCR thickness (earliest available measurement):**

- **9/5/96:** 0
- **9/5/96:** 0.81
- **9/5/96:** 14.02
- **10/1/96:** 14.02
- **9/5/96:** 0
- **8/1/83:** 0
- **9/8/93:** 0

**Cell bottom separation from groundwater (earliest available measurement):**

- **9/5/96:** 0
- **9/5/96:** 4.3
- **10/1/96:** 0
- **9/5/96:** 10.39
- **8/1/83:** 26.91
- **9/8/93:** 52.19

**Saturated CCR thickness (May 2014):**

- **5/1/14:** 0.9
- **5/1/14:** 0
- **5/1/14:** 3.4
- **5/1/14:** 14.6
- **5/1/14:** 0
- **5/1/14:** 0
- **5/1/14:** 0

**Cell bottom separation from groundwater (May 2014):**

- **5/1/14:** 0
- **5/1/14:** 8.6
- **5/1/14:** 0
- **5/1/14:** 0
- **5/1/14:** 20.2
- **5/1/14:** 20.8
- **5/1/14:** 27.3

---

**Water levels (May 2014):**

- **5/1/14:** 3241.9
- **5/1/14:** 3231.4
- **5/1/14:** 3243.8
- **5/1/14:** 3248.7
- **5/1/14:** 3264.8
- **5/1/14:** 3264.4
- **5/1/14:** 3257.7

**Water levels (Apr 2017):**

- **4/6/17:** 3266.52
- **4/6/17:** 3266.15
- **4/6/17:** 3259.49
- **4/6/17:** 3266.52
- **4/6/17:** 3266.15
- **4/6/17:** 3259.49

**Water levels (earliest available measurement):**

- **9/5/96:** 3239.62
- **9/5/96:** 3235.7
- **10/1/96:** 3254.02
- **9/5/96:** 3246.35
- **8/1/83:** 3232.81
- **8/1/83:** 3258.09
- **9/8/93:** 3244.35

**Water level (May 2017):**

- **5/1/14:** 3241.9
- **5/1/14:** 3231.4
- **5/1/14:** 3243.8
- **5/1/14:** 3248.7
- **5/1/14:** 3264.8
- **5/1/14:** 3264.4
- **5/1/14:** 3257.7

**Cell bottom separation from groundwater:**

- **9/5/96:** 0.38
- **9/5/96:** 4.3
- **10/1/96:** 0
- **9/5/96:** 10.39
- **8/1/83:** 26.91
- **9/8/93:** 52.19

---

**Saturated CCR thickness (earliest available measurement):**

- **9/5/96:** 0
- **9/5/96:** 0
- **10/1/96:** 14.02
- **9/5/96:** 16.35
- **9/5/96:** 0
- **9/5/96:** 0
- **9/5/96:** 0

**Cell bottom separation from groundwater (earliest available measurement):**

- **9/5/96:** 0
- **9/5/96:** 4.3
- **10/1/96:** 0
- **9/5/96:** 10.39
- **8/1/83:** 26.91
- **9/8/93:** 52.19

---

**Note:** Yellow indicates impoundment < 5 ft from uppermost aquifer or tailings are saturated.
Susan Vogt  
269 Bias Dr., B  
Fairbanks, AK 99712

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Susan Vogt
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Georgia Braithwaite
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

kathy grieves
Bob Leppo  
310 Cuyama Ave  
Pismo Beach, CA 93449-1806

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Bob Leppo
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Carol Gold
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Deborah St Julien
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Frances Goff
Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

jim hite
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

JL Angell
Karen Kirschling  
633 Oak  
SF, CA 94117

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen’s property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Karen Kirschling
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Laura Keating
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

As a retired professional environmental engineer, and a former EPA Region 9 Superfund manager, I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Mary Masters
Stanford, CA

Mary Masters
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Nicolette Froehlich
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Rosemary Graham-Gardner
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Rosemary Graham-Gardner
Steve Sugarman  
PO BOX 923  
Malibu, CA 90265

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Steve Sugarman
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Therese Ryan
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

One of Montana's greatest resources (and tourist attractions) is its water. That resource contributes significantly to the state's economy. Unfortunately that resource can be damaged, as could its contribution to the state's economy. Pollution from coal ash has the potential to do long-term significant damage to the state's water resources.

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Dr. David Inouye
Kathy Tolman  
4735 Reed St.  
Wheat Ridge, CO 80033

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division 
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Kathy Tolman
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Colonel Meyer
I'm writing to strongly urge the DEQ to approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

David Leithauser
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Garratt
Gregory Esteve  
3655 North Scenic Highway  
Lake Wales, FL 33898  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality  

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Gregory Esteve
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Patricia Wynn
Susie Cassens  
PO Box 593  
Fort Pierce, FL 34954

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Susie Cassens
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Barbara Doucet
Mark Koritz  
12104 Ashford Gables Drive  
Alanta, GA 30338  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality  

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.  

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:  

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.  

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table  

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.  

Sincerely,  

Mark Koritz
Matthew Tarpley  
P.O. Box 818  
McDonough, GA 30253

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Matthew Tarpley
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

carolyn massey
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jeff Green
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Susan Rumburg
Dear Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality:

I demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Mark Grassman
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Bonnie Murphy
The document is a letter from Jody Gibson to Shaun McGrath, Director of the Montana Department of Environmental Quality. The letter requests approval of a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. The letter emphasizes the importance of not taking a "wait and see" approach to the cleanup, as it must be done right the first time to prevent agricultural producers in the region from bearing the costs of poor water quality in the future.

The letter outlines the following points:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jody Gibson
Agnieszka Beletsky  
26 Academy Street  
EAST NEW MARKET, MD 21631

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Agnieszka Beletsky
Douglas Sedon  
2815 Fry Road  
Jefferson, MD 21755  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

I may not live in Montana, but the last time I checked, it is on the same planet I live on.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Douglas Sedon

Douglas Sedon
Douglas Sedon  
2815 Fry Rd  
Jefferson, MD 21755-7424  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality  

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.  

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:  

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.  

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen’s property that is above the water table  

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.  

Sincerely,  

Douglas Sedon
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Meya Law
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Michele Shipp
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Brenda Troup
Judith Glixon  
2 Aerial St.  
Lexington, MA 2421

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Thank you!

Sincerely,

Judith Glixon
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

We have scientific data and long standing evidence of the damage that will be caused by allowing such an action to occur. One of the key roles of government is to preserve public safety. Willfully ignoring clear evidence of an impending catastrophe is a dereliction of duty. Scientists have worked for decades to assemble an incontrovertible body of evidence related to our changing climate, and ignoring that information is insidious. Future generations' resources, health and prosperity is dependent on us acting immediately, significantly and broadly.

Sincerely,

Matthew Genaze
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Peter Kahigian
Diana Cumming  
3210 Cleveland St NE  
Minneapolis, MN 55418

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Removing coal ash and building a landfill to store it would create hundreds of jobs in the Colstrip area that could be sustained for decades. Responsible cleanup would also prevent another Superfund story from playing out in Montana.

Please require a "high and dry" cleanup strategy solution that moves all coal ash to a lined landfill above the water table.

Sincerely,

Diana Cumming
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Mark Fraser
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Alan Hilden
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Alex Cunha
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Amanda Niles
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Ann Baker
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Anne Banks
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,
Anthony Sammartano

Anthony Sammartano
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Ariel Hawthorne

Ariel Hawthorne
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear. Save Eastern Montana from becoming another Superfund site. Coal is dying and we need to clean this up!

sincerely,

Barbara Aas

Barbara Aas
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Barbara Charlton
Barry Stockdale  
715 N. 32nd Street  
Billings, MT 59101  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality  

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.  

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:  

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.  

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table  

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.  

Sincerely,  

Barry Stockdale
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,
Becky Mitchell

Becky Mitchell
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Becky J Piske

Yes, I am using the words of NPR, but they are saying what needs to be said. Please, please, please take care of this awful mess, NOW.

Becky Piske
Betty Stroock
1350 Story Mill Road
Bozeman, MT 59715

Sara Edinberg
Waste Management and Remediation Division
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to support the requirement in the Remedy Evaluation Report to excavate all coal ash in the Units 1& 2 ponds and move the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of pollution from the mining industry. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Betty Stroock
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of pollution from mining. The companies that profited from these plants need to do the responsible thing and do the cleanup that was expected of them. Do not shift the cost of this the cleanup to the taxpayers.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Bobette Bertsch
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Brian Harrington (Billings)
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

CARL CLARK
Carol Mick  
78 27th St. W., #311  
Billings, MT 59102

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Carol Mick

P.S. Also we have a great wealth of technology and possibilities that can recycle, reuse, re-purpose or chemically alter substrate to be non toxic and not a problem. Are you smart enough to take on the challenge?

Carol Mick
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

As someone who worked closely over the last three years with Montana farmers and ranchers, let me assure you that these producers do not need any more challenges to their operations. They face enormous burdens and the ruination of their water sources—the nearly inevitable endpoint of a lax approach—would likely be their end. I urge you not to contribute to the hollowing out of rural Montana in this way.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Catie DeMets
Missoula, MT

Catie DeMets
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Charlaine Wilkerson
Chris Carrieri  
231 S 2nd St  
Livingston, MT 59047

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

We just spent time exploring Rosebud Co as part time SW MT residents. Please consider the advantages of doing this clean up properly now and not waiting-don’t kick it down the road! ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Chris Carrieri
Utility companies make billions of dollars every year and are protected monopolies. That status should require that companies protect their customers by fully remediating the toxic remains of their production facilities.
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Chris Siegler
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I strongly urge DEQ to approve the Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. My prior years working as a hydrographer for the Federal Government guides me to recognize a problem when I see one and there is a problem here. It needs to be dealt with. Why would you not want to prevent a major disaster from happening? We expect our federal and state agencies to look out for the public's resources. It is your job. Do it.

Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Clinton Nagel
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Corine lindhorst
Corine Llindhorst  
103 Golden Valley Loop  
Great Falls, MT 59404

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Corine Llindhorst
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.
- Includes long term monitoring to ensure design integrity and that construction is properly completed.
- Includes provisions for long-term maintenance of the liner and cap.

Sincerely,

Daniel Seifert
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

David Wieland
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Debbie Tauscher
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. Talen Energy is lobbying to "cap" the ponds in place and walk away from the job.

We demand a "high and dry" solution where the company is directed to excavate all coal ash at the Units 1&2 ponds for storage in a new, lined landfill and DEQ will secure bonding from Colstrip's owners to pump water beyond the year 2070 in order to protect future taxpayers from footing the bill.

Montana has seen enough taxpayer-funded cleanups where the companies walk away; we don't need another Butte, Libby, or Zortman-Landusky.

Sincerely,

Deborah Hanson
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Dee Anna
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to request that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. As a Montana taxpayer I do not want to be burdened with future cleanup costs. I want the industry to be required to do the cleanup right in the first place. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades. Finally, compared to the industry’s cap-in-place cleanup proposal, proper cleanup would provide more than twice as many well-paying jobs during the first ten years of cleanup for workers, who, through no fault of their own, will losing their jobs when the units shut down.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Donna Onstott
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Doug Brugger
Douglas Rhodes
P.O. Box 1646
Whitefish, MT 59937

Sara Edinberg
Waste Management and Remediation Division
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely, Doug Rhodes

Douglas Rhodes
Dr. Lynn Hilten  
P.O. Box 1107  
Columbus, MT 59019

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Dr. Lynn Hilten
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Duane Claypool
Eileen Carney
P.O. Box 1193
Libby, MT 59923-1193

Sara Edinberg
Waste Management and Remediation Division
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

Montana has a sad history of letting corporations do what they wish and making the tax payers clean up their mess. We must hold these polluters responsible for what they do to send a message that the future will be different from the past. I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a “wait and see” approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Eileen Carney

Eileen Carney
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth R Vanderhorst
Elizabeth Madden
408 Overbrook Drive
Bozeman, MT 59715-7131

Sara Edinberg
Waste Management and Remediation Division
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

Please accept my comments on cleanup plan for Colstrip Units 1&2. I ask that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the under drain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Madden
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

In regards to the clean-up plan for the coal ash ponds in Colstrip, I insist that whatever action is taken is thorough enough to ensure the long-term health of the local environment, and the continuing cleanliness of the area's groundwater. From what I have read, the best way to ensure that is to remove ALL the coal ash, and place it in a landfill far above the water table, so as to ensure against future contamination. I am no expert on these matters, however, and if there is a simpler way to accomplish the aforementioned objective, I would be agreeable to it. It is imperative, however, that unnecessary risks be avoided. Too many environmental disasters have occurred because nobody asked what would happen if things went wrong. When choosing a clean-up plan to approve, assume that everything that can go wrong WILL go wrong, and choose the plan which would have the least impact in such a scenario.

Thanks,

Evan Fritz

Evan Fritz
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Fred Brewer
Gail Richardson  
5263 Cimmeron Drive  
Bozeman, MT 59715

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Gail Richardson
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Grant Barnard
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Hank McClain
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Heather Sheffield
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We also have a long legacy of clean water and residents who value the recreational opportunities that come with clean water. The stay relies heavily on the tourism industry. For these reasons, we cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Heidi Anderson
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Ita Killeen
Jane Van Dyk  
3130 Gregory Drive  
Billings, MT 59102

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jane Van Dyk
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Janice Munzke-Deal
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jay Raines
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

My family ranches and pays taxes in Rosebud County. I am writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades. We need clean up done right so those of who pay taxes do not shoulder the ongoing burden of inadequate clean up.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jeanie Alderson
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1 & 2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jeanne Thomas
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jeffrey Kreidler
Jena Nash Reno  
5262 W. Durston Rd  
Bozeman, MT 59718

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

We are tired of Montana being sold down the river for the sake of industry. Our water, our wildlife, and subsequently our health are negatively impacted. Stop the damage. We cant afford any more devastation.

Sincerely,

Jena Nash Reno
Jennifer Ferguson
518 S 4th St W
MISSOULA, MT 59801

Sara Edinberg
Waste Management and Remediation Division
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director
Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to urge the DEQ to approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so water resources in the region do not continue to be contaminated. Montanans should not foot the bill for future clean-up costs that can be prevented now.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Ferguson
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jessica Walton
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jim Barrett
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
And please don't stick Montana with yet another industrial nightmare...!!!
• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jim Davis
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

joan daniels
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to strongly encourage you / the DEQ to approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,
Joel Harris

Joel Harris
Joe Loos
7245 New Castle Dr
Missoula, MT 59802

Sara Edinberg
Waste Management and Remediation Division
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Joe Loos
John AND Jean Fleming  
21364 Hytrail Circle  
Lakeville, MT 55044

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,
John AND Jean Fleming

John AND Jean Fleming
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,
John Boschert

John Boschert
John Bradley 
PO Box 1894 
Colstrip, MT 59323-1894 

Sara Edinberg 
Waste Management and Remediation Division 
Montana Department of Environmental Quality 
P.O. Box 200901 
Helena, MT 59620-0901 

Shaun McGrath, Director, 
Montana Department of Environmental Quality 

Dear Director McGrath, 

I write to encourage your support of a stringent and thorough clean-up of Colstrip's ash ponds. 

Having literally seen our groundwater when it was exposed near Castle Rock outside Colstrip at the start of a mining project, I was struck by how vulnerable this precious source of life is. 

You will hear some probabilistic statements that make "shoot, shovel and shut-up" seem like a reasonable operating procedure. 

Ash pond contaminants were removed from air pollution, mixed with water and are now concentrated in structure more like a mud puddle than a containment structure. Neurotoxins, mutagens and carcinogens are a foolish legacy to abandon in half-measures. 

Don't set an unnatural standard that encourages enterprises to foul the nest in which they hatch their golden eggs. 

I urge you to issue DEQ a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and isolating the ash in a manner which minimizes any ordinary or disaster-caused release of these concentrated contaminant/ poisons into the water, land or air. 

Sincerely, 

John Ross Bradley 

John Bradley
John Woodland  
580 River Bend Rd  
Superior, MT 59872

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Our State Constiution entitles us to a clean and healthful environment. Our Supreme Court has ruled that this requirement is preventative and that it is a fundamental right. You, as an officer of the State of Montana have a duty to protect our rights and you will be breaching that duty unless you require a full, comprehensive cleanup.

Sincerely,

John Woodland
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Joy LaClaire
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Judith G. Hunt
Judy Gobert  
36326 Moss Creek Lane  
Polson, MT 59860

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Judy Gobert
Julia M Saylor  
554 3rd St  
Helena, MT 59601

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen’s property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Montana has long generated massive, destructive Superfund sites; let's change that pattern now.

Sincerely,

Julia M Saylor

Julia M Saylor
Karen Schweitzer  
504 Fieldstone Dr.  
Bozeman, MT 59715

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Karen Schweitzer
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Karen Tibbs
Karl Schmiedeskamp  
4215 Mt. Sapphire Drive #313  
Billings, MT 59106

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Small children are taught to clean up after themselves. Corporations ought to be at least as responsible as children.

Karl Schmiedeskamp
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Kathie Daviau
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Kathryn Kern
Katie Scherfig  
PO Box 1973  
Bozeman, MT 59771

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Katie Scherfig
Ken Clark  
3365 Hoffman Rd  
East Helena, MT 59635

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Ken Clark
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Kerry Krebill
Kristin Freeman  
1346 River Street  
Missoula, MT 59801  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality  

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.  

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:  

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.  

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen’s property that is above the water table  

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.  

Sincerely,  

Kristin Freeman
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Kristin Vance
This comment is for the purpose of requesting that DEQ provide the best solution for the final remediation of the Colstrip waste. I fully understand that it is the primary duty of the owners to avoid as many costs as possible in order to maximize profits. They have done an excellent job of this, even at the detriment of the very customers they serve. Now that the units are reaching their life expectancy it is time that a tiny part of the profits be used to properly clean up the mess they made. Please protect the interests of Montana citizens both now and in the future by assuring that coal ash waste in cleaned up properly now. Make the owners dewater all the ponds and pump out toxic ground water as long as it is needed. Also make the owners move all the coal ash to a location where is can never contaminate groundwater again.

Sincerely,
Larry Bean

LARRY BEAN
Laulette HANSEN
127 S. Easy St.
MISSOULA, MT 59802

Sara Edinberg
Waste Management and Remediation Division
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear. Please don't let coal ash residue into Our groundwater, Montana's most priceless resource.

Sincerely,

Laulette Hansen

Laulette HANSEN
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

In re: Colstrip Units 1&2 ash ponds

Now is the time for Montana to have a real and permanent solution to protect all the downstream waters from the Colstrip 1&2 coal ash. The DEQ should require excavating all coal ash from the Units 1&2 ponds and moving it to a secure, lined landfill above the water table. This is the only way to protect the farms and ranches downstream of Colstrip, and doing the job right will provide jobs and avoid a future of contaminated water and taxpayer nightmares.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that completely de-waters the ash ponds and the wells drilled into them; moves all the ash to a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property above the water table; and protects the workers involved in the project with adequate HazMat protective gear.

Sincerely,

Lauran Emerson
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I am contacting you to demand that the DEQ approve a REMEDY EVALUATION REPORT that requires excavating ALL coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana residents have had to deal with a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,
Lee Bartlett

Lee Bartlett
Leone Harmon  
106 E Kent Ave  
Missoula, MT 59801

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Leone Harmon
Linda Cencer  
223 S 4th  
Manhattan, MT 59741

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Nothing less is acceptable! Please hold them accountable for their waste!

Sincerely,

Linda Cencer

Linda Cencer
While owners of the remaining Colstrip units play 'hot potato' with ownership, the clean up of the ash pond complex of Units 1 and 2 complex needs to be done and done well.

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Linda Healow
Lindsey Myers  
Po box 143  
Drummond, MT 59832

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to strongly request that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades. It would also be good transition work for those people unemployed by the closure of units 2&3.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,
Lindsey Myers

Lindsey Myers
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Linnea Forseth
Lisa Sukut  
515 East Montana Street  
Livingston, MT 59047  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality  

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades. Montanans have the constitutional right, granted in our state constitution, to a clean environment.  

Therefore, please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:  

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.  
• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen’s property that is above the water table  
• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.  

Sincerely,  

Lisa Sukut
Lisa Ventura  
1404 Cook Ave  
Billings, MT 59102

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Clean, uncontaminated water is becoming a rarity these days. Montana should treasure what's left of it's clean water and protect it at all costs. If not, it could end up being an environmental problem that could be beyond our ability to fix.

Sincerely,
Lisa Ventura

Lisa Ventura
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Lynne Oulman
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I worked for years with the EPA Denver office cleaning up superfund mining sites. We need to stop this pollution at its source rather than wait until a clean up is initiated due to people and animals getting sick. I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,
Marie Zanowick Bourgeois, Engineer
Certified Biomimicry Professional

Marie Bourgeois
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Marilyn Hill
Mark Fix  
584 Tongue River Road  
Miles City, MT 59301

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Talen cannot do a cap in place for the ponds. These ponds are too big to throw a blanket on and expect it to do any good. The pollution plume will continue to expand and damage the water table for all the people of Colstrip and the surrounding farmers and ranchers. Talen needs to give some of the water right from the Yellowstone to the City of Colstrip so that the town can continue into the future. The ground water is most likely already contaminated and replacing the Yellowstone water with groundwater for the city of Colstrip is not an option. Talen needs to continue pumping the capture wells so that the contamination will not spread. The pumping may be perpetual.
Talen needs to bond so that good cleanup is performed. The reclamation and cleanup of Colstrip will provide jobs for many years into the future. DEQ must require that a good reclamation plan is approved. DEQ must require good cleanup. Montana does not need another superfund site.

Sincerely,

Mark Fix  
584 Tongue River Road  
Miles City MT 59301
mfix@rangeweb.net
406-421-5460

Mark Fix
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen’s property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Marshall Swearingen
Mary Kathryn Mrgudic  
700 Rollins St.  
Missoula, MT 59801

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

We are writing as very concerned Montana residents to insist that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,
Mary "Kate" Mrgudic
Joseph Stauffer

Mary Kathryn Mrgudic
Marya Grathwohl
1134 N. 22nd St. Apt. 7
Billings, MT 59101

Sara Edinberg
Waste Management and Remediation Division
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Marya Grathwohl
Mary Owens  
10529 Coulter Pine St.  
Lolo, MT 59847-9214

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to request that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Mary Owens
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

The science is clear and the record is indisputable: Colstrip's coal ash ponds are severely polluting the groundwater, and remedial action must be taken to completely eliminate this environmental threat. Thus, I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table.

Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Michael Enk
Nadene Falagan  
3 North 2nd St.  
Roberts, MT 59070

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Nadene Falagan
Nancy Carrel  
29 Red Bluff Loop  
Birney, MT 59012

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Nancy Carrel
Nancy Kessler  
914 W Clark St  
Livingston, MT 59047

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Nancy Kessler
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Nora Workman-Weaver
Norman Bishop  
4898 Itana Circle  
Bozeman, MT 59715

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I am gravely concerned about the health of Colstrip community citizens and nearby farmers. That's why I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Norman Bishop
onno Wieringa  
9550 Hwy 2 East  
hungry horse, MT 59919

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to ask that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries, we are a conservative State and there is nothing more conservative than to leave the land as we inherited it ...... leaving coal ash to leach into the water table has to be remedied.

Sincerely,  
Onno Wieringa

onno Wieringa
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Pat Smith
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades. Protecting the aquifer and providing employment in Colstrip is a win-win for all Montanans! Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Patty Laughlin
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

peter Murray
Priscilla Bell  
1310 Wild Horse Drive  
Laurel, MT 59044

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Priscilla Bell
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

It’s hard to believe that anyone would allow any pollution in our beautiful state of Montana.

I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen’s property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Rachel Stansberry
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Richard Newman
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Richard Wiebe
Robert Rasmussen  
1027 Billings Ave  
Helena, MT 59601-3504  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality  

I'm writing to suggest that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup or an approach that requires additional monitoring or perpetual treatment; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region or the ratepayers or the taxpayers do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.  

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:  

• Fully de-waters all ponds with pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.  

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on property that is above the water table  

• Protects the workers involved in excavation and other activities of remediation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.  

Sincerely,  

Robert Rasmussen
Robin "Cat" Billau  
126 Quinn Creek Road  
Bozeman, MT 59715

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to request that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Having worked on several Superfund sites I have first hand knowledge of how difficult it is to clean up contaminated water. Our state’s water resources are too precious to allow the ponds to be capped as they are. Although the remedy’s recommended are expensive in the short term, the dollars saved in the long run will obviously be tremendous. The benefits to the local community will also be positive and bring an economic boost greatly needed for this area.

I thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,
Robin Billau

Robin "Cat" Billau
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to push the DEQ to approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so everyone is guaranteed reliable, clean water.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Robin Alexis Byron
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Robin Kratschmer
Ronis Bollinger  
PO Box 675  
Absarokee, MT 59001  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality  

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades. 

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that: 

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain. 

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table 

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear. 

Sincerely,  

Ronis Bollinger
Roxa Reller  
PO Box 1331  
Helena, MT 59624

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

For 40 years the issue of leaking ash ponds at Colstrip have concerned Rosebud County and surrounding area residents. Thank you for the opportunity for my concerns to be included in the DEQ Remedy Evaluation Report of Units 1&2 cleanup plans.

Contaminated groundwater and its associated expensive cleanup costs affect Montana taxpayers. I’ve listened to the histories and observed how other Montana extractive industries around the state have left taxpayers on the hook for incomplete, ineffective, or downright unlawful cleanup – Zortman-Landusky, Libby, Mikehorse, and Butte are a few places that come to mind – and that eventually even taxpayers around the nation have to pay for cleanup (Superfund sites at Libby and Butte, for example). I don’t want an eastern Montana Superfund site – my wallet and our water can’t afford it.

I strongly urge the DEQ to require a “high and dry” cleanup solution that involves digging up the coal ash and moving it to a lined landfill high above the water table. I want heavy metals and contaminants removed so that groundwater contamination is permanently halted. I want water quality restored now before the owners of Units 1&2 walk away – cleaning up leaking ash ponds is expensive—because it’s the best way of protecting all taxpayers from absorbing future financial burdens.

Sincerely,
Roxa Reller

Roxa Reller
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Sarah Hoffman
Sara Ihrie  
960 W Magic Rd Unit 37  
West Magic, MT 83352

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Sara Ihrie
Shari Dayton  
1203 Rimhaven  
Billings, MT 59102

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Shari Dayton
Sharyl Siegel  
1459 Stillwater River Rd  
Nye, MT 59061

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Sharyl and Rob Siegel

Sharyl Siegel
Steve Held  
10 Turret Buttes  
Broadus, MT 59317  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

Shaun, Approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,  
Steve Held  

Steve Held
Steven McArthur
3406 West Central Ave.
Missoula, MT 49804

Sara Edinberg
Waste Management and Remediation Division
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Steven McArthur
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to insist that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from extractive mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Steve McConnell

Steven McConnell
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Steven Smith
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Sue Dickenson
Susan Mershon  
3015 Chapman  
Billings, MT 59102

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Susan Mershon
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

Because Colstrip must not become a new Superfund sight in Eastern Montana, I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report requiring excavation of all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds. That coal ash must be moved to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table - a "high and dry" cleanup solution. Capping the ponds in place, as Talen Energy argues, is a woefully inadequate and unethical proposal. It is not a solution.

Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

A Remedy Evaluation Report must include the following before being approved:

• Fully de-water all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Remove all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protect the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Susan Stubblefield
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Susan Thomas
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I wrote my Senior Paper in College at the University of Montana in 1979 on Colstrip units 1 and 2. I have followed the story of these power plants my entire life, as my family owns ranches on Rosebud Creek.

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

We have too many Superfund sites in Montana already. We don't need another one. My sister lives at Troy and has many friends who have experienced the horrors of the Libby’s problems first hand. I have lived upstream of the Blackfoot River, where the Mike Horse Dam site is still causing problems.

Make the mining company at Colstrip take care of this problem NOW, before it gets worse!

Sincerely,

Suzanne Vernon
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Teresa Savage
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Tim Holmes
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Tim Skufca
Todd Davis  
3855 N Collister Drive  
Boise, MT 83703  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality  

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Todd Davis
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Sincerely,
Tom Tully

Tom Tully
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Wade Laird
Wade Sikorski  
19 Wicklow Ln.  
Baker, MT 59313-9631

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Wade Sikorski
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

William DeGroot
William Tramp  
5336 Valley Drive East  
Miles City, MT 59301  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality  

These ash ponds need to be removed ASAP to stop the source of contaminants. Then the parties responsible for contaminating the groundwater must be held responsible for cleaning up the groundwater they've already poisoned.  
Sincerely,  

William Tramp
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Corey Schade
George Bourlotos  
2213 Gates Ct  
Morris Plains, NJ 7950

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

George Bourlotos
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Louise McClure
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Mark Canright
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Rebecca Canright
margo wyse  
110 EL OTRO LADO Rd  
Mimbres, NM 88049  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality  

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen’s property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

margo wyse
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

fay forman
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

janet forman
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

JoAnne Metzler
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Pamylle Greinke
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Peter Nicholas
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Sarah Hamilton
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Sylvia Rodriguez
Susan Galante  
5209 Red Wing Ct  
Fuquay Varina, NC 27526

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Susan Galante
Randy Sailer  
1018 cherry lane  
Beulah, ND 58523  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Randy Sailer
Amy Schumacher  
4127 middlebrook dr  
Dayton, OH 45440  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality  

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Amy Schumacher
Laura Mazar  
8627 Gibson Road  
Canfield, OH 44406

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Laura Mazar
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Nancy Dollard
Pamela Foley Simmons  
21494 Ball Ave  
Euclid, OH 44123  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality  

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Pamela Foley Simmons
I'm writing to DEMAND that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires EXCAVATING ALL COAL ASH IN THE UNIT 1&2 PONDS AND MOVING SAID ASH TO A SECURE, LINED LANDFILL ABOVE THE WATER TABLE. MONTANA HAS A LONG, SORRY HISTORY OF LEGACY POLLUTION AND CRIMINAL NEGLECT FROM OUR MINING INDUSTRIES. WE CANNOT HAVE THE USUAL 'WAIT-AND-SEE- BULLSHIT APPROACH WITH THIS CLEAN-UP; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• FULLY DE-WATERS ALL PONDS WITH AGGRESSIVE PUMPING., including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• REEMOVES ALL COAL ASH AND STORES IT IN A SECURE, LINED LANDFILL on Talen's property that is ABOVE THE WATER TABLE.

• PROTECTS ALL WORKERS INVOLVED IN EXCAVATION AND REMOVAL WITH ADEQUATE HAZMAT PERSONAL PROTECTIVE GEAR.

Sincerely,

LAM WEISMAN
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

If you want to review the long-term evil effects of the ash holding ponds, review the effects on "downstreamers" affected by those in Kentucky, West Virginia, and other coal-mining states subject to mountain-top mining.

https://science.howstuffworks.com/environmental/energy/deadly-problem-coal-ash.htm

Sincerely,

Dean Sigler
Dean Sigler  
18845 SW Vista St  
Aloha, OR 97003-2907

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Just look at the terrible health records of those living downstream from coal ponds and mines in Kentucky and West Virginia. You don't want Montana to end up like that.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Dean Sigler
Diana Saxon  
4098 Market St NE Apt 23  
Salem, OR 97301  

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901  

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality  

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.  

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:  

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.  

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table  

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.  

Sincerely,  
Diana Saxon
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Michael Halloran
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing from Oregon to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Peter Cornelison

Peter Cornelison
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

susan delles
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,
susan Delles
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Henry Frank
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jason Crawford
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Johnny Schaefers
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Robin Pappas
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jan Modjeski
I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Gerald McNellis
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Carolyn Riddle
Dorothy Lynn Brooks  
720 Briarwood Blvd  
Arlington, TX 76013

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen’s property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Protects our planet and its people.

Sincerely,

Dorothy Lynn Brooks
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

James Lowe
Jane Chischilly  
710 FLORENCE ST  
ATLANTA, TX 75551-2504

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jane Chischilly
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Lois Lommel
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Victor Escobar
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Adina Parsley
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Amy Hansen
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Dan O'Keefe
elyette weinstein
5000 Orvas Ct SE
Olympia, WA 98501

Sara Edinberg
Waste Management and Remediation Division
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

elyette weinstein
George Keefe  
960 5th Avenue South  
Edmonds, WA 98920

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I write to respectfully urge you that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen’s property that is above the water table
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

George Keefe
Glen Anderson
5015 15th Ave SE
Lacey, WA 98503

Sara Edinberg
Waste Management and Remediation Division
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

FOR MANY, MANY YEARS, MINING COMPANIES HAVE BEEN DESTROYING MONTANA'S ENVIRONMENT AND PEOPLE'S HEALTH!!!!!

I'm calling upon the DEQ to STOP THE CORRUPTION -- and START PROTECTING MONTANA FROM ABUSE!!!!!!

I demand that the DEQ approve a STRONG, SCIENCE-BASED Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table.

I implore you to approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Glen Anderson
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

The maintaining of water quality cannot be overestimated.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

James Chesky
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.
- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.
- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

James Day
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Janet Wynne
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jeffrey Panciera
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

judith cohen
Mary Riley
121 Karr Ave
Hoquiam, WA 98550

Sara Edinberg
Waste Management and Remediation Division
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I’m writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Mary Riley
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Sammy Low
Thom Lufkin  
212 21st Ave SE  
Olympia, WA 98501

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Thom Lufkin
Thom Lufkin  
212 21st Ave SE  
Olympia, WA 98501-2928

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to request that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Thom Lufkin
Tracy Ouellette  
14078 MacTaggart Ave  
Bow, WA 98232-9246

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Tracy Ouellette
Coal ash is toxic. It contaminates groundwater and affects all ecosystems. It creates a public health disaster. These facts are all well known. The only things that stand in the way of dealing effectively with this problem is human greed, capitulation with industry, and apathy.

I live in a state where all of the above have created a coal ash emergency. Please do something about this problem in your state.

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Charlotte Fremaux
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Helgaleena Healingline
Christine Valentine  
1500 De Smet Ave., #2B  
Sheridan, WY 82801

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

I'm writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

• Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

• Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table

• Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Christine Valentine
ATTENTION: Shaun McGrath, Director, Montana Department of Environmental Quality

Dear Director,

We believe it is critical that these coal ash ponds be completely cleaned up to avoid any contact with groundwater or streams whether they flow constantly or intermittently. The coal ash needs to be secured as it is toxic. The pollution of any groundwater or waterway wherever it exists affects the quality of our environment in America. It is a national issue. We approve the follow message.

We are writing to demand that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that requires excavating all coal ash in the Units 1&2 ponds and moving the ash to a secure, lined landfill sited above the water table. Montana has a long history of legacy pollution from our mining industries. We cannot have a "wait and see" approach with this cleanup; it must be done right the first time so agricultural producers in the region do not pay the price of poor water quality in the coming decades.

Please approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that:

- Fully de-waters all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

- Removes all coal ash and stores it in a secure, lined landfill on Talen's property that is above the water table.

- Protects the workers involved in excavation with adequate HazMat personal protective gear.

Sincerely,

Jennifer and Neil Miller
Basin, Wyoming

Neil and Jennifer Miller
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Cecily Schroepfer

My address is 1124 N 22 ST #9

Billings MT 59101

city or town state

cecily054@gmail.com (406) 259-1927

e-mail phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please permanently clean-up the Ash Ponds. Fully dry the ash and store it in a lined landfill above the water table. Leaving the coal ash in place comp-in-place creates a long term risk for Rex- bad Co residents & taxpayers. Responsible, high quality cleanup is a huge job. CEQ/CEQ should do most

Thank you, Cecily Schroepfer 10-30-19

signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Jill Van Alstyn.

My address is 152 Fairway Dr.

Helena, MT

jills10@onewest.net, 406-364-8

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: As a concerned citizen who

(formerly worked in Eastern Montana,

I am respectfully asking the DEQ require the
to excavate the de-water it, and

store it in a lined landfill.

Thank you, Jill Van Alstyn 10/17/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Doug (Slin) Miller

My address is 1213 North Ave

Helena MT

email slin1213@gmail.com

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Removing coal ash from the ponds and putting them in a properly designed repository is the only permanent solution - best way!

Thank you,

signature

Date 10/30/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: EXCAVATE THE PONDS AND DRY OUT THE POLLUTANTS & STORE THE POLLUTANTS IN AN APPROVED STORAGE FACILITY.
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Sas Weber

My address is 11055 Greenhorn Rd

Belgrade  MT

city or town

Saso.Stuartweber.com  406.600.9810

e-mail

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Cap-in-Place is ineffective, as we know that from what's happened in other states. Let's take this opportunity to deal with the waste properly, creating jobs at a safe living environment for the people in the area.

Thank you, Sas 10/5/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please seriously consider removal of all the coal ash now causing polluted ground water and storing it in a lined landfill above the water table. This is the only responsible solution for the 1 & 2 Pond Closure.

Thank you,

Carol Kulich

Date: 10-9-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Barbara Needham

My address is 3088 Rosebud Creek Rd

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Dig it up  
         Dig it out  
         Fix it forever

Thank you, 

Signature: Barbara Needham  
Date: Oct 29
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Katharine Koughan

My address is 2217 Main St.

Miles City, MT 59301

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Don't leave Rosebud County residents at risk!

1. Excavate coal ash, dry it out and store above the water table.
2. Do the clean-up right the first time.
3. Use the skills of the existing workforce.

Thank you, Katharine Koughan

10-5-2019
My name is Michael Enk
My address is PO Box 1408
Great Falls MT 59403

city or town
state
email
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Montanans deserve a permanent cleanup of these ponds. Coal ash must be excavated, dried out and safely stored in a lined landfill above the water table. High-and-dry cleanup provides economic benefits of good jobs for the existing workforce as coal jobs are lost.

Thank you,

signature Michael Enk Date 10/4/2019
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Becky Grey
first name
last name

My address is PO Box 1621
street
RedLodge
city or town
MT 59068
state
hilk66gray@aol.com
email

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Permanent Clean Up Creates Jobs!!! We need to excavate coal ash in contact with the water table. Then it must be dewatered & stored in a landfill above the water table. MT has no money for future pollution costs.

Thank you,

Becky Grey
signature

Date 10/7/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Leslie Adams
My address is 1 Buckshot Lane
Twin Bridges, MT
lesadamsmt@gmail.com

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please keep all Montana water safe from coal ash. Permanent storage using excavation seems the safest for Colstrip. Protect our people and landscapes. It is your purpose!

Thank you,

Cheslie Adams
10/15/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: *LET'S DO IT RIGHT SO IT IS PERMANENTLY FIXED. REMOVE THE COAL ASH, DRY IT OUT AND STORE IT IN LINED LANDFILL. STILLWATER MINING DOES THAT SO NO REASON TO ALLOW A QUICK FIX THAT ISN'T. "RAP IN PLACE" IS LIKE NOT EMPTYING CAT LITTER BOX - IT STINKS.*

Thank you.

signature: [Signature]
Date: 10/1/19
My name is Terese Blanding
My address is 539 Clark Avenue, Billings, Montana

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

Excavate & dewater - do it right!

Thank you, Terese Blanding 9/30/2019
My name is John Snyder

My address is 1522 Ave F

Billings MT

snyderj82@yahoo.com

phone 914923 1173

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Polluted groundwater in the Colstrip area pose grave risks to the current and future residents. All ash residing in unlined impoundments should be removed, dewated, and stored in a lined landfill.

Please respect our groundwater resources.

Thank you,

Signature 10/7/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Kathy Hefferman

My address is 3851 Duncan Dr.

Missoula, MT 59802

Kjohnheff@gmail.com

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: The coal ash at Colstrip must be dewatered, excavated and stored in lined landfill. Anything less will allow coal ash pollution to continue to pollute local groundwater.

Thank you.

[Signature] 10-2-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Ken Kingman
first name
last name

My address is 1023 Harvard Ave
street

BILLINGS
city or town
MT
state

(406) 256-4975
phone

e-mail

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: It is way past time for the DEQ to stop all groundwater contamination by removing the coal ash.

I don't care if it is dried or de-watered - just do it!

Thank you.

Signature 10/5/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please assure the coal ash ponds are excavated and de-watered so they cannot pollute yet again. We promised our kids a clean environment & the Montana Constitution agrees! Thank you.

Thank you, Tim Holmes 10/4/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is

Kenneth M. Younger
17 Hitching Post Rd.
Bozeman, MT 59715

My address is

city or town

(406) 587.2300

state

email

phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Dear Director McGrath,

It's really time to fix these two leaking contaminating ponds forever. I hope that DEQ will decide to excavate the two saturated ponds & secure dried out the contents in high, dry landfills so that the coal ash is no longer sitting in ground water and leaking into the soil below.

Thank you,

[Signature]

Date 10/11/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

WE DO NOT WANT TO GET STUCK WITH A BILL DOWN THE ROAD.

DIG IT UP & STORE IT HIGH AND DRY.

Thank you,

Steve Harper

10/2/16
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is LAURIE TALCOTT
first name
last name
My address is 410 S. 11th St
street
LIVINGSTON
city or town
MT
state
laurietalcott@sbcglobal.net
phone
831-234-4237
email

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I STRONGLY SUPPORT AND URGE YOU TO SUPPORT THE EXCAVATION OF THE COAL ASH IN THE ASH PONDS IN COLSTRIP. LEAVING THIS IN PLACE CONTINUES TO POLLUTE THE GROUNDWATER, WHICH EVERYONE, INCLUDING RANCHERS AND FARMERS, USE FOR OUR LIVELIHOODS, WHILE CLEANING IT UP USING "HIGH AND DRY" METHODS, CLEANS IT UP FOR GOOD WHILE CREATING GOOD JOBS.

Thank you,

Date 10/12/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Shayla Walker
first name
last name

My address is 3332 Aqui Esta Dr.
street

Billings MT
city or town
state

sroddywalker@gmail.com
email

(406) 245-4771
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Require all coal ash to be removed from the water table and be dewatered. Please note the job creation of doing a responsible "high and dry" cleanup.

Thank you, Shayla Walker 10/14/19
signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is JEFFREY J. SMITH

My address is 105 CHANNEL DRIVE

MISSOURI MT
city or town state
e-mail: jswoolfowl@gmail.com
phone: 880-8320

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Montana needs a permanent solution, not a halfway measure. Excavate and dry all the coal ash in contact with the water table. Don't let the company get away with its cap-in-place fraud. Create jobs!

Thank you,

JEFF J. SMITH 9/30/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please enforce a responsible clean up of the coal ash ponds - don't leave the problem to the future by just capping in place. I have friends in Colstrip who would benefit from responsible clean up and the jobs it would create.

Thank you,

signature  10/5/19

My address is

127 Jefferson

street

Helena

city or town

MT

state

Sanna.porter@gmail.com

e-mail

443-6397

phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Cap-in-place = pollute-in-place. Please remove all coal ash, dry it out completely, and store in a lined landfill above the water table where it can't keep leaching into groundwater, ranchers and wildlife and create jobs.

Thank you,

signature  9/10/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Jonathan Motl

My address is 3755 Juniper Dr

city or town Helena
state MT
email jmotl47@gmail.com
phone 406-555-13

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

I favor excavating and drying the coal ash. Do Not Allow cap in place as it will just Shove the pollution costs onto future generations.

Thank you, Jonathan Motl 9/30/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is

first name

last name

My address is

Shirley A. Bollinger
2025 Cartersville Rd
Rosebud, MT 59347-9527

city or town

state

e-mail

phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I am a resident of Rosebud County. I believe it is very important that a responsible “high & dry” clean-up that permanently repairs to ground water should entail:

1. Removing coal ash in contact with ground water.

2. Clean-up should be done right the first time to prevent future pollution costs.

3. Permanent clean-up will create jobs when Coal Country/Rosebud County needs them the most.

Thank you,

Shirley Bollinger 10/12/19
My name is Bob D. Oset
394 Lost Horse Rd.
Hamilton, MT 59840

My address is

city or town
state

email
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

"Fix it forever"

Excavate &
dewater.

- No cap in place -
please

Thank you,

Signature

Date

10/1/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Patrick Burke
My address is 4285 Sundown Road
Missoula MT
email patrick.burke @gmail.com
phone 406-529-6130

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: All coal ash must be excavated, de-watered and then placed in a fully lined storage facility above the water table. We propose this approach provides an adequate solution. We cannot leave this hazardous problem to future generations to solve.

Thank you, Patrick Burke 10/5/15
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I urge you to adopt the Colstrip coal ash solution of removing the deposits that currently leak into the aquifer, dry it, replace it in lined landfills forever, and thereby offer employment to the present miners and laborers, and perhaps protect the surrounding landscape from toxic pollution.

Thank you,

Ann Harding

signature

Date

10/15/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is James Gillison

My address is 21 Greenbrier Lane

Missoula MT

city or town state

james.gillison@msn.com

e-mail phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

Let's clean up Colstrip right the first time.

Excavate, move, and dry the coal ash.

Thank you,

signature 24 Oct 19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Make Take
dig up the coal ash ponds, I stare, dry high the toxic mess they're allowed to poison the area's groundwater for decades.

Thank you,

Janet M. Melkin 10-20-19
My name is WILL SWEARINGEN
first name
last name

My address is 59 HITCHING POST ROAD
street

Bozeman city or town
MT state

wds59hp@gmail.com email
(406) 551-5119 phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: The coal ash in these ponds needs a permanent solution to prevent future pollution. The coal ash needs to be removed from the ponds, dried out, and stored in a lined landfill above the water table. The cap-in-place proposal doesn't cut it!

Thank you,

signature

Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Zelinda Hart
first name last name

My address is 7117 King Ave W
street

Billings MT 59101
city or town state

janesmetalart.com email

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Don’t cover up your contamination — deal with it right! Haul it away from aquifers and contain it so water is NOT contaminated. Pay a fair wage for cleanup.

Thank you, Zelinda Hart 10-94-19 signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Marta Meengs
first name
last name

My address is 107 North Ave W.
street
Missoula

MT 59801

city or town state

MMeengs77@gmail.com 406-207-5252

email phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please mandate that the cleaning up of the Coal Ash Ponds require the excavation, drying and removal of all coal ash contaminants. The surrounding area, ranches, residents and animals/fish need clean, unpolluted water!

Thank you, Marta Meengs 10-23-19

signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Nancy Sedwick

My address is 739 Murga Way

Ennis, MT 59729

city or town

onefiredheart@msn.com

phone 706-3531

email

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Remove coal ash in contact with water table; dry it out, store in lined Loudfield above the water table.

A good JDB creator! Don't pollute the water!

Thank you,

signature

Date 10/12/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Patricia Deertli

My address is 1012 Terry Avenue

Billings, MT

gpoertli@gmail.com 406-861-5460

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I would strongly support measures that would require Taler Energy to stop the leaking of contaminated water into the groundwater by removing, tanning it. Water is too precious!

Thank you,

Patricia Deertli 10.22.19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Rep. Mary Ann Dunwell
first name

My address is 2811 Alexis Ave
street

Helena MT 59601
city or town state

margannodunwell@gmail.com 461-5358
e-mail phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Excavate this toxic coolant,
dewater well store the waste high and dry in secure well-lined repository. Do it right please. Get more local jobs for Montanans!

Thank you,

Mary Ann Dunwell 10/18/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Ann Schooch
My address is 2211 Pryor Lane, Billings, MT 59101

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: It is wrong that 500,000 gallons of polluted water from the ponds leak into local ground waters daily. DEQ do the excavation, dewatering & storage required to make it safe for folks of Rosebud County residents, Colstrip people, wildlife, taxpayers. It cannot be a "cap-in-place" approach. No to partial cleanup. Yes, to helping create good-paying clean-up jobs for the existing workforce to do a permanent clean-up job! Thank you.

Thank you, Sister Ann Schooch 10-28-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Katherine Applinger-Freistadt

My address is 507 1st Street

Helena MT

email kathleen.freistadt@gmail.com

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: DEQ should have only one plan to permanently stop the coal ash leaking. Fix it forever by excavating the ash, dry it out, and prevent future leaking by storing it in a hood.

Thank you.

signature Katherine Freistadt

Date 10-15-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is John Dillon

My address is 323 E. Morse St

My phone number is (406) 451-2471

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Coalstrip's ponds 1 & 2 should be excavated and desalted, then stored in a lined landfill above the water table. Cap in place is a long-term risk for the land and human taxpayers. High and dry clean up would create good jobs.

Thank you,

John Dillon

Date: 10/19/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is SUSAN HILLSTROM
first name
last name
My address is PO BOX 333
street
CHATEAU
city or town
MT
state
geheim5@yahoo
email

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: DO NOT ALLOW THE "COMPANY'S PLAN" WHICH WILL COST MT TAXPAYERS IN PERPETUITY. ALL COAL ASH MUST BE EXCAVATED & DEWATERED THEN STORED IN A LINED LANDFILL! MAKE COMPANY PAY!

Thank you,

SUSAN HILLSTROM 10/20/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Cleanup needs to be done correctly the first time. All coal ash needs to be excavated, dried, outland, stored in a lined landfill above the water table.

Thank you,

Tom Heald
9-29-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Jim Parker
first name
last name
My address is 3700 Patrasko Dr. #1
street
MissourA
city or town
MT
state
westridge@montana.com 406-56-0985
e-mail
phone
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Permanent clean up stops ground water contamination. Remove/excavate all coal ash in contact with water table. Then de-water all the coal ash and store it in lined landfill above water table. This process is GREAT job editor. Thank you.

Thank you,

[Signature]
Date 10/19/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please direct your staff to require that Talen dewater & excavate all of its coal ash ponds. This is a totally commonsense long-term solution that will also extend jobs of folks losing their job at the plant & mine.

Thank you,

Dan Cohn

9/30/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Michael L. Hathaway
first name
last name
My address is 403 Augusta Drive
street
Missoula
city or town MT 59801
state

mlhathawaymontana@gmail.com 406-493-4597
email
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: The clean-up plan must meet the high standard of correcting the problem now and in perpetuity. The ash must be completely excavated and dried or de-watered, then stored in a lined landfill above and distant from the water table. We can utilize existing plant employees who are well-trained to do the work creating jobs & saving $.

Thank you,

M. J. Hathaway 30/September/2019
signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Jim Kammerer
first name Kammerer last name
My address is 832 Cheryl Rd.
street
Helena MT
city or town state
Jimkammerer406@gmail.com 459-9368
e-mail phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please consider complete removal of coal ash to a new lined site. This is a better method and actually creates more jobs. Thank you

Thank you, Jim J. Kammerer 11/20/19
signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is ELAINE (SKINNER) HALE
first name last name

My address is 203 N. 5TH ST, POLA 1123
street

MANHATTAN MT city or town state

____ email 406-284-9046 phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Concerning the Coalstrip clean-up ofTopic Coal ash, the only way is to excavate and dewater it then store it above ground high and dry so that future leaks are prevented & local jobs created.

Thank you, ELAINE (SKINNER) HALE 10/1/2019 signature Date
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Actual Reclamation must happen! The coal ash waste must be excavated and stored dry & dry in lined pits. Water in old pits must be treated forever to get contaminants out. Ground water must be drinkable. There must be adequate BONDS for total cleanup. DEQ has a moral responsibility to protect its citizens! Not the companies. NW Energy should not transfer their stupid economic decisions to rate payers who Demand renewable energy. And - Why doesn’t your website work?

Thank you,

signature: Gayle L. Joslin

Date: 11-20-2019
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is FRANK KUEAH
first name last name
My address is 2613 YELLOWSTONE AVENUE
street
BILLINGS MT
city or town state

email phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: MALENG THE RIGHT DECISIONS TO REMOVE
AND TREAT THE CELMASH AT COLSTREP WILL MINIMIZE FUTURE POLLUTION COSTS AND
SERVE TO CREATE MANY LONG-TERM, GOOD-PAYING JOBS. WHY WOULDN'T THE DEQ

NOT CHOOSE THIS COURSE OF ACTION?

Thank you, 

signature 10-2-2019

Date
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: We need to fix this right way the first time! Dry it up and dry it out so it doesn't turn into a Super Fund site.

Thank you,

Signature: Daniel Graham
Date: 10-1-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Bruce Bender
first name
last name
My address is 3605 Kennewick
street
Missoula
city or town
MT
state

email
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

Cleanup ash ponds - remove "dry ash" properly landfill

Thank you,
signature Date

Bruce 9/30/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Jerald Anderberg

My address is 2510 Roth Lane

Billings, MT 59102

JerryAnderberg@gmail.com, 406-534-2623

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: The ponds should be excavated, the fly ash dewatered, and the dry ash put in a lined landfill above the water table.

Sincerely,

Jerald W. Anderberg

Thank you,

signature

Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Sandra K. Anderson
first name

My address is P.O. Box
street

Hikes City
city or town

MT 59301
state

406
phone

951-5336(c)

email

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Dallen needs to clean up the coal ash right, and it will protect the water, and preserve the Colstrip Community.

Enforce corporate responsibility.

Thank you,

Sandra K. Anderson
signature

10/28/19
Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Gary LeDean
first name
last name

My address is 2750 Schley Creek Rd
street

Arlee
city or town
MT
state

726-3824
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

Water pollution is a sin
a disrespect to a wonderful gift - clean air the same

Please expedite clean up
of the Ash Pond

Thank you,

Gary LeDean
signature

10-1-2019
Date
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

Montanans deserve clean water.

Make it happen.

Thank you, Helen Keller 10-5-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Janet Sharpless
first name
last name

My address is P.O. Box 522
street
Emigrant, MT 59027
city or town
state

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Those who own these units need to pay for their permanent clean-up now. The dirty groundwater greatly affects the rivers.

Thank you,

signature

Date 10/2/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Edwin Fields
first name
last name
My address is 511 Lakewood CT
street
WHITEFISH
city or town
MT
state
(406) 862-7269
phone
geldscasa@gmail.com
email

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: GROUNDWATER CONTAMINATION SHOULD NEVER BE ALLOWED TO BEGIN WITH. THOSE WHO MINE SHOULD NOT DISPOIL THE LAND. IF THEY CAN'T DO IT RIGHT THEY SHOULDN'T MINE AT ALL.

Thank you, Edwin Fields
signature
Date 10/15/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Ryan Merchon
first name
last name

My address is BIG LeCount Ln
street

Billings MT
city or town
state

ryanmtvsnow@gmail.com
email

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: It is important for our future generations to have access to clean and healthy water. No matter who, no matter where.

Thank you,

Ryan Merchon
signature
10-1-2019
Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Diana Hilden

My address is 720 Judicial Ave

Billings MT

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

Please do permanent cleanup of Colstrip of the ash ponds. Don't leave the people of Colstrip with a water system that is unworkable.

Thank you, Diana Hilden
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Pauline Catchpole

My address is 236 Avenue F

Billings, MT

e-mail: pauline.shakti@gmail.com

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: The environment given to us by the grace of God and Mother Nature - it, being land and water, are not disposable commodities, let's treat what we are given with respect.

Thank you,

signature

Date 9/21/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is MARI von HOFFMANN

My address is P.O. Box 704

MISSOULA MT

e-mail mari.laxmi@gmail.com

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: The coal ash ponds need to be cleaned up! They’re leaking into the aquifer and surface water too!! The ash should have been stored in dry containment places, but ponds were cheaper for the companies. Make these companies clean up their mess!!

Thank you,

Mari von Hoffmann 17/Nov/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Water is such a precious resource, we simply cannot foul it without paying a terrible cost—one way or another. Cleaning up our mess is the only responsible thing to do.

Thank you, 

[Signature]

[Date]
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Stone it High & Dry

The Prestine Yellowstone River is down grade from the polluting Unity. Protect the Yellowstone Forever

Thank you,

[Signature]

Date: 10-13-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Kurt Sigerson

My address is 3208 Harness Loop

Helena, 59602

Viking60C@outlook.com

Phone: 406-431-3933

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Storage of coal ash high and dry is critical. Now is the time. Please get the polluted cleaned up now. An appropriate clean-up plan will create jobs for the future. Please do not pass the buck on the clean-up. A comprehensive plan is needed now.

Thank you,

Kurt Sigerson 11/19/19

Signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Emily Petrik

My address is 1101 E 6th Ave

Helena MT

emilyannpetrik@gmail.com 701-426-2041

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I am a teacher in Helena and I believe it is important to do things the right way for future generations. Please consider excavating rather than capping.

Also, I understand this would provide 700+ jobs for Coleship. A double win! or triple-it.

Thank you,

Emily Mark

signature

Date

11/20/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Laura Engelson
first name
last name
My address is 6153 Lazy Man Gulch
street
Helena MT
city or town state
lawalerosson@gmail.com email
406 431 4671 phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

Please move the coal ash from ponds to a site more suitable for storage and monitoring i.e. away from groundwater.

Thank you, Laura 11/20/19
signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is __________
first name

__________
last name

My address is __________
street

__________
city or town

__________
state

__________
email

__________
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

I would like to see heavy dry ash storage in

Coke Steel

Thank you,

__________
signature

__________
Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Josh Thaden
My address is 137 Morning Star Lane Miles City, MT
j.thaden@live.com 858-8325

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

I like the idea of closing these by the end of 2019 no matter what but it must be 'high and dry'!

Thank you, Josh Thaden

Date 10-28-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is CLARE WITCOMB
first name
last name

My address is 415 N. PLATI Box 1547
street

Red Lodge MT 59068
city or town
state

JAZZLOVE@GMAIL.COM
email

425-2308
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

High and Dry !!!!!!!!

Fix the Problem "Forever!"

Cleanup Creates Jobs

Enough Said !!!!

Thank you, CLARE WITCOMB 10-10-19
signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Dana Station

My address is 629 Beverly Ave

Missoula MT

Email jsatron@montana.com

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: As a daughter of Butte, please don't allow Colstrip to become another toxic waste dump. Note to store coal ash "High and Dry."

Thank you, Dana Station
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Bob Adams

My address is 1029 State St,

Helena MT 59601

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Pollution from coal ash ponds of units 1 + 2, Colstrip, should be addressed permanently by using "high and dry" techniques. More jobs, too, using this method of cleanup.

Thank you,

Bob Adams 10/11/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Gregg Wheeler
first name        last name

Wendy Wheeler

My address is 1716 Highland St
street

Helena
city or town

MT
state

email

phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

Montana's legacy of allowing the coal ash ponds at Colstrip to leak and pollute the groundwater needs to stop. DEQ must require a robust cleanup plan to dry and permanently store the ash waste rather than risk a short-term solution that likely would require additional mitigation in the future. The cleanup plan can also result in significant jobs to help Colstrip workers impacted by closures of the Colstrip power plants.

Thank you,

signature

Wendy F. Wheeler

Date
10/9/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Julie Helzer

My address is PO Box 2152
Red Lodge (59068) MT

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: NWE has reaped profits for years at Colstrip. They now have an obligation to store the toxic ash pond waste in high-dry conditions. They owe it to the community, workers, and shareholders.

Thank you,

Julie Helzer 10/10/2019
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Sara Toubman

My address is 940 Wilden Ave

Helena MT

email

phone 59601

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please do the Colstrip cleanup right i.e. store the coal ash ashyard dry and fix it so it does not continue to pollute. That way no taxpayers are NOT left w the bill.

Thank you, Sara Toubman 10/7/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Lisa Schmidt
first name
last name

My address is 564 Graham Ranch Lane
street

Conrad
city or town

MT
state

alandofgrass@brownsdbs.net
email

406-278-0159
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please implement a thorough and sustainable cleanup policy for the Colstrip ash ponds by requiring companies to store coal ash high and dry. This will protect groundwater, create jobs and prevent lead poisoning.

Thank you,
Lisa Schmidt 10-2-19
signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is ____________ LOIS ____________
first name

My address is ____________ #17 6TH AVE ____________
street

LAUREL ____________
city or town

LOIS@YAHOO.COM ____________ 406-694-3443 ____________
email phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I THINK THE "HIGH AND DRY" OPTION IS MUCH THE BETTER PLAN FOR LONG-TERM CLEAN-UP AND CLOSURE OF THE COAL ASH PONDS. QUALITY LONG-TERM IS MORE IMPORTANT THAN COST HERE.

Thank you ____________ ____________
signature Date

10/3/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please, this problem with the coal ash disposal has existed since plants opened in 1970's. Economic prosperity has been achieved. Now, DEQ's job is to require adequate clean-up to protect future. Cap in place allows continued groundwater pollution. Dewater and store this toxic stuff in high, safe location.

Thank you,

[Signature]

Date: 10/3/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Ms. Judie Frey
111 Shining Mountains Loop Rd.
Ennis, MT 59729-9158

My address is

________________________________________
city or town

jjfrey.3rivers.net

email

________________________________________
state

(406) 682-5448

phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Cap-in-place is no solution for coal ash. High and dry ash above the water table is the only SAFE long term solution. People in the area need clean uncontaminated H2O.

Thank you,

Judith G. Frey

signature

Date 10-1-2019
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Barbara Gulick
first name
last name

My address is 2018 12th St W.
street

Billings city or town MT 59102 state
bjgulick@bresnan.net 406-259-3622 email phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Pennywise, poundfoolish

would aptly describe the “cap in place”
strategy for cleanup of the coal ash ponds. Fix it right the first time
by storing ‘high and dry,’ creating
good long term jobs.

Thank you, Barbara J. Gulick 9/23/19 signature Date
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I would ask that it (being 1 & 2 closures) be done the "high & dry way" — a permanent cleanup which will create long term jobs. It is important cleanup is done right the first time.

Thank you,

Donna Quick 10-31-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Lindsay & Daniel Lande
first name last name

My address is 5357 Horn Rd
street

Missoula MT
city or town state

Lindsay ann kindelman@gmail.com (406) 546 5953
email phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please stop groundwater contamination! Please fix this permanently with high & dry clean-up. This creates jobs and a temporary solution is not enough! Thank you!

Thank you, I Kile 10/13/19
signature Date
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Comment Period Two: 1 &amp; 2 Pond Closure</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>My name is</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>My address is</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>email</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>phone</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:**

**Comment:** Please consider a **night dig permanent fix to prevent future leaks & contamination.**

<p>| |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Thank you,**

Nancy Stockman 9/24/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Nancy N. Erickson
first name
last name

My address is 3250 Patter Canyon Rd.
street
Missoula city or town
MT 59803 state

email
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please stop the leakage from coal ash ponds right now - a huge lined landfill.

Thank you,
Nancy N. Erickson 10-06-2019
signature
Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is CATHERINE MUDD

My address is 310 CUTLER ST

HELENA  MT 59601

cathymudd@gmail.com  406-459-0703

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: PLEASE DECIDE ON THE "HIGH & DRY" method for cleanup & closure plan of the Colstrip Ponds. Permanent cleanup creates jobs & permanently repairs the groundwater. This "high & dry" solution is the most responsible decision for our STATE.

Thank you,

Catherine Smith 10/10/19

signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Joan Kresich

My address is 410 S 6th St

Livingston, MT

joankresich@gmail.com

(510) 710-6922

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

* Store it "High & Dry"
  thus

* Fixing it Forever

* Permanent cleanup means jobs!

Thank you,

Joan Kresich 10/10/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Adrian Marx

My address is 380 Morrell G. Drive

Scoley Lake MT

city or town state

email Adrianmarx@qmail.com phone 406-677-4733

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Against - There is only one responsible and right choice to protect people, community & life giving waters - for us all.

STORE It High and Dry?

Thank you, Adrian Marx 1/28/2019

signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Nancy Standley

My address is 1509 10th St W

Billings MT

email

406-259-7403

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Require Talon to cleanup the Coal Ash Ponds at Colstrip correctly. Require high and dry storage in lined ponds! Create jobs in the cleanup process!

Thank you,

signature

Date
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Closure and clean up of the ash ponds is critical for the future of Colstrip and its residents. Ash should be taken to a place where it can be stored "high and dry."

Thank you,

[Signature]

Date: 10/24/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: It makes no sense to pollute one of our essential resources because one company could be gathered to do a job right. Let's do right & ensure Ponds 1 & 2 are stored high & dry and the fish is done right. Don't allow our water to be polluted.

Thank you.

Signature: Eric Schmidt
Date: 10/24/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Shelly Young
My address is 3444 Poly Dr.
Billings, MT

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I urge you to require Talen Energy and other RFPs to responsibly remediate the coal ash ponds at Coalstrip— to do it right for storage into perpetuity. Store it "high and dry" in lined and capped ponds.

Thank you,

Signature: [Signature]
Date: 10/24/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is MARYANNE MOTT
first name
last name

My address is 818 Tom Miner Creek Rd
street

EMBRANT
city or town
MT 59027
state

maryanne.cobbar.com 406 848 7773
email

phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Coal ash must not be left to leach into groundwater - it must be made high and dry on a permanent basis. This will protect our water and generate good jobs.

Thank you,

Maryanne Mott

signature

Date

10/18/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I'm a 5th generation Montanan and a realist. I support business and business interests, but we need to be smart and make decisions based on a long view, rather than near-term. The ash ponds have a risk of consuming Montana’s cleanup funds far into the future. Let’s please do it right the first time, store the ash ‘high and dry’, so we can count on no further pollution - AND provide jobs for our neighbors that need them.

Thank you,

Keintu Glen

10/31/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Michael Childers
first name
last name

My address is P.O. Box 728
street
Colstrip
city or town
MT state

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I am in favor of a ‘do it right the first time approach’ to clean up the ponds. Store it high and dry.

Thank you.

Michael Childers 10/23/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Kathryn Matlock
first name
last name

My address is 317 E 4th Ave
street

Big Timber
city or town
MT state

Krynmmatlock@gmail.com email (406)930-5796 phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Thanks for helping maintain a high living standard for all Montanans. Please adopt the Store it High and Dry clean up plan. Let's be proactive and stop groundwater contamination.

Thank you,

Signature: Blessings
Date: 10-14-19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: It seems to me that the permanent cleanup of “high & dry” creates jobs while permanently getting rid of the coal ash.

Thank you,
My name is Paula Childers

My address is P.O. Box 728

Colstrip MT

e-mail

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

I am in favor of a
doit right the first
time approach to clean
up the ponds.

Store it High and Dry

Thank you, Paula Childers 10/23/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Laurel Hanson

My address is 1035 Princeton Ave

Billings MT

e-mail laurel.hanson@yahoo.com

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: We need a permanent solution which requires coal ash be dewatered and stored in lined landfill above the water table.

Thank you.

Signature: Laurel Hanson Date: 10-2-19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: It is so important to clean up Colestrip with a long-term view. Please insist on "High & Dry"... a permanent solution. It also creates good jobs. Please protect MT and taxpayers.

Thank you,

Diane W. Bayuk 9-30-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Paula Berg

My address is 220 S. 27th St

Billings, MT

e-mail: paula@northernplains.org

phone: 248.1154

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I support a permanent clean-up solution that removes toxic materials from the ash ponds & stores them away from groundwater. The companies who made the mess should have to pay to clean it up.

Thank you,

signature 11-22-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Kurt Sigerson
first name
last name

My address is 3208 Harness Loop
street

Helena, 59602
city or town
MT
state

viking60c.outlook.com
email

406-431-3133
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Storage of coal ash high and dry is critical. Now is the time. Please get the pollution cleaned up now. An appropriate clean-up plan will create jobs for the future. Please do not pass the buck on the clean-up. A comprehensive plan is needed now.

Thank you,

Kurt Sigerson
signature

Date: 11/19/11
My name is Carolyn Taylor

My address is 666 Sprandel St.

Miles City, MT

carlyntaylor31@yahoo.com

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Dear DEQ - Wake up - be responsible. Clean up appropriately. You will be held accountable!
The Company needs to be responsible. I don't deal with liars! START USING THE UNDERDRAIN!

Thank you, Dr. Carolyn Taylor 10/26/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Liz Ametsbichler
first name

My address is 2405 Raymond Ave.
street

Missoula
city or town

MT
state

liz.ametsbichler@gmail.com
email

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I am deeply concerned about the cleanup of the coal ponds. Montana has been the victim of extractive corporations that have left environmental disasters behind at the expense of Montana citizens. The units at Colstrip are already beyond their lifespan and have been contaminating the groundwater for decades. Responsible cleanup of the ponds will improve the quality of life for residents and guarantee a better future for them, and will create jobs— a win-win situation. Please do the right thing and hold the corporations accountable. As a Montana native, I thank you for making the well-being of Montanans a priority.

Thank you,

signature

Date

11-02-2019
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Marilyn Thaden

My address is 137 Morning Star Ln

Miles City, MT

m.thaden@hotmail.com, (406) 853-165

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Cleanup HAS to be done, companies who benefitted to the detriment of landowners & generations on-going need to be held responsible. NO MORE BERKLEY PITS!

Thank you, Marilyn J Thaden 10/28/19
My name is Willy Van Straaten
My address is 12500 Big Davis Street
3-forks MT 285-0031
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:
Comment:
Northwest energy needs to pay for clean-up, not taxpayers.
Thank you, Willy Van Straaten 10-3-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Laura Morris
My address is 4021 O'Leary St
Missoula, MT 59808
laromor48@gmail.com 406-702-9586

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please make the Colstrip mining and power companies responsible for cleaning up and preventing further contamination from their coal ash ponds. It should not be up to the taxpayers to clean up their mess. They should have no right to endanger water, air, and soil vital to surrounding people, wildlife, and business. They need to eliminate all ability of these ponds to leach into the ground water—now and forever into the future.

Thank you, Laura Morris 10/03/2019

Signature Date
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Montanans should not be on the hook to clean up after corporations that reap the benefits. Dry out the coal ash and store above the water line. This would keep those with the qualifications employed! A win-win.

Thank you,

Virjeana Brown

10/3/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Kindergarten is: Clean up your own "messes"! Obviously there is a coal ash pond "mess" which needs to be correctly and completely cleaned up once and for all by the Company which caused the "mess" while profiting from it. That's who is responsible to pay for a good job to clean it up, not the public, taxpayer, or added fuel bills. The "Company" needs to be held accountable!

Thank you,

Linda M. Weeks
Oct 2, 2019
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Energy companies need to acknowledge the full cost of their product and not push clean up costs on to the tax payers. Luckily, total permanent clean up paid for by the responsible parties.

Thank you.

Karl Schmiedeskamp 9/28/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

Power co should pay for clean-up

Thank you,

Wes James 9/30/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Anne Black
first name

My address is 3285 Ravenwood Lane
street

Missoula MT
city or town
state

email

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: DEQ needs to ensure that the proper action is taken, when you have a rotten tooth, the Dentist will do a root canal not just put a cap on it. You pay for it if it hurts, but it's much healthier, cheaper and more effective than the alternative. Taking Co's need to pay for this, not wait for the Fed's to bail themself - as we have to the Aracanda Ponds.

Thank you, Anne Black 10/23/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Richard Newman
first name

last name

My address is 204 N. Black Av
street

Bozeman city or town

MT state

solarfeller@gmail.com email

406-580-3763 phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: DO IT RIGHT.

DO NOT ALLOW COAL CO’S TO RIP OFF OUR RANCHERS! TELL THEM TO CLEAN UP THEIR MESSES NOW!!

Thank you, Richard Newman 10/1/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Jean Dahlman

My address is 3335 Old Hwy 10 Road

Forsyth MT

email Lemire.Dahlman@RangeCubed.net

phone (301) 9921

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: The Dahlman Ranch is 25 miles north of Colstrip (as Cheyenne Stics).

We rely on our spring-filled creek (Wildcat) to water our cows. Our require water from the Wells for our drinking water. Clean up those ash ponds do it right.

Thank you,

Jean Dahlman

signature

Date 10/28/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: **We can’t let one more corporation walk away from a Montana community to deal with the mess, workers to deal with the loss, and taxpayers to pay the cost.**

Thank you, Maggie Gordon 11-22-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Bob Thaden
My address is 157 Morning Star Ln
Miles City, MT

Email: BMTHADEN@MIDRIVERS.COM
Phone: 406-453-1028

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Strongest possible cleanup effort should be used on the years of coal ash. Please pursue strongest possible effort which will create many new temporary jobs.

Thank you,

[Signature] 06/24/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Linda Helding
first name
last name

My address is 316 B Inez
street

Missoula
city or town
MT
state

Helding64@gmail
email
406.241.4261
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Jobs in Montana – good

Pay no industrial jobs are now available in Montana throughout.

Clean of coal ash pollution.

Let’s make Montana THE beautiful Big Sky State again.

Thank you. Linda Helding 10/2/19

signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Terry Minnow
My address is 502 lower Valley Rd
Boulder MT
email bullheadmeaol.com
phone 225-4397

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please protect beautiful eastern MT & her people. Create jobs by requiring a permanent clean up. I’m disappointed Montana has let the ponds leak for years without requiring a fix. Please fix it now.

Thank you, signature Date

Dy Lindstrom 6/4/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Max Machick

My address is 124 Heather Lane

Glasgow MT

deer Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: We must insist the workers in Colstrip get busy on the cleanup. They are there and will need jobs when the plants close.

Thank you, Danny Machick 30 Oct 2019
My name is Ronis Bollinger

My address is 203 West Church Street
Absekkee, MT

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: START hiring people to clean up this mess. Do it the right way not the half-assed way.
The people of Montana pay you and depend on you to do the job right. Get going please!

Thank you
Ronis Bollinger 10/13/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Cleanup of the Coal Strip
Ashpounds provides jobs & economic benefits for the community & its citizens. Talen & NW Energy must be required to contain the waste into perpetuity.

We have too many examples of destruction left by corporations who have used and abused our resources.

It is the obligation of the DEQ & the State of Montana to force a realistic clean-up plan.

Thank you,

John D. Grove 10/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Coal is dirty, expensive & no longer viable for the future of our planet. The coal ash ponds leak 50,000 gals of polluted water into the groundwater. Please store it high & dry. Permanent clean-up creates jobs needed in Colstrip. Think of the people living in Colstrip as your family. You wouldn't want your family living with this contaminated groundwater. Please do the right thing for the health of the planet.

Thank you,

Signature

Date 30 Sep 19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Austin Alley

My address is 517 South Jordan

Miles City, MT

Phone: 406-696-4702

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: It's a necessary move now. Also the jobs it creates.

"2 liners" in layers

Same or other comment (cliche)

"Think of complete final solution"

LITERAL, METAPHORICAL

Thank you, Austin Alley 10-28-19

Signature
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Gregg Siger

My address is 3120 Maple

B114

city or town Billings

state MT

e-mail gr13y2803@emn

phone (406) 840-1

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please care for

Thank you,

signature Date
ED Gulick

3015 10th Ave. N.

BILLINGS, MT 59101

egulick@bresnan.net (406) 698-2747

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

SAME COMMENTS

As for 3/4

Thank you, [Signature] 9/21/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

\[\text{diffo}\]

Thank you, Kate Mrqusic 10/1/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Linda Gillison
My address is 524 S. 2nd St. West
Missoula, MT 59801
1gillison@bresnan.net 406-546-2356

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

must approve a clean-up plan which protects clean water for the future thru "high dry" mediation AND WHICH provides good jobs at Coldtrip while the "city" moves "HIGH + DRY - hot hide x forget"

Thank you,

Linda W. Hellesen 10/30/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Also the possibility of mixing waste with municipal sewage for potting soil, fertilizer, or other possibilities!!!

Also possible use of wind and solar power to augment the operation of the plant and use commercially when coal runs out. 10/1/19

Thank you,

Dwight E. Vannatter
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

Please - Some Approach Applies.
High Dry. Thanks

Thank you,
[Signature]

Date: 10/5/19
Comment Period One: 3 & 4 Pond Closure

My name is Alex Cunha
My address is 322 S 29th St.
City or Town Billings
State MT
Email alexa@northernplains.org
Phone 707-616-3580

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: DEQ must store all coal ash high, dry, & lined. Excavate SOEP/STEP now so future ratepayers don't have to pay for the same job twice. Do this right for us.

Thank you,

Signature: Alex Cunha
Date: 10/25/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is ____________________________  ____________________________
                        first name                         last name

My address is _________________________________________________________
                 street

                       ____________________________  ____________________________
                  city or town                         state

                       ____________________________
                  email

                       ____________________________
                  phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

_____________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________

Thank you, ___________________________________________________________
                  signature                                          Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Claire Overholt
first name
last name

My address is 201 S 30th St, Apt 201
street

Billings MT
city or town state

claireliz75@yahoo.com 970-310-5747
e-mail phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I have lived in eastern Montana since I graduated college in 2014.

the town help transition

Thank you,

signature Date
Sara Edinberg,
Waste Management and Remediation Division
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901
November 24, 2019

or to DEQColstrip@mt.gov

RE: Colstrip Waste Water

I have been a resident of Colstrip, MT since 1973. I was raised here, and have continued living here after I graduated from Colstrip High School.

I am concerned what will happen in the years to come. I know that there have been issues with the water in Colstrip... Drinking water as well as groundwater leaking over the years.

My concern, is who is going to pay the cost for all of the cleanup and control of future water leaking issues. As the power plants are being phased out, and shut down, it appears that the companies who have been involved in all of the power plants construction, and operation, are all wanting to bail out of the state and leave us here to deal with the existing environment.

It is disturbing that these corporations were all great when the generation of these plants was generating big money for these corporations, but now they are wanting to jump ship and leave the residents and taxpayers to figure out how to fix the problems with our water. “Take the money and Run”

This is not a new discovery, the groundwater leaking has been a known fact for several years. I as a resident and taxpayer of Colstrip, do not feel I should have to foot the bill to correct this problem.

I feel the corporations who benefited largely from our Colstrip Operations, should be held responsible for the situation that has been created. These corporations, need to be assisting our community with the cost of addressing and correcting the problem. This cost should not be a burden to the citizens and taxpayers of our town or our state.

Thank you for your time and understanding of our concerns.

Sincerely,

Shelly Holum
PO Box 662
Colstrip, MT 59323

RECEIVED
DEC 3 2019
Dept. of Environmental Quality Remediation Division
Montana DEQ  
Attn: Sara Edinberg, Hydrogeologist  
Waste Management and Remediation Bureau  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

Re: Talen Energy’s “Units 1 & 2 Revised Remedy Evaluation Report, Part 1”

Dear Ms. Edinberg:

I am responding to your request for public comments on the referenced report, addressing the issue of stopping the leakage of the Colstrip Units 1 & 2 ash ponds and cleaning the contamination from the surrounding groundwater.

To briefly introduce myself, I have been a resident and property owner in Colstrip for nearly 40 years, having retired from Western Energy Company in 2014 as one of the Mine Engineering Staff. In years past at the height of construction here, I chaired the Colstrip Townsite Expansion Property Owners’ Association and the Architectural Review Commission. I currently serve on the Innovation and Technology Think Tank (IT3) board, a group of Colstrip people who are seeking solutions for the future wellbeing of this city.

My comment is —

As with any engineered solution, there remains an unknown degree of risk of failure of the proposed remedy posed in the referenced Report. My case in point is the failure of the originally engineered, approved and installed clay liners which were intended to stop the seepage of the waste ash slurry contaminates, according to the “best engineering practices” of the times (1970’s?). The proposed remedy calls for capping the existing ponds, capturing the groundwater and cleaning the contamination therefrom. But, in reality, what is the risk of failure of this scheme?

I also observed that the report notes the monitored, lateral movement of the contaminated shallow groundwater layer and does not provide data for the depths of seepage of the plume(s) of the contaminates. Is there any data available on this vertical seepage component?

I ask these questions in concern for the looming water supply crisis facing the City of Colstrip, resulting from the accelerated power plant closure schedules. Earlier this year, I addressed the pending water supply issue in several papers that I presented to the City of Colstrip and Rosebud County. Very briefly, the current raw water supply system is owned and operated by the Colstrip Project partnership of companies. It is sized to supply about 5 billion gallons of...
water per year from the Yellowstone River to the Colstrip Surge Pond (Castle Rock Lake) for consumption by the plants, of which about 200 million gallons is supplied to the City under a transportation agreement. Considering the magnitude of this system, there is little chance, as I estimated and reported in said papers, that the City will be able to operate and maintain it after the plants are idled, without considerable financial support. Therefore, in response to the impending water crisis and as reported by Mayor John Williams at the November 25 SEMDC (Southeastern Montana Development Corporation) public meeting, “the City has contracted an Engineer to study alternatives for our future water supply” – one option potentially being to develop a new groundwater-based supply system.

As you can surmise, groundwater contamination remediation could become a more vital issue for the survival of Colstrip. This will depend on future developments and engineering feasibility studies. Certainly, the accelerated plant closure schedule has intensified the need for prompt, sound engineering solutions for both water issues – groundwater contamination remediation and developing a viable water source for the City of Colstrip. The outcome of these efforts will determine our future existence here.

Thank you for your attention to my concerns. I remain available for further discussion at your convenience.

Kind regards,

Kind regards,

Dan Negethon

Home: 406-748-4347

Cell: 406-740-0992
December 12, 2019

Montana DEQ
Attn: Sara Edinberg
Box 200901
Helena, MT  59620-0901

Subj: Colstrip Power Units 1 & 2 Coal Ash Disposal

I have lived in Forsyth, MT since 1979; presently serve as mayor of the City of Forsyth; serve as a member of the Forsyth Area Chamber of Commerce & Agriculture; board member of the SouthEastern Montana Development Corporation and the Rosebud County City/County Planning Board.

I encourage DEQ to approve a plan for the removal of the coal ash and the transportation of the coal ash to a new, appropriately built and maintained landfill site.

The City of Forsyth is a neighbor to the City of Colstrip, the community members and the surrounding farmers/ranchers. There is concern with the accumulation of toxic minerals that have leached into ground water and there is a need to stop this ongoing process.

The “removal” option provides the best long-term opportunity to solve the problem and provide high paying jobs for many of the employees that may be displaced by the closure of the power plants.

I encourage DEQ to approve a plan for the removal of the coal ash and the transportation of the coal ash to a new, appropriately built and maintained landfill site.

Respectfully,

Dennis Kopitzke
#1 Poplar Place, Box 1266
Forsyth, MT  59327
406-346-1488
djk_7491@rangeweb.net
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Jim Posewitz
first name
last name

My address is 219 Vauzer ST
street
Helena
city or town
MT
state

jim.posewitz@bresnail.net
email
(406) 449-2795
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT, Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Dear Shaun, see comments made re: ponds 3 & 4. The point again is to store the toxic stuff high, dry & permanent. Perpetual treatment is not an option - one Berkeley Pit is too many!

Thank you.

James G. Posewitz
signature
Date 11/21/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is DAVID Omen

My address is 259 NUBIAS PL

BILLINGS MT

PerfectGraced Hotmail.com

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: we are all about making more natural thing
an example is the corporate tax break
it is time for us to protect mother Earth

Thank you,

David Omen 10-1-19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Let's do this right next pond first. We need to do it right. We've been looking at these ponds since 1941. I live 2.5 miles North of the pipeline on Arndts Creek. Over time the water has gotten worse. Cattle use to drink out of the creek, but now walk across the water and drink out of water tank from well water, which is not the best. Let's fight these pond first! We used to have frogs and turtles in the creek and some trash fish, but no longer. They have disappeared.

Thank you, Leo R. DeCock 10-02-19
My name is Bryan Shoovers

My address is 210 S. California Street

Helena MT

email shoelace848@gmail.com

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

Each minute 367 gallons of polluted water leaks from the ponds, polluting the local aquifer. These ponds need to be drained and toxic soil removed.

Thank you,

Brian Shoovers

signature

Date 10/9/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Gary & Judy Matson

My address is PO Box 308

Milltown MT 59851

gjmatsen@montana.com

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: In the early 1970s we opposed the building of Colstrip 3 & 4, in public programs in Missoula. One reason was leakage from ash ponds. A Montana Power engineer objected, saying that concern was "groundless." Please remove the ash, rewater, and store "high and dry."

Thank you,

By: Judy Matson 10/5/19

Signature
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is DAVID QMEN
first name last name

My address is 259 NUBIA IS PL
street
BILLINGS MT
city or town state
PERFECT GRACE HOTMAIL.COM
email phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: IN OUR DRY AND WINDY MONTANA CLIMATE I WANT A GOOD PLAN TO STOP WIND EROSION OF COAL ASH

Thank you, David QMEN 10-24-19
signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Connie Keogh
first name

My address is 211 Eddy Ave.
street

Missoula city or town
MT state

conniekeogh33@gmail.com email 406-298-0985 phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Thank you in advance from all Montana's and those directly affected by the decision you make concerning a long-term cleanup and closure plan for Colstrip 1 & 2. Please permanently store the coal ash, high and dry. It is time to fit this environmental hazard forever. A cleanup that permanently repairs ground water will create many jobs. The existence of real good paying jobs.

Thank you, Connie Keogh signature 10/20/19 Date
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: At a site visit to the 1 + 2 disposal ponds, it was disclosed that vegetation growing on the capped pond tested for elevated levels of boron. To eliminate this type of concern the ash should be removed and covered.

Thank you,

[Signature]

Date
My name is Martha Adkins
My address is 1076 Hwy 89 South
Qardiner Montana
email
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: only at night and for naps
shield goes on for a week
2:00 do drops 5 min apart Today
4 Good water is as important as
6 good eyesight after a
8 cataract operation

Thank you, Martha Weaver Adkins
signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Bill Decourt
My address is 96 Carbon Circle
Red Lodge, MT
email bill.decourt@gmail.com
phone 630-750-1040

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: As a retired chemist and a former resident of Mobile, AL, a community ravaged by coal ash contamination, I am aware of the dangers of coal ash. No coal ash storage is better, but mid-storage is a disaster.

Thank you, Bill Decourt
signature Sept 21, 2019
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Kylee Grane

My address is 242 Ave D

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: please clean up and close cooling ash ponds. Save our water and environment.

Thank you,

Kylee A. Grane 9/12/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Robert Lindstrom

My address is 535 Lakeview Rd

West Yellowstone, MT

Email: Blindstrom@WYellowstone.com

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Thank you for doing your job! Coal pollution is killing the atmosphere!

Thank you,

Signature: [signature]

Date: 10/01/2019
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: What will we leave our grandchildren?

Thank you,

Signature 9/30/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Claudia S. Brown
first name
last name
My address is 520 Dearborn
street
Missoula
city or town
MT
state
c4775@icloud.com
email

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

I want reassurance that DEQ is not in the pockets of NW Energy. Store the Colstrip ash ponds High And Dry!

Fix the groundwater permanently!

Thank you,
Claudia S. Brown
signature

Date
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Here's my vote for a long-term cleanup of the ponds & culvert. If you don't, we all lose.

Thank you,

Signature

Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Elizabeth Vanderholt

My address is 1003 Victory Ave

Billings MT 59105

evo32@charter.net 245-5218

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please remove the coal ash that has been contaminating our water! Fix the problem permanently so life can go forward in the future without the constant mission roulette quality we don't enjoy now.

Thank you, Elizabeth Vanderholt 9/30/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Jaye Swigg Pettite
first name
last name

My address is 3030 Glenor Ave
street

Billings MT 02
city or town state

(406) 655-9285
email phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Do the right thing for MT & it's future. Clean up the mess!!! MT should not become a toxic wasteland for our kids, pets, wildlife. We have a responsibility to take care of our home-MT!!

Thank you,

signature Date

2/11/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I am a 77 year old resident of Montana. I am a grandmother who cares deeply about our environment. We need to ensure that Colstrip is cleaned up. This is an enormous job that will take many years and also create jobs as the mine closes. We must protect the aquifer. Please ensure that coal ash is stored high and dry. Catriona Simms

Thank you,
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is  Ita Killeen  
first name  last name

My address is  1504 60 3rd Ave  
street

Bozeman  MT  
city or town  state

e:killeen@bridgegeoplan.com  
email  phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Permanent high & dry cleanup of Colstrip Ash ponds will secure the water quality of local ranches & communities. The companies that have profited from mining Colstrip should pay for this clean up.

Thank you,  Ita Killeen  
signature  Date  11/7/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is _______________  Becky Piske
first name  last name

My address is  303 State
street

city or town  state

e-mail  phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please just clean up this mess for good. It is time to clean up the ash ponds of Colestrip.

Thank you,  Becky Piske  4/18/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is JENNIFER ROHRER

My address is 5448 HWY 83 N

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Permanent Clean up

Creates jobs - Fix it forever,

Store it high and dry

Thank you,
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is CURT & SANDY HANLEY
first name
last name
My address is 2405 GRANITE
street
BILLINGS MT
city or town state
CURTSANDYH@GMAIL.COM (656) 1569
email phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: LET'S FIX THE PROBLEM NOW & FOREVER. DRY IT OUT & STORE IN LINED LANDFILL - NO "CAP IN PLACE!" LOTS OF JOBS HERE!

Thank you Sandy Haney
signature Date

Curtis B. Haney
My name is Charles Bertsch
My address is 35679 Memory Lane, Polson, MT
email: cbertscho@gmail.com, phone: 406-883-2177

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:
Store it High and Dry
Fix it Forever
Make permanent cleanup and create jobs.

Thank you, Charles Bertsch 10.2.19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Steven D. McArthur
first name
last name
My address is 3406 W. Central Ave.
street
Missoula
city or town
MT.
state
Stevenmcarthur@aol.com
email
406-370-4653
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I want to comment cleanup that will restore groundwater and create good jobs for the local people here in Montana!

We have a Constitutional Right to a Clean Environment! Do the right thing.

Thank you, Steven D. McArthur
signature
Date 9/30/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Margaret Beeson
first name
last name

My address is 322 Yellowstone Ave
street
Billings city or town MT 59101 state
wbeeson@grandnet.com email

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: There is no question that this pond needs to go & be handled properly for all generations to come.

Thank you,

signature 12/1/17 Date
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I totally support Northern Plains proposals to clean up the coal ash ponds. It should be done the right way to protect ground water in the area. I don’t think that I can improve on J.P. Bradley’s remark: “You can’t cap a rotten tooth; it needs a root canal.”

As a grandfather who has paid taxes for decades, I want more sustainable solutions. I have paid for too much for the perpetual pollution in our state, beginning as Zortman.

Thank you,

Thomas Graff
824 Beverly Ave
Missoula, MT 59801

t name

graffitic @bigskey.net
email
406.543.3305
phone

city or town
state

signature
Date
10/28/2019
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Earleen Stanwalty

My address is 117 Custer Ave

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Fix it forever. Don't risk further pollution of the groundwater. Permanent clean up created jobs.

Thank you Earleen Stanwalty 10-24-19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Anne Greene
first name
last name

My address is 303 Tremont St.
street

MISSOURI
city or town

MT
state

annegreenester at Gmail.com 406-721-1941
email
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Please do the right thing and cleanup the coal ash ponds at Colestrip so they are permanently prevented from polluting the surroundings. Cap-in-place is NOT a good option.

Thank you, Anne Greene 23 Oct 19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment:

Coal ash storage must be permanent to prevent future contamination.

Thank you,

John M. Herbert
10/10/19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: *Priority: Farming/Ranching

I would like to see permanent cleanup.
I want my Nation clean.

Think Jobs!

Thank you,

Signature: [Signature]
Date: 10/1/19
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is JACQUELINE CRANDALL
first name
last name

My address is 78 TURNER RD
street

ROBERTS
city or town
MT
state

LUACO.WALT@GMAIL.COM
email
406.446.3996
phone

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: Store it High and Dry
Fix it Forever Permanent
Clean up creates jobs.
MAKE SURE THE COAL COMPANIES PAY FOR IT!!

Thank you.

Jacqueline Crandall 10/1/19
signature Date
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is Lana Sangmeister
My address is 3514 Stanley Coulee Way

city or town Nye
state MT
date 10-1-19

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: As a fellow MT landowner, having grown up with industrial waste, I know how important it is to completely clean up the ash pond contamination for all time. Stop the decades long contamination!

Thank you,

Lana Sangmeister
Comment Period Two: 1 & 2 Pond Closure

My name is William M. Geer

My address is 6135 Delaraka Dr

Lolo MT 59847

whgeer@bridgemail.com (406) 396-0909

Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: I'm a retired fish & wildlife biologist with long experience in water pollution, which is harmful to fish & wildlife. The original cap-in-place of the ash pond failed in 1997, and the pollution risks to wildlife, cattle, and humans is high and severe. We must move the coal ash to a "high & dry" place. The ash pond removal project will create more and better jobs for Colstrip workers than the temporary cap-in-place fix.

Thank you, William Geer 10-23-19
Dear Shaun McGrath, MT. Dept. of Environmental Quality:

Comment: As a grand mother, I know the importance of clean water and healthy environments. The cop in place "solution" failed in 1997. Why repeat that bad idea. Other states have dealt with their coal ash problems in a responsible way providing a long term solution. Why can’t Montana do this?

Thank you,

Jo Grathouse

10/28/19
December 13, 2019

Submitted electronically to DEOColstrip@mt.gov and sedinberg@mt.gov

Sara Edinberg  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620

Ms. Edinberg,

On behalf of the Northern Cheyenne Tribe, I submit the following comments to the Montana Department of Environmental Quality (“DEQ”) in response to the October 2019 Revised Remedy Evaluation Report (“RER”) Part I for the Units 1&2 ponds at Colstrip, which was submitted to DEQ by Talen Energy.

Introduction

The Northern Cheyenne Tribe (“Tribe”) is a federally recognized Indian tribe that occupies the Northern Cheyenne Reservation (“Reservation”), which encompasses over 444,000 acres of land in southeastern Montana. The Units 1&2 ponds are in close proximity – about 14 miles – to the northern boundary of the Reservation and are within the ancestral territory of the Northern Cheyenne people. Additionally, there is a sizable Tribal-member population in the town of Colstrip and nearby areas. As the Colstrip population decreases with the closure of the plant and, consequently, Colstrip property values decrease, the Tribe expects more of its membership to relocate to Colstrip given the paucity of inadequate housing stock on our Reservation.

As expressed in the attached Tribal Council Resolution DOI-054 (2019), the Tribe hereby urges DEQ to:

- take strong measures to protect against environmental harm from the Units 1&2 ponds including removal of the coal ash, recycling any usable coal ash, and storing the remainder in a properly lined landfill; and
- require that Talen and its contractors implement a Northern Cheyenne preference when hiring for the above-referenced work.

The Tribe also requests that the RER include financial assurance to cover the costs of long-term and likely perpetual pumping, including, for instance, through the endowment of a trust fund.

LITTLE WOLF AND MORNING STAR – Out of defeat and exile they led us back to Montana and won our Cheyenne homeland that we will keep forever.
In support of these requests, we explain below: (1) the important place of water in the Tribe’s culture; (2) the many efforts that the Tribe has undertaken to avoid or limit the environmental and socioeconomical impacts of the Colstrip plant, including employment preference contracts and environmental protections; and (3) why the RER put forth by Talen Energy is inadequate.

In this letter, we cite The Northern Cheyenne Tribe and its Reservation (2002), which is a report of the Tribe that was provided to the United States Bureau of Land Management and Montana Department of Natural Resources and Conservation to protect against impacts on water and other resources that could have been impacted by then-proposed large-scale coal bed methane development in southeastern Montana. With this letter, we are providing a copy of that report, which is an important resource we encourage DEQ to rely upon in granting the Tribe’s above requests. Also, we incorporate by reference the technical analysis and findings prepared by KirK Engineering & Natural Resources, Inc. and strongly encourage that they be given substantial consideration and weight.

Water is Central to the Northern Cheyenne

According to Cheyenne cosmology all things are related. People, land, water, animals as well as rocks, minerals and fossils all have a spiritual connection to each other. As a result, the Northern Cheyenne use the term cultural site to include water resources, plant gathering areas, hunting areas, as well as mineral (paint) and fossil sources.

To understand the cultural importance of natural resources to the Northern Cheyenne, one must first understand the Cheyenne cosmology. To review the basic Cheyenne cosmology (discussed in Chapter 2 of The Northern Cheyenne Tribe and its Reservation), Maheo, the epitome of energy and spirituality, is contrasted with Heesto, the symbol of substance and matter. Both are sacred and necessary for the continuation of the universe. Maleness and zenith, the highest point in the universe, are associated with Maheo just as femaleness and nadir, the lowest point in the universe, are associated with Heesto. (The term Heh’voom is used when referring to the animate female principle.) These concepts are understood to be complimentary and balanced in the universe. At the same time that aspects of the Maheo, like the Sun, grandfather to the Cheyenne, are associated with zenith, he is also understood to be everywhere. He is the creative expression of the universe and the spiritual essence of the universe. When the Maheo interacts with the earth (grandmother) – Heh’voom they bring about all life. The below figure illustrates the basic structure of the universe.

---

1 This Section relies heavily on Section III of Chapter 7 of The Northern Cheyenne Tribe and its Reservation (2002).
Between these two points there are several levels or spaces. These are the Blue-Sky Space (Otah’ta’voom), the Nearer-Sky Space (Novah’voom), the Atmosphere (Tax’tah’voom), the Earth-Surface Dome (Matah’voom) and Deep Earth (Nah’stoh’voom). The Blue-Sky Space contains the sacred manifestations of the Maheo, including the sun (grandfather), the night sun (the moon [mother]) and the Milky Way, which is the road to the land of the dead. The stars in the Blue-Sky Space are brothers and sisters of the Cheyenne. Those creatures, primarily the Great Birds (eagles, hawks, dragonflies and butterflies), that mediate between man and the sacred forces of the Blue-Sky Space, inhabit the Nearer-Sky Space. Nearer-Sky Space contains dust devils, clouds, birds, tornadoes and high places like mountaintops. Some Northern Cheyenne refer to mountain tops and hills as “earthlodges.” These are natural landscape features that are “power points” or favored locations for fasting, praying and making offerings. They are favored because they are associated with increasing spirituality. “Earthlodges” reach into the Setovoom where the mediators (eagles, hawks, dragonflies, butterflies) between Maheo and humans live.

The Atmosphere is in direct contact with the Earth-Surface Dome. This is the area in which dust rises, objects can be thrown, and insects fly. The Earth-Surface Dome is animate and extends to the roots of the prairie grasses. It is characterized by living things that are
useful to humans who derive their material and spiritual existence from this environmental setting.

The below figure illustrates the basic cosmological qualities of visible topographic features in the Earth-Surface Dome. First, the earth’s surface is animate. Hills contain the spirits of animals and people waiting to be reborn. Extinct species are those that Maheo does not allow to be reborn. The present increasing rate of extinction of species is explained by the fact that Maheo is withholding the animals in order to protect them from the destruction caused by the actions of industrial development. Exposed cliffs or badlands are Deep Earth and are inanimate. Mountain tops and other high places are places of increasing spirituality because they reach the realm of Nearer-Sky Space. Surface water is alive, ever moving, and has spiritual qualities. Springs are the homes of spirits. Offerings are commonly left at springs today. For example, there is one on the divide between Birney and Lame Deer that the Birney people leave offerings at and clean up when it is polluted by vandalism. There are three varieties of spirits that live in springs. The first have short brown hair/fur, like prairie dogs. The second type is white and furry. They do not want to associate with anyone. Thunder always strikes around them. People should not frequent springs associated with these spirits. The third type is black. These spirits/animals come out to pay their respects when ceremonies are held.

Deep Earth is dead and sterile earth; it is basically all substance and, hence, most female. It is visible to man in cliffs and in the badlands. It is characterized by being spiritually inert. Animals that live in caves and burrow into dead earth (such as bears and badgers) are considered female. While badgers and bears are important as symbols of the Deep Earth, buffaloes receive the most attention in all sorts of Cheyenne ceremonies and religious thought. Buffaloes live in great caves under the surface and they present themselves to be killed whenever Maheo wants to bless the Cheyenne. The Sacred Buffalo Hat embodies the female principle as it relates to buffaloes.

Water systems have always played a central role in Tribal lifeways and beliefs, to the
Springs, rivers, swamps and ground water are living beings with spirits. According to the 2001 Northern Cheyenne Reservation Survey on Traditional Economy and Subsistence, over 97% of the people believe that springs have spiritual value. Furthermore, over 90% recognize that water is very important to their social, economic and spiritual way of life. As one elder stated, “The conceptual meaning of water to us would be the physical manifestation of the essence of life, of life itself, the fabric of life.” And, the Sacred Buffalo Hat “came to us out of the waters.”

The Northern Cheyenne communicate with these spirits. The ongoing traditional cultural importance of these water locations can be seen in the respect shown to these locations and in the offerings made at these locations. Routine archaeological surveys on the Reservation always consider water sources relative to the survey boundaries. For example, when U.S. 212 was widened east of Lame Deer, a survey documented the ongoing use of three springs for traditional cultural purposes and design changes were made to avoid affecting these areas.

The traditional water drum is still used by the members of the Native American Church. As one elder stated, “When you take those drums apart after ceremonial use, the breath of life comes out of them.” Water drums must be taken apart after every ceremony. The water must be disposed of in a ritually specific fashion. Water is also associated with the turtle. The turtle is good to eat and is always associated with ceremonies. Some of the sweat lodges are patterned after the turtle and its longevity. These sweats are made for long life.

The Northern Cheyenne recognize the spiritual qualities of ground water. There are special prayers for digging wells. Ground water represents the quiet nature of the earth. It should not be disturbed. Swamps are filled with many spirits and may be dangerous due to the accumulation of power at these localities.

In addition to the major efforts detailed in the next section below, the Northern Cheyenne government has taken many actions to protect water on and under the Reservation on a daily, monthly and yearly basis through its governmental programs, most prominently its environmental departments. This includes surveys of wetlands and springs, and adoption and enforcement of water and solid waste codes.

Tribal Efforts to Maintain its Homeland and Surrounding Natural Environment Since Settlers Arrived

Beginning in the early 1800s, large numbers of settlers and gold seekers began to move into southeast Montana. These early settlers and miners brought with them diseases that ravaged large numbers of Cheyenne people. They also brought European cattle, which began to disrupt the grazing and migration patterns of the buffalo, which the Northern Cheyenne relied on for subsistence and ceremonial purposes. These encroachments, which did not respect the territorial and cultural interests of the Cheyenne and other Indian people, resulted in decades of war. The Northern Cheyenne Tribe and Its Reservation at 2-12 (Apr. 2002).
In the mid-1800s, there were numerous attempts to remove the Northern Cheyenne from their homeland near the Tongue River and relocate them to other parts of the west. For example, the 1851 Treaty of Fort Laramie anticipated the removal of the Cheyenne to lands south of the North Platte River; however, following treaty execution, many Northern Cheyenne people continued to live and hunt in their traditional homeland, leading to escalating conflict and violence in the 1850s. In 1861, the U.S. government again attempted to relocate the Northern Cheyenne to the south, but the Northern Cheyenne refused to abandon their traditional hunting grounds and continued to resist the commercial and military intrusions into their territories. Conflict continued into the 1870s, as the U.S. military sought to open the Cheyenne lands to settlers and gold miners, and the Northern Cheyenne sought to protect their lands and traditions from encroachment. These conflicts include the 1876 Battle at Little Big Horn, where the Northern Cheyenne allied with the Sioux and Arapaho to defeat General George Armstrong Custer and the U.S. Seventh Calvary. They also include the Battle of the Tongue River in 1877 (also known as the Battle of Wolf Mountain), where a group of Northern Cheyenne battled a detachment of the Fifth Infantry along the east bank of the Tongue River near the present-day location of Birney. Following these conflicts, many Northern Cheyenne were forcibly relocated to Oklahoma. \textit{The Northern Cheyenne Tribe and Its Reservation} at 2-12 to 2-17.

The Northern Cheyenne resisted these repeated attempts to remove them from their homeland and have maintained their connection to the lands near the Tongue River. In 1878, following the relocation to Oklahoma, Chief Dull Knife and Chief Little Wolf led bands of Northern Cheyenne on a long and arduous return trip from Oklahoma to their traditional homeland. In the late 1870s and early 1880s, the Northern Cheyenne began to reestablish themselves in areas near the Tongue River, settling on Lame Deer Creek, Muddy Creek, Rosebud Creek, and the Tongue River between Otter Creek and Hanging Woman Creek. Recognizing the importance of this area to the Cheyenne people, President Arthur signed an executive order on November 16, 1884, establishing the Tongue River Indian Reservation, which at that time did not include lands settled by the Northern Cheyenne on the Tongue River itself. However, in 1900, President McKinley signed an executive order changing the name of the Reservation to the “Northern Cheyenne Reservation” and extending the eastern boundary of the Reservation to its current location on the Tongue River. \textit{Tom Weist, A History of the Cheyenne People}, at 103-105 (1977); \textit{Orlan J. Svingen, The Northern Cheyenne Indian Reservation, 1877-1900}, at 145-146 (1993); \textit{The Northern Cheyenne Tribe and Its Reservation} at 2-17 to 2-19.

Despite establishment of the Reservation, Northern Cheyenne lands and culture remained under threat throughout the 20th century. The early 1900s saw the forced acculturation of the Northern Cheyenne people through federal policies that prohibited or discouraged traditional cultural and religious practices and sent Cheyenne children to boarding schools where they were forbidden to speak their native language. In the mid-20th century, mining companies began to express interest in developing coal reserves on the Northern Cheyenne Reservation. The first coal sale on the Reservation took place in 1966, and by 1971 lease options were held by mining companies to virtually the entire unallotted portion of the Reservation. However, review of these leases revealed that the financial terms were below fair market value and the leases were issued in violation of various federal laws, including NEPA. In 1973, the Northern Cheyenne Tribal Council formally petitioned for cancellation of the lease agreements, and in 1974 the Secretary
of the Interior issued a decision suspending coal development on the Reservation. Ultimately, pursuant to legislation passed by Congress at the Tribe’s request, the leases were cancelled. Around the same time, the Tribe began to fear that individual Tribal members would attempt to lease allotted lands for coal development and requested that Congress terminate the grant of mineral rights to allottees and reserve mineral rights on the Reservation “in perpetuity for the benefit of the Tribe.” Congress took action conditioned on a judicial determination that the allottees did not have vested rights to the mineral deposits under the 1926 Northern Cheyenne Allotment Act. In *Northern Cheyenne Tribe v. Hollowbreast*, 425 U.S. 649 (1976), the United States Supreme Court confirmed that the 1926 Act did not give allottees vested rights to the mineral deposits on the Reservation and the Tribe formally regained control of the mineral rights underlying the Reservation. *The Northern Cheyenne Tribe and Its Reservation* at 2-26 to 2-28.

The Tribe has not developed its on-Reservation coal resources and has resisted attempts to develop off-Reservation resources in the Tribe’s traditional homeland. In the 1970s, as a result of the plan to construct two 750-megawatt coal-fired generators in Colstrip, the Tribe became the first governmental entity to voluntarily classify its air shed as “Class 1” under the federal Clean Air Act, a designation that had previously been applied only to national parks and wilderness areas. In the 1980s, the Tribe successfully challenged a massive sale of federal coal in the Powder River region on the grounds that the sale breached the trust responsibility to the Tribe, violated federal coal leasing regulations, and violated NEPA. In 1996, the Tribe joined forces with other groups to successfully challenge the proposed extension of a mining permit for the proposed Montco mine. *The Northern Cheyenne Tribe and Its Reservation* at 2-28 to 2-30.

In the 2000s, the Tribe led successful litigation in federal and state courts to protect water quality in the Tongue River from impacts associated with coal bed methane operations. This included a successful federal court litigation challenging federal approval of full-field coal bed methane development surrounding our Reservation and enforcing Tribal consultation requirements in the National Historic Preservation Act. The Tribe also successfully challenged the State of Montana’s issuance of water discharge permits to the coal bed methane industry in violation of the federal Clean Water Act.

In 2014, the Northern Cheyenne Lands Act, as part of the National Defense Authorization Act, was passed by Congress and signed into law, which corrected an error made by a federal agent who failed to follow the direction of Congress and acquire ownership of 5,000 subsurface acres within the newly-expanded Reservation. The Act transferred title to those subsurface acres from a coal company to the Tribe, thereby granting the Tribe complete control over its subsurface and any development thereof.

Soon thereafter, the Tribe, along with other entities, submitted comments to the United States Surface Transportation Board criticizing the proposed Tongue River Railroad which would serve the proposed Otter Creek coal mine. The Tribe emphasized the environmental, biological, socioeconomic, and other adverse impacts the railroad proposal would have on the Tribe and its members. Within months of the Tribe’s comments, the railroad project proponent abandoned the project.
The Unfortunate History of the Coal Ash Ponds

In January 1973, at a hearing in Miles City on the proposed coal ash disposal ponds for Colstrip Units 1&2, there was testimony that wet disposal of coal ash in scoria soil would result in leakages. In the following years, citizens continued to raise this issue and to demand that state agencies evaluate how Montana Power Company would control ash pond leakage. During hearings prior to initial construction of Units 1&2, local landowners gave examples of stock reservoirs not holding water due to porous substrate and soils, and recommended that dry ash storage be used to contain the contaminants in the coal ash. These recommendations were dismissed by the Colstrip plant owners and largely ignored by state agencies permitting the ponds.

The current system to control groundwater pollution relies on pump-back wells and is a temporary solution that does not address the root cause of the pollution – the leaking ash ponds. Talen proposes to contain pollution with capture wells rather than stop the pollution at its source. The pumps pull roughly 750 gallons of groundwater per minute, or 1,080,000 gallons per day, out of the aquifer to prevent the pollution from spreading according to capture well data contained in Talen Energy’s Site Characterization reports. The source of pollution needs to be eliminated. The owners have been allowed to operate for four decades now in direct violation of Montana water quality law and the plant’s original Major Facility Siting Act permit. The owners’ and state’s failure to act has made a bad problem worse.

This temporary approach to cleanup has created a permanent and once-avoidable problem in the form of bedrock aquifer contamination. The state cannot afford a “wait and see” approach with this cleanup. It is time to require aggressive source control measures that dig out the coal ash sitting in the ground water and move it to a lined landfill above the water table. To protect groundwater, DEQ cannot leave unlined or leaking coal ash ponds sitting in the water table. It will need to exercise the agency’s authority as outlined in Article XIII, Section D, of the AOC throughout the RER approval process in order to protect the community’s long-term health and safety and to require Talen Energy execute a responsible cleanup.

Agriculture in the Armells Creek watershed has suffered from pond leakages that have introduced high sulfate and Total Dissolved Solids (TDS) concentrations to the aquifer, and from the excessive pumping of uncontaminated groundwater to limit the spread of the contamination plume. While pumping may now be situationally necessary, it comes at a meaningful cost. The capture system daily contaminates ever more groundwater, as virgin groundwater is pumped out from the ground via capture wells and piped into storage ponds where it mixes with coal ash. According to DEQ’s leakage estimates, 367 gallons of contaminated water leak per minute from the Colstrip ash ponds. The capture system, however, pumps an estimated 750 gallons of water per minute out of the aquifer according to Talen Energy’s estimates in the Site Characterization Reports. We are then needlessly contaminating roughly 483 gallons of fresh groundwater per minute just to control the spread of pollution, as virgin groundwater is pumped out from the aquifer and transported for storage in the coal ash ponds, where it becomes contaminated.
Citizen lawsuits from adjacent landowners to the Units 1&2 ponds in 2008 resulted in a $25 million settlement for damages caused by pollution from the leaking coal ash ponds. The lawsuit, however, did not result in a permanent fix to eliminate future leakages. DEQ has never required a permanent fix, only requiring expansion of the capture system to remove more groundwater in an effort to control the spreading pollution. While there are active remediation proposals in the RER, including critical in-situ flushing, the Preferred Alternative does not include the single most important strategy needed to remediate pollution at the Units 1&2 ponds – **source removal of coal ash**. Source removal is the only proven technology that will keep coal ash at the Stage Two Evaporation Ponds (STEP) out of contact with groundwater over the long term and safeguard the region’s water resources.

DEQ comments to Talen Energy dated April 22, 2019 requested that source removal be thoroughly evaluated as a remediation technology for the Stage One Evaporation Ponds (SOEP). However, no alternatives in this RER evaluate source removal for the other pond complex associated with Units 1&2 – STEP – even though available data indicate the water table intercepts coal ash there also. For the same reasons that SOEP ash will remain a continual, long-term source of contaminants of interest (COIs) if left in place, STEP ash will continue to release COIs for thousands of years unless it is moved to a new landfill above the water table.

DEQ is not limited to approving only alternatives provided to you by Talen Energy. Indeed, Talen Energy has provided no alternative guarantees a healthy future for Colstrip and meets clean-up criteria within the AOC boundary for the Units 1&2 site, as defined in the Cleanup Criteria and Risk Assessment report (for example, bringing concentrations of Boron and Sulfate down below 4 mg/L and 3000 mg/L, respectively, in the Alluvium). Even Talen Energy admits that their seemingly preferred alternative, Alternative 5, will result in pollution levels exceeding preliminary clean-up criteria 50 years after they have begun their remediation efforts (see, for instance, page xiii of RER which state: “As such, Alternative 5 includes MNA and institutional controls to address the small isolated Near-Source areas that do not attain the PCC, and the Distal Areas within the Plant Property boundary where the boron plume reemerges after the injection/capture system is shut down.”).

**Deficiencies in the RER**

Without adequate source controls on the coal ash itself, any progress made through plume remediation stands to be reversed in future decades as a long-term source of pollution rebounds. The major deficiencies in the RER – the biggest being the lack of a source removal alternative – are summarized here:

- the RER lacks an alternative where source removal of all coal ash at STEP is evaluated;
- pond liners will not act as a permanent barrier between groundwater and coal ash;
- long-term leaching from STEP is not accurately characterized; and
- the RER lacks a plan for long-term pumping beyond 2070 is needed.
The RER lacks an alternative where source removal of all coal ash at STEP is evaluated. The Statement in DEQ’s April 22nd letter to Gordon Criswell that “DEQ will not accept a remedy that leaves a long-term source in place if it is in contact with groundwater” is important. Talen Energy’s present failure to evaluate source removal in the RER means they cannot possibly show they will meet this key standard. The water table is elevated above coal ash at the Units 1&2 ponds. Capping any of these ponds in place will leave coal ash in contact with groundwater long-term, making it impossible to meet AOC cleanup goals in the future.

The final remedy must include source removal of coal ash at STEP. DEQ should require this be evaluated in Part 2 of the RER. The alternatives presented by Talen Energy in this report do not allow DEQ to truly evaluate how STEP ash continues as a long-term source of COIs if it is capped in place. An alternative where both STEP and SOEP ash are removed needs to be evaluated in the Units 1&2 RER Part 2 and weighed against capping any of the ash in place. The AOC includes a clear requirement in Article XI that the RERs must contain, among other things, an “Identification and summary of feasible remedial alternatives,” (Section C.2.a). Source removal of coal ash is a standard practice for coal ash ponds that sit below the water table. In fact, state legislatures in North Carolina, South Carolina, Virginia, and Illinois have all passed laws mandating this as a requirement. Talen Energy’s failure to identify source removal of STEP ash as a feasible remedial alternative in this report means they are not meeting this important standard in the AOC.

None of the alternatives presented in the report achieve the cleanup criteria, as identified in the Units 1&2 Cleanup Criteria and Risk Assessment report, within all AOC boundaries at the Units 1&2 site. DEQ issued the AOC as an enforcement action for cleaning up the leaking 1&2 ponds, but the RER as written does not meet this important standard by leaving coal ash sitting below the groundwater table, and thus enabling future leakages. Despite four decades to resolve this issue, the Colstrip owners have failed to implement a successful strategy. An RER that includes cap-in-place closure for any of the Units 1&2 ponds that are below the water table constitutes a “wait and see” approach. The real work of the AOC – digging up coal ash – cannot be put off into the future as that would force the state to claw back funding from companies that no longer have active operations in Montana.

DEQ must require Talen Energy to include a source removal alternative in Part II of the report. The AOC process is itself an enforcement action, and the RERs are the single biggest decision-making piece of that process. It is therefore critical that DEQ view enforcement as a central theme of the RER-approval process and ensure a source removal alternative is included.

Pond liners will not act as a permanent barrier between groundwater and coal ash. Liners beneath STEP have been leaking for decades and will not act as a permanent barrier between groundwater and coal ash, as falsely claimed by Talen Energy in the RER. Because the water table at the 1&2 ponds is elevated above the bottom of STEP ponds, any coal ash capped in place ensures groundwater will remain in contact with a long-term source of COIs. Even if the ponds are completely dewatered and all STEP ash were temporarily dried out, clean groundwater would then well up through pathways in the liners where pond water is currently leaking out from, that groundwater would then mix with coal ash and become contaminated, and
then contaminated water would leak back out carrying COIs into the aquifer. Talen Energy estimates the HDPE liners are rated for 400 years in unexposed conditions and 36 years in exposed conditions. No matter how long it takes, when the liners eventually fail there will be a large mass of CCR freshly exposed to groundwater.

In comments to Talen Energy dated April 22, 2019, DEQ requested Talen account for horizontal groundwater flows into coal ash when modeling seepage from the Units 1&2 ponds. Talen Energy’s response that “…the presence of the liners in the STEP ponds should eliminate saturated advective flow through the ash,” is inadequate. A plastic liner simply will not permanently eliminate groundwater contact with coal ash. When the liners eventually fail on a large scale, groundwater contact with coal ash will be significant and result in a continual, long-term source of COIs. Talen’s failure to accurately account for horizontal groundwater flows in the modeling means DEQ cannot truly evaluate how capping STEP ash in place will impact long-term AOC cleanup goals. Because horizontal flows into the STEP ponds is underestimated in the RER, DEQ cannot adequately evaluate the negative impacts of leaving coal ash in place. Long-term leaching of COIs from STEP ash is not accurately characterized.

Long-term leaching of COIs from STEP ash is not accurately characterized in the report, which means it is impossible for DEQ to evaluate how capping these ponds in place will impact cleanup goals. In sum, Talen argues the major source of COIs that contribute to future plume reemergence at the site are from SOEP ash, and therefore source removal is not needed at STEP. However, this does not make sense as it assumes contamination is coming from SOEP ash but not from STEP ash. Talen’s decision to leave SOEP ash in place in their models is a clear attempt to minimize the negative impacts that capping STEP ash in place will have on long-term cleanup goals.

The Tribe supports dewatering of all STEP ponds as a needed first step toward excavation. Along with Cells A and E, dewatering of the Old Clearwell should be included and approved in Part I of the report because that cell is currently being filled with coal ash. However, while we support DEQ approving the dewatering in Part I of the RER, there must be clear language in the final approved RER stating this approval does not constitute a long-term source control plan for the STEP ponds. Contact between groundwater and coal ash at all Units 1&2 ponds must be addressed in Part II of the report with an alternative that evaluates source removal at all ponds.

Financial assurance for long-term pumping and treatment beyond 2070. The RER must include financial assurance to cover the costs of long-term, likely perpetual, pumping at the Units 1&2 ponds site to control the spread of contaminants that in-situ flushing does not remove including, for instance, through the endowment of a trust fund. Talen Energy’s preferred alternative is not capable of meeting cleanup standards outside of the boundary of the Units 1&2 site. The low flow nature of the aquifer and decades of contaminant leakage make it difficult to remediate the groundwater. While freshwater flushing is an important tool toward removing much of the contamination, groundwater models in the RER confirm there will be a need for permanent pumping to control the boron plume from rebounding after the capture system shuts down.
Talen states several times in the RER that “…it should be noted that monitoring in perpetuity is not required for waste disposal sites.” We ask DEQ to assess the validity of this claim. Several references are made in the report to “…small isolated Near-Source areas that do not attain the PCC.” If Talen Energy is not required to monitor the Units 1&2 site in perpetuity, and DEQ approves a plan that does not attain cleanup criteria in the AOC boundary, we believe DEQ has formally enabled a violation of Montana water quality law in perpetuity.

DEQ should agree that this site will require perpetual pumping and monitoring and that the owners must provide financial assurance to cover those costs. New remediation technologies may be available in the future that can remove the less mobile constituents from the plume and prevent the need for perpetual pumping, but DEQ should not approve a plan that is based on that assumption. Perpetual groundwater pumping is a centerpiece of ongoing cleanups at Butte, Zortman-Landusky, and other industrial mining sites in Montana. The Colstrip power plant owners have had ample opportunity to prevent a permanent pollution problem from unfolding by voluntarily switching to dry storage. Choosing to store the coal ash in ponds has resulted in enormous pressure forcing contamination deep into the aquifers beneath the ponds for decades. There is no proof that removing those contaminants to background concentrations will ever be possible, and while DEQ must require a plan to maximize water quality, minimize degradation, and meet pollution criteria, DEQ must also prepare for the reality of ongoing water pollution by collecting a bond that will cover the cost of long-term pumping at the site. If prepared properly, the Monitored Natural Attenuation (“MNA”) study that Talen Energy is completing in the coming year will be helpful in evaluating if MNA is appropriate for the Units 1&2 site, but with the data that is available today DEQ must have a plan in place to control the pollution long-term.

The circumstances surrounding industrial remediation projects inevitably change. For example, the Butte cleanup of Silverbow Creek has undergone major revisions since the project began in 1983. There must be several explicit contingency plans to reflect the uncertainty surrounding the effectiveness of the STEP underdrain in fully draining the ponds and limitations on the Hydrologic Evaluation of Landfill Performance (HELP) model used to justify meeting long-term cleanup goals. The models supporting the preferred alternative are not qualified for predictive purposes, as stated by Geosyntec in the RER. DEQ must approach remediation at the Units 1&2 site by bonding for the reasonable worst-case scenario – including, though not limited to, perpetual pumping – or accept that the state will be forced to collect funding in the future from companies that may not exist in the future. We know, and Talen Energy has admitted, that the massive pump-back well system is the only thing keeping the pollution plume from spreading into nearby Armells Creek. This begs the question: what happens when there is no more bonding to keep the pumps running? DEQ must bond for perpetual water pumping unless Talen Energy demonstrates that MNA and long-term remediation efforts will control the plume permanently.

Violations of the Federal Coal Combustion Residuals Rule

As written, the RER does not meet key standards contained in the 2015 Coal Combustion Residuals (“CCR”) Rule, and DEQ must consider this to ensure the Administrative Order on Consent (“AOC”) remedy is executed and that water and its uses are protected. Specifically, the CCR rule requires that free liquids be fully drained from ponds prior to capping (40 CFR
§ 257.60, 2015) and that the base of existing CCR impoundments be 5 feet above the upper limit of the uppermost aquifer (40 CFR § 257.60, 2015). Groundwater elevations at the Units 1&2 site are above the bottom of STEP ponds. DEQ approval of a cap-in-place remedy means the agency policy is out of line with both of these key federal standards. Anything short of source removal at these ponds provides uncertainty, risk, and prolongs consideration of this problem to a time when owners may not exist or agency leadership may seek to undermine the goals of the AOC and state and federal law.

DEQ Should Require that Talen Hire Northern Cheyenne as Employees and Contractors for the Coal Ash Pond Work

When the Colstrip plant was being developed, the Tribe’s leaders were concerned that the Reservation community would suffer from adverse socioeconomic consequences of energy development while being unable to capture many of the economic benefits of energy development in the region. These concerns were addressed in part by the adoption of employment preferences at the Colstrip facility, which provide enhanced employment opportunities to Northern Cheyenne Tribal members. At last count, approximately 50 employees at the Colstrip facility are Northern Cheyenne members, and about 65 Tribal members are employed at the Rosebud Mine adjacent to the Colstrip facility. Put another way, approximately **18% or about 1 in every 5 jobs of Northern Cheyenne Tribal members would be lost** if the Colstrip facility closes. Such a loss would be devastating to the Tribe’s underprivileged community.

Terrible economic conditions persist on our Reservation. The Reservation is located in Rosebud and Bighorn Counties and neither County has much wealth. However, economic conditions are much worse on the Reservation portions of those counties. For example, the average income per person and median household income on the Reservation are only about half of that in the non-Reservation portion of Rosebud County, Montana. The poverty rate on the Reservation is almost **35 percent** while the poverty rate in the non-Reservation portions of the County is only nine percent, and the unemployment rate on the Reservation is nearly **14 times** the unemployment rate in the off-Reservation portion of the County. These great disparities are in large part due to the lack of job opportunities on the Reservation. Despite an out of date housing stock, it is not uncommon for a dozen people to live in one household which depends on the earnings of one primary breadwinner. As a result, for every Colstrip job lost, many people on the Reservation will suffer.

A plan should be implemented to afford Northern Cheyenne Tribal members a preference in coal ash pond cleanup work to mitigate the difficult economic circumstances which will occur when Tribal members lose employment or contracts related to the Colstrip facility. The plan should include a preference for Tribal members to be notified of employment and contracting opportunities at the earliest possible time. The plan should require that those Tribal members who apply for the coal ash pond work be given a hiring preference. The plan should require cultural sensitivity training and other programs to support Tribal members and foster long-term employment for our people.
Conclusion

Because of our belief and value systems, the Northern Cheyenne Tribe and its members have made herculean efforts to protect our lands and water, including those in and around Colstrip. For those reasons, the Tribe is uniquely positioned to advocate for a proper RER. For the reasons expressed herein, DEQ should require extremely strong measures to protect further environmental harm from the Units 1&2 coal ash ponds and require that Talen and its contractors implement a Northern Cheyenne preference when hiring to implement such measures.

Sincerely,

[Signature]
Rynalea Whiteman Peña
Tribal President
Rynalea Peña, President
Northern Cheyenne Tribe
P.O. Box 128
Lame Deer, MT 59043

Dear President Peña:

This is in reference to Northern Cheyenne Tribal Council Resolution No. DOI-054 (2019) enacted on January 22, 2019 and received on January 29, 2019.

Resolution No. DOI-054 (2019) calls for proper disposal of coal ash from Colstrip Power Plant and Northern Cheyenne hiring preference.

Resolution No. DOI-054 (2019) is hereby noted. The Northern Cheyenne Tribal Council has the authority to take this action pursuant to Article IV, Section 1 (m) and (r), of the Amended Constitution and Bylaws of the Northern Cheyenne Tribe.

Pursuant to Article IV, Section 4 of the Amended Constitution & Bylaws of the Northern Cheyenne Tribe, the Superintendent has authority to respond to said resolution.

All necessary copies of this resolution have been retained for our files.

Sincerely,

Superintendent

Enclosure
A RESOLUTION CALLING PROPER DISPOSAL OF COAL ASH FROM COLSTRIP POWER PLANT AND NORTHERN CHEYENNE HIRING PREFERENCE.

WHEREAS, the Tribal Council of the Northern Cheyenne Tribe is the governing body of the Northern Cheyenne Tribe pursuant to the Amended Constitution and By-Laws of the Northern Cheyenne Tribe of the Northern Cheyenne Indian Reservation, as approved by the Secretary of the Interior on May 31, 1996;

WHEREAS, the Tribal Council is authorized pursuant to Article IV, Section 1 (m) of the Tribe’s Constitution to protect the general health and welfare of the Tribe;

WHEREAS, the Colstrip Power Plant has operated for decades near the Northern Cheyenne Reservation, and has provided benefits, most prominently in the form of employment of Tribal members, and burdens, most prominently in the form of adverse environmental impacts;

WHEREAS, many Northern Cheyenne Tribal members have worked at the plant since its inception and received vital income for their families;

WHEREAS, Units 1 and 2 at the Colstrip Power Plant are scheduled to close by July 2022;

WHEREAS, the associated loss of jobs held by Northern Cheyenne Tribal members will have a major impact on the Northern Cheyenne community;

WHEREAS, the 1976 Major Facilities and Siting Act permit for the Colstrip Power Plant designated it as a zero discharge facility;

WHEREAS, today, there are coal ash ponds associated with the Colstrip Power Plant that discharge 500,000 gallons per day into the water table, introducing heavy metals and sulfates to the aquifer;

WHEREAS, for example, a large, coal ash pond associated with the Colstrip Power Plant that was capped in 1997 has a longstanding leak which is currently discharging 12,196 gallons per day;

WHEREAS, the Montana Department of Environmental Quality (MDEQ) is in the process of considering a long-term remediation plan for the coal ash ponds; and
WHEREAS, the industry standard for remediation of coal ash ponds includes excavating the ash to store in a lined landfill, capping the pond in place, and surrounding the area with capture wells; now

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED the Northern Cheyenne Tribe hereby calls on the MDEQ to require that the owners of the Colstrip Power Plant take strong measures to protect against environmental harm from the Colstrip Power Plant coal ash ponds, including removal of the coal ash, recycling any usable coal ash, and storing the remainder in a properly lined landfill;

BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED that the Northern Cheyenne Tribe hereby calls on MDEQ and the owners of the Colstrip Power Plant to ensure that current Northern Cheyenne Tribal members who work at the Colstrip Power Plant and associated Rosebud Mine, as well as other Tribal members who seek employment associated with closure of the coal ash ponds, be notified of such employment opportunities at the earliest possible time and regularly thereafter (with a copy to the Northern Cheyenne Tribal President), and that Northern Cheyenne Tribal members be granted an employment preference when filling those employment positions.

PASSED, ADOPTED AND Approved by the Northern Cheyenne Tribal Council by 9 votes for passage and adoption, 0 votes against passage and adoption, and 1 abstention this 22nd day of January 2019.

Rynalea Pena, President
Northern Cheyenne Tribe

ATTEST:

Melissa Lonebear, Secretary
Northern Cheyenne Tribe

Noted:

Superintendent FEB - 1 2019
December 16, 2019

Sara Edinberg  
Montana Department of Environmental Quality  
Waste Management and Remediation Division  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620-0901

RE: MEIC Comments on Talen Montana’s Units 1&2 Remedy Evaluation Report

On behalf of the Montana Environmental Information Center (MEIC), I submit the following comments on the “Revised Remedy Evaluation Report – Part One, Units 1&2 Stage I and II Evaporation Ponds” (hereinafter “Remedy Report”) submitted by Talen Montana (Talen). For the reasons stated below, the Montana Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) must reject the Remedy Report and instead design a remedy that immediately and effectively leads to remediation of the contamination at the site.

Once again, MEIC is extremely concerned that Talen is trying to force the state to approve a partial and inadequate remedy. As with Talen’s proposed Units 3 & 4 EHP Remedy, Talen’s Remedy Report and the five proposed alternatives for cleanup of Units 1 & 2 ash ponds, are designed to fail. Talen is attempting to force DEQ to choose between five knowingly inadequate remedies. DEQ must reject Talen’s proposal and instead follow the requirements of the 2012 Administrative Order on Consent (AOC), and require Talen to implement a modified remedy, designed by DEQ, that will effectively, permanently, and verifiably remove contaminants from the area and meet the cleanup criteria at the actual point of compliance (the edge of the ponds) for all constituents of concern (not just the two pollutants modeled by Talen, boron and sulfate). Anything short of a significantly modified alternative remedy will leave Montana with an inadequate cleanup and equally inadequate bond to properly clean up the area in and around the Colstrip unit 1 & 2 coal ash ponds.

Talen’s proposal fails to meet the remedial action objective (RAO). The RAO calls for Talen to, “Control future releases of COIs in groundwater to the extent necessary to achieve the cleanup levels at the downgradient point of compliance in a reasonable period of time.” Instead of meeting that objective, throughout the document Talen contemplates making a request to extend the point of compliance. DEQ must be firm. The point of compliance must remain the edge of the ponds, not 150 meters downgradient of the waste management unit boundary. DEQ should require Talen to plan for success, not failure. Talen and DEQ must design a remedy that meets this point of compliance within a reasonable time period. Instead Talen proposes to
A huge volume of critical information regarding cleanup is deferred until after completion of Part 2 of the Remedy Report. Such a stalling tactic should be rejected by DEQ. It is impossible to know if a remedy will meet the cleanup objective without essential details — details that Talen has decided, after a decade of analysis, not to provide to the DEQ at this time. Choosing a remedy with inadequate information is like shooting in the dark. Talen’s stalling tactics are designed to result in an inadequate remedy and lower bond than is necessary to cleanup the site. Just a few examples of flaws in the Report include the following:

- “Saturated ash and soil have been sampled and are undergoing leach tests. Results of these studies will be presented in Part 2 of this Revised RE Report and may show additional source control of the SOEP is required.” (Remedy Report, p. 35)
- “The Revised Remedy Evaluation Report – Part 2 will evaluate options for additional source controls at the SOEP, if needed.” (Remedy Report, p. 122)

As stated elsewhere in these comments, Talen admits that “the model predicts that there is still enough seepage from SOEP for the plume to reemerge,” which also won’t be evaluated until Part 2. (Remedy Report p. 122). Simply put, Talen has yet to do its job.

It’s incredibly frustrating that once again Talen explicitly admits in its evaluation of each of the proposed Alternatives that each one fails to meet the criteria for cleanup. This failure to design and consider a single alternative that would permanently clean up the site within a reasonable timeframe, should result in Talen forfeiting its right to create a viable Remedy Alternative. It’s now up to DEQ to do so. Talen’s stalling tactic is explicit. It admits that critical information won’t be provided until Part 2 of the Remedy Report. This undermines the public’s ability to comment on critical measures and it fundamentally undermines DEQ’s ability to choose anything less that complete ash removal. As Talen admits there are many fundamental shortcomings in the Remedy, such as:

- “Soils beneath the STEP cells generally have not been assessed as potential source areas either because the cells are still in service or were, or are planned to be, closed in-place.” (RER, p. 35)
- “Potential mobilization of those salts by rebounding water tables after the capture system is shut off could be an additional potential release mechanism.” (RER, p. 35)

One of the most distressing provisions of Talen’s plan that clearly indicates its failure to meet the objective is the repeated admission that low mobility contaminants such as boron will reemerge when the capture system is shut down. This is not cleanup! This is called “kicking the can down the road.” Talen admits the low mobility contaminants will be above the cleanup criteria in 130 years! Such a “Remedy” makes a mockery of the very term. DEQ must reject Talen’s plan based on this provision alone:

- “In the Distal Areas, the fate and transport model predicts that after the capture system is shut down the boron plumes reemerge around 2090 and remain above the PCC in off-
site Distal Areas to the east of the STEP Main Dam and north of the SOEP through 2150.” (Report, page 105)

These statements and so many others throughout the Report indicate that there are far too many uncertainties and projected failures for DEQ to approve Talen’s Alternative 5 as the proposed remedy.

Talen’s proposal is riddled with the notion of “good enough” even when its proposed Remedy fails to meet the cleanup objectives. A remedy that is slightly better than awful, doesn’t make that remedy good. Talen repeatedly says that “reducing” contamination is sufficient, that since a “smaller plume” is better than a larger plume that makes the Alternative the best cleanup option, that less boron is good even if it’s only a 41% reduction, or that the PCC’s are “mostly achieved.” Talen’s argument that Alternative 5 provides the greatest reduction of risk to public health, safety or welfare, is a far cry from the best reduction of risk available. It is cold comfort that Talen says Alternative 5 “would slow reemergence of the plumes” above the cleanup criteria both on and off-site after the capture system is shut down. (Remedy Report, page 123).

**Slowing the reemergence of contamination is hardly the standard by which DEQ should approve a remedy.** The standard should be whether or not the plume reemerges at all. DEQ must reject any Remedy that admits the contamination will reemerge. That, by definition, is not a Remedy, it is a stalling tactic. Talen provided 5 inadequate remedies. The fact that Alternative 5 is better than four other lousy and wholly inadequate remedies, does not mean it’s acceptable or sufficient. DEQ should reject all 5 Alternatives.

The permeable reactive barrier cannot be considered a “contingency” when Talen admits that it is necessary to meet the objective. Alternative 5 says: “The volume of groundwater exceeding boron and sulfate PCC is expected to decrease by 41% and 93% respectively, from baseline (2017) to 2055. The mass discharge of boron and other less mobile constituents are expected to continue to decrease if the PRB contingency is implemented. This would result in even greater reductions in the volume of groundwater exceeding PCC for boron and other less mobile constituents.” (Emphasis Added) (Remedy Report p. 123). At a minimum, DEQ must require installation of PRB and a bond posted to cover the cost. Talen admits that it can’t meet the cleanup criteria without such a measure. Either a PRB is required and bonded for or the waste must be excavated and stored in a properly designed landfill far above the water table.

Talen also admits that the PRB contingency might not be feasible in some instances (Remedy Report 125). The Remedy should discuss what instances would preclude use of the PRB and outline the other measures that would be implemented should use of the PRB be infeasible.

As with the Remedy for the EHP, DEQ must also consider that Talen only evaluated two pollutants in its modeling: boron and sulfate. Modeling is purportedly conducted in this fashion in order to represent a large number of low and high mobility pollutants. However, there is no certainty that the other pollutants from the ash ponds, including such pollutants as chromium, radium, selenium, cobalt, manganese, total dissolved solids, sodium, potassium, lithium and other pollutants, will behave in an identical fashion as boron and sulfate in the groundwater,
soils, and subsurface. For example, no mid-range mobility pollutants were analyzed. The failure to consider the movement and extent of contamination of each of these specific pollutants means, at a minimum, that DEQ should either force the consideration of those pollutants in addition to boron and sulfate or, at a minimum, be extremely conservative in its remedy selection and bonding requirements. DEQ should also require extensive testing for these pollutants to establish both the existing base level for each pollutant in each geological stratum as well estimate each pollutant’s predicted movement and level. In addition, DEQ should require extensive testing for each pollutant in each stratum on a regular basis going forward in order to determine that the cleanup criteria at the edge of the impoundments is met.

Talen proposes to turn the pumps off in 2050 yet it admits that this will exacerbate contamination problems at the site. A permanent pump and treat system should be required if DEQ refuses to require excavation of the ponds, especially any ponds that are in or near the groundwater table. The statement, “Only some small isolated Near-Source areas of low permeability north and east of the SOEP and east of the STEP Main Dam are predicted to remain above the PCC after the injection/capture system is shut down from 2050 through 2150.” (Remedy Report, page 123) Talen has failed to provide an adequate Remedy and admits its proposal will fail when the injection/capture system ceases to operate. The appropriate response by DEQ to such a blatant disregard for the objective of the project is to either require a perpetual pump and treat system or to excavate the waste and store it in a secure landfill that is adequately located away from water sources and is monitored in perpetuity. Bonding must reflect this long-term requirement.

DEQ Must Significantly Modify Talen’s Proposal

The 2012 AOC anticipated the eventuality that the Colstrip plant operator would submit an insufficient remedy proposal. DEQ created, and Talen agreed to, the tools created within the AOC for this circumstance. Accordingly, the AOC states that “The Department shall take action on the Remedy Evaluation Report per Article XII and shall select a remedy or a modified remedy as part of that Department action.” (Emphasis Added) (AOC §VI.C.3, page 23)

Talen submitted five alternatives in the Remedy Report, none of which actually meet the cleanup criteria at the point of compliance. As mentioned elsewhere in these comments, Talen’s preferred remedy admittedly fails.

MEIC endorses and incorporates by reference the comments and concerns of Kirk Engineering, submitted by the Northern Plains Resource Council. The report underscores the need for DEQ to reject Talen’s proposed alternative. The wide variety of issues raised by Kirk indicate that Talen is trying to cut corners, escape its cleanup responsibilities, and jeopardize water resources for centuries to come.

Once again, Talen proposes to re-evaluate the capture system every year for the first three years of operation and then every five years thereafter until the injection/capture system is shut down. Such a schedule is woefully insufficient to guarantee the long-term viability of the
The Remedy Report repeatedly admits that contaminants will increase after the injection/capture system closes, yet Talen proposes that it cease to evaluate the system after it closes. This proposal violates the terms of the AOC, which requires an annual review of the financial assurance by DEQ. DEQ cannot analyze the financial assurance in a vacuum. Review of the financial assurance necessarily requires review of the effectiveness of the cleanup operations. In order to assure compliance with the law, Talen must submit annually, and DEQ must review, an analysis of the critical components of the cleanup requirements (i.e., the capture system) in order to adjust cleanup requirements and the bond. The bond is tethered to site cleanup and remediation, and therefore, both must be on the same review schedule.

Water volume, treatment, and disposal have always been a significant issue for plant operations. Even though Talen brings huge volumes of water into the plant for its operations, the owners have chosen to avoid acquiring a Montana water pollution discharge permit (MPDES) for the disposal of the inevitable wastewater. The enormous volume of wastewater has resulted in Talen’s use of groundwater as its primary waste disposal method despite Talen’s cynical and absurd claim that the facility remains a “closed-loop system.” DEQ should not be constrained in its remedy selection by Talen’s desire to avoid applying for an MPDES permit from DEQ.

Units 1 & 2 are closing the plant next year. The remaining owners of Units 3 & 4 will close the plant in the next decade. This is evidenced by the fact that Washington State requires three of the owners to stop providing coal-based power to Washington customers by 2025. All of the owners that are regulated utilities are required to disclose their depreciation and/or closure schedules for the plant. All but NorthWestern Energy have agreed to be financially ready to close the plant between 2025 and 2030. Even NorthWestern Energy’s long-time representative, Mike Cashell, told a public forum in Bozeman in September that he expects the plant to close by 2025.

When the plant closes it will no longer be viable to use Yellowstone River water and the plants wastewater in facility operations. The loss of a clean water supply for flushing the groundwater, the loss of the ability to reuse of the wastewater in the plant, and the lack of an MPDES permit, underscore the need to immediately build and bond for a large treatment system for the contaminated pumped groundwater.

DEQ must craft a remedy that will address all of the flaws in Talen’s submittal and require a bond that is sufficient to cover the thorough cleanup and excavation of the ash in a reasonable timeframe – not 130 years.

Cleanup and Financial Assurance
Talen’s proposed financial assurance for its proposed remedy is absurd. $46,270,000 is woefully inadequate to guarantee cleanup, especially in light of the numerous uncertainties, contingencies, and deficiencies noted in the Report. For example, Sections 8.3, 8.4, 8.5, and 8.6
are riddled with so many unknowns and contingencies possibilities that DEQ’s bond must reflect the possibility of failure and the need for additional analysis and a revised remedy:

- “A groundwater treatment system solids disposal area would be constructed to dispose of treatment residuals.” (Remedy Report, p. 124)
- “A new injection system will have to be designed and constructed to deliver the clean water from the Surge Pond to injection wells until 2022, and either the Surge Pond water or the treated groundwater could be injected thereafter.” (Remedy Report, p. 124).
- “A PRB is included in Alternative 5 as a contingency for areas where it is feasible to install one in case it is demonstrated that MNA would not be sufficient to address constituents remaining after capture stops.” (Remedy Report, p. 124)
- “If the ash investigation study and subsequent fate and transport modeling indicates that saturated ash is a potential source that requires additional source control measures, the ISS treatability test will be conducted and the results of the ISS treatability test will be incorporated into the fate and transport modeling. The results of the ash investigation study, updated modeling, and the ISS treatability test (if needed) will be discussed in the Revised Remedy Evaluation Report – Part 2.” (Remedy Report, p. 125).
- “A geotechnical evaluation is currently underway to evaluate if there are stability concerns that might require adjustments to the proposed injection/capture system near the STEP Main Dam. An injection pilot test will also be conducted to evaluate the injection flow rates that will likely be encountered in the Sub-Mckay.” (Remedy Report, p. 125-6).
- “Water from the Surge Pond may require some limited pre-treatment prior to injection into groundwater to reduce long-term maintenance on the injection system. Some additional studies may be required to design the pre-treatment of injected water.” (Remedy Report, p. 126).
- “Additional groundwater and aquifer solids sampling, testing, and modeling will be necessary to evaluate the effectiveness of the MNA. Additional studies will also be conducted during the remedial design or implementation to assess the reliability of a PRB in addressing residual concentrations (if any) above PCC after 2050. (Remedy Report, p. 126).

All of these measures, and the many others mentioned in the Remedy Report, must be accounted for in the calculation of the bond. But the most important Remedy that the bond should cover is excavation. The Remedy Report lists “excavation of the SOEP” as a possibility if updated modeling shows the need for additional source control. (Remedy Report, p. 127). The admission that boron and other low-mobility pollutants will increase after the injection/capture system ceases operation, is an admission of the very real possibility that the state may need to require excavation in coming decades or centuries when Talen no longer exists.

The AOC requires nothing less than a stronger, more robust, and adequate cleanup plan and bond than what has been proposed by Talen. The AOC gives DEQ the authority to do so:
“To ensure the operation and maintenance of remedial and closure actions carried out under this order, PPLM shall provide financial assurance in the amount required by the Department and by any one method or combination of methods approved by the Department, and such approval shall not be unreasonably withheld, including but not limited to insurance, third-party guarantee, performance or other surety bond, or letter of credit. Such financial assurance shall be subject to annual review by the Department, with a comprehensive review at least every five years. The amount of the assurance may be increased or decreased based on the projected costs for the operation and maintenance of remedial and closure actions.

Any disagreement between the parties with respect to the amount of the financial assurance will be subject to the dispute resolution per Article XIII. The Department shall make available, through its website or similar means, the basis and/or calculations used to determine the amount of the financial assurance.

The parties agree that provision of the financial assurance will be addressed in phases, with the first phase addressing obligations for current and continuing remedial actions including monitoring, a second phase to incrementally address obligations resulting from actions taken pursuant to the process described in Article VI, and a third phase to address the Facility Closure Plan and amendments thereto addressed in Article IX. The parties agree that the first phase of financial assurance will be addressed by the parties upon execution of this AOC.” (Emphasis added.)
(AOC, §VIII, Page 27 and 28)

As stated below, it is critical that DEQ impose a bond that will suffice for the entire cleanup process, including worst case scenarios of cleanup requirements (especially as additional studies are necessary to determine what the cleanup requirements will be). Any bond must also include financing for perpetual water treatment. As demonstrated by other DEQ sites, water treatment in perpetuity is a financial burden on state taxpayers when it is not required as part of the financial assurance. Since boron is representative of many other contaminants and Talen’s Remedy Report acknowledges that the plume will expand over time, DEQ must insist on financing for perpetual treatment of water. As previously stated, it is essential for DEQ to be explicit that the bond required for the remedy is only the first iteration of a cost estimate that will have to be adjusted over time based on pending studies, investigations, and data collection.

The day of reckoning should be now for Talen and the other owners. DEQ cannot continue to allow it to continue to avoid its cleanup responsibilities by making false assertions that potential cleanup options can be adjusted over time. This game has lasted for decades, and has resulted in a more expensive clean up over a larger area of land.

The plant owners want to, or are legally obligated to, retire the Colstrip plant. Rumors strongly suggest they want out of the plant very soon. Talen Montana is a shell corporation that will likely cease to exist after Colstrip closes. This would shift liability to Puget Sound Energy should
it still exist at the time Talen’s supposed “Remedy” fails. Puget and Talen cannot be counted on to be around when Talen’s cleanup plan fails. Montana Power Company and Pacific Gas & Electric are perfect examples of dynamos in the utility world that either disappeared and/or went bankrupt. The disappearance of these two owners would mean Montana taxpayers could be on the hook in coming decades or centuries.

DEQ cannot and must not assume that it can increase the bond over time to address the inevitable failures in Talen’s remedy proposal. The time to guarantee cleanup and bonding by all owners of the plant is now, while they still exist and are responsible. Anything less than a remedy that meets the cleanup criteria as quickly as possible is insufficient to protect Montanans pocketbooks.

**Talen’s purported “Remedy” is simply unacceptable.** As with the Units 3 & 4 ash ponds, boron is an indicator of many pollutants, indicating that many other pollutants will likely not only remain in the aquifer for 130 years, but they will spread. DEQ can no longer wait for Talen to create an acceptable remedy. DEQ must choose a remedy based the meets the objectives within a reasonable timeframe. The only remedy that will result in complete and timely cleanup is one that requires requires Talen to dewater the ponds, remove the ash and safely store it in an appropriately designed landfill. Any cleanup plan should have better monitoring, better contingency plans, and bonding sufficient to guarantee that DEQ does not have the annual burden for 130+ years of determining that bonding must increase to address the admitted and inevitable failures in Talen’s proposals.

Should DEQ fail to require a bond to cover all potential costs, DEQ must only provide preliminary or interim approval until all additional studies are complete, and all cleanup and contingency methods are identified, analyzed, subject to public scrutiny, and eventually approved. Financial assurance should clearly indicate that any remedy decision is only for preliminary approval of the remedy, and does not include an adjustment in the costs that will occur after completion of required testing and analyses.

In short, DEQ should significantly modify Talen’s request, require dewatering and excavation of the coal ash impoundments, require secure long-term management and storage of the excavated material, and require a plan to effectively remove the remaining subsurface contamination. DEQ must establish milestones and an automatic increase to the bond in order to address measures and contingencies that eventually must be implemented.

Talen wants DEQ to approve a substandard, partial cleanup plan that will allow for the plant owners to claim the cost for cleanup is settled and is no longer in dispute. DEQ must be very clear in any decision-making documents that any bond imposed on Talen and the other plant owner will be adjusted based upon increased obligations that result from required and/or essential additional studies.
Anything less than the full remediation of the site will relieve the plant owners of important liabilities and place that burden on Montana taxpayers. MEIC urges you to protect both Montana’s environment and its taxpayers from the inevitable failure of Talen’s proposed remedy.

Sincerely,

Anne Hedges
Deputy Director
December 16, 2019

Sara Edinberg
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
1520 E. 6th Ave
Helena, Montana 59601

Re: Wastewater Facilities at the Colstrip Steam Electric Station

Dear Ms. Edinberg:

We are writing regarding the Department’s report regarding wastewater facilities at the Colstrip Steam Electric Station. The Montana AFL-CIO strongly believes that the cleanup criteria decided by the Department will play an integral role in the future economic vitality of Colstrip. An adequately stringent cleanup criteria is necessary to ensure that Montana taxpayers are not responsible for costs associated with cleanup, as well as prevent permanent contamination that will negatively impact future economic investments in the area.

Currently, Talen is proposing a cleanup criterion that would consist of limited pond dewatering, allowing some ponds to drain into the aquifer, cap-in-place closure for all ponds, and prolonged groundwater treatment. While this option will be cost effective, we believe this cleanup method will not stop future contamination from pond closures. Instead, we urge the Department to require a cleanup criterion that will implement full dewatering and excavation of coal ash sites, pond and soil dewatering and capping, and groundwater treatment. We believe this method will adequately clean the environment while protecting taxpayers and preserve the future economic potential of the Colstrip area.

Uncontaminated water and soil are essential for the City of Colstrip and its workers to achieve their long-term economic potential. We strongly urge the Department to choose a cleanup criterion that will protect these fundamentals while enabling the community to achieve their future potential.

Sincerely,

Al Ekblad
Montana AFL-CIO, Executive Secretary
As a Rosebud County resident, I would appreciate the help of Montana DEQ in the 1 and 2 Ash Pond Clean up. The Power Plant Owners should be held accountable for the entire clean up, including future monitoring of our ground water. The ponds have been leaking for many years, poor liners and lack of knowing the full effects of ground water contamination has created a huge problem for Montana. These Corporation’s should be the ones to bare the costs of proper clean up not the Montana tax payer. We also believe that monitoring should continue for many years to follow to protect or water resources.
I oppose the cleanup plan on the following grounds,
1. Pumping across from town will accelerate the water leaking from castle rock lake. The 700,000 gallons that leak, wash around foundations as the leaking water travels down hill to armells creek. There are many homes affected as well as commercial properties.
2. There is no guarantee my trailer court property will be cleaned because of location of injection locations.
3. I have not seen any study by an engineering firm that says the ground is porous enough to flow. Water doesn't flow through clay.
Richard Burnett
Sirs,
I was born and raised at Colstrip, a highly successful and well run company town which added well to the economy of our nation. The very thought of it becoming an environmental disaster...for years into the future...is unthinkable.
Please let's not let that happen.
Mary Ellen McWilliams
Hello. As a concerned Colstrip resident, I believe Montana DEQ needs to hold the power plant owners accountable to clean up the pollution that has occurred with regards to the ash ponds for Units 1&2. These ash ponds shall not be allowed to be in contact with groundwater after the units cease operation. These ponds were constructed with liners that have failed and leaked from the beginning. This is documented. Ash removal and aquifer restoration is the logical and moral solution that will provide long term benefits for the community and state. The taxpayers of Montana, instead of wealthy corporations, will bear the cost to clean this mess in the event of a sub standard cleanup right now. Please hold the owners accountable for the mess they have created while making hundreds of millions of dollars of profits.

Thank You

Tony Reda
Colstrip Resident
It seems Montanans will be footing another bill from our, “energy providers”, the current scheme to mitigate pollution at Colstrip 1 and 2 is woefully inadequate in that it does nothing to protect the groundwater. The current plan to just pump the water polluted with coal ash from the ground water into ponds just to have it leak back out again makes no sense. The fact the ponds are unlined to begin with tells me this entire mess is just “smoke and mirrors” that dates back to our old friends at Montana Power. The coal ash must be removed, dried out and moved to a separate lined landfill. Other states have used this method to protect their groundwater so the science is not new or untried. We as citizens entrust you to use good science to protect our air and water. We have one of the best examples of how things like this can be done right, removing the Milltown dam and moving the contaminated soil was nothing short of an engineering marvel. I attended U of M in the 70s, today it almost looks like the dam was never there. Make Talen energy do it right, we have an incredible example right here in Montana, they can’t use “smoke and mirrors” to weasel out of their responsibility. We know it can be done, you just need to make them.

Robert Kirtley.
Bozeman Montana.
I am writing in support of drying out the ponds, digging up the ash, and placing it in a new lined landfill far above ground water as proposed in the letter to the editor in today's Bozeman Daily Chronicle (12/10/19) by Beth Keading. Industry has a history of screwing the public to clean up their messes, and this trend should be stopped.

Thank you,
Rachel Rockafellow
1202 S. Spruce Dr.
Bozeman, MT  59715
406-586-2405
To the DEQ,

Colstrip owners need to permanently and effectively clean up the coal ash ponds by storing the waste high and dry. This should be done by drying out the coal ash, digging it up and moving it to a new lined landfill far above the ground water table to prevent leaching of toxic by-products.

Montana has a sad history of toxic waste messes left by industry for the public to deal with. Your job is to protect our environment by using the best technology that has proved effective.

Sincerely,

Lynn M. Kirtley
As a concerned Colstrip resident, I believe MT DEQ needs to hold the power plant owners accountable to clean up the mess that has occurred with regards to the Units 1&2 ash ponds. These ash ponds shall not be allowed to be in contact with groundwater after the units cease operation. These ponds were created with documented failed liners to begin with. Ash removal and aquifer restoration is the logical solution with long term results. Taxpayers, instead of wealthy corporations, will bear the cost to cleanup this mess in the event a poor decision is made today.
Thank you for listening
Bryan Wier
406 740 0409
Colstrip ,MT
To whom it may concern,

As a concerned Colstrip area resident, I believe MT DEQ needs to hold the power plant owners accountable to clean up the mess that has occurred with regards to the Units 1&2 ash ponds. These ash ponds shall not be allowed to be in contact with groundwater after the units cease operation. These ponds were created with documented failed liners to begin with. Ash removal and aquifer restoration is the logical solution with long term results. Taxpayers, instead of wealthy corporations, will bear the cost to cleanup this mess in the event a poor decision is made today.

Sincerely,

Bret Bowen
16 North Country Lane
Forsyth, MT 59327
Ms. Edinberg,

I am submitting the following comments to the Montana Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) in response to the October 2019 Revised Remedy Evaluation Report (RER) for the Units 1&2 ponds at Colstrip submitted to DEQ by Talen Energy.

Colstrip, in southeastern Montana, has long been an agricultural region supporting many ranches and providing economic livelihoods to those ranch families and others in the community. The Colstrip area changed dramatically in the early 1970s because of a massive energy development project. Montana Power proposed building a huge coal-fired generation facility in Colstrip, bringing hundreds of workers into the small community and turning it into a “company town.” The attraction for putting the facility here was that Colstrip also sits next to the Rosebud Mine, where coal had been mined at the turn of the century to power steam engines for the Northern Pacific Railroad. Montana Power planned to re-activate this coal mine for what is called a mine-mouth power plant, eliminating transportation costs and ensuring more profits for the company.

After operating the plant for many years, Montana Power took its money, dissolved, and sold the power plants. Today, Colstrip is owned by six different companies in four different states: Puget Sound Energy, Portland General Electric, Avista, PacifiCorp, Talen Energy, and NorthWestern Energy. But, the problems that were identified at the beginning of this development project by opponents of the plant remain and have devastated the area’s aquifer even more than could have been imagined.

I was a biologist working in the Colstrip area in the mid-1970s documenting what wildlife and plant life occurred in various parts of the landscape before coal strip mining resumed in those locations. I also spent much time documenting how well reclamation was taking hold in specific areas where coal had been mined in the past and was purported to be reclaimed. I know many of the long-time ranchers in the area and know that in the early 1970s when this massive energy development project was being permitted by the State of Montana many of them testified about all the problems this development would bring. The impacts they foresaw would be incredibly devastating to their agricultural economy. Ranchers’ livelihoods depend entirely on clean air and water, native soils and vegetation, and lands that remain intact.

The ranchers and others were particularly concerned about their water resources – not only what strip mining would do to that resource, but even more what impact the power plant residues would have on their water. The air pollution controls on the power plants capture the toxic by-products created by burning coal. Those pollutants are called “coal ash.” Coal ash can be stored either wet or dry, but it is much cheaper to store it wet, in ponds, which is what Montana Power proposed. During the permitting process in the 1970s and later in 1980s for Colstrip Units 3&4, the State assured local residents and area ranchers that these coal ash ponds “would never leak,” but, from the beginning, the ponds have leaked. The State officials had even told the Colstrip residents and ranchers that if the ponds leaked, they would shut down the plants. No one was
dumb enough to believe them nor did that happen despite years of complaints along with credible data showing leakage and the harm.

When the leaking coal ash ponds were finally acknowledged by the State, the company installed a groundwater pollution control system that relies on pump-back wells. Colstrip hosts one of the biggest coal ash pond complexes in the nation at 837 acres and **these ponds leak 500,000 gallons of water into the aquifer each day**. In 2011 there were 900 wells surrounding the coal ash ponds, today there are close to **2,000 wells** that monitor and pump about **1 million gallons of water EACH day** out of the aquifer to keep the plume from spreading.

This leaking contaminated water is polluting the aquifer with heavy metals and sulfates at levels toxic to humans, livestock, and wildlife. The coal ash-contaminated water in the ponds is 10x the background levels for sulfates in the area, 100x for boron, and 70x for lithium. The coal ash contaminated water is 1000x the EPA [Environmental Protection Agency] standard for manganese. Radium and selenium levels are high as are many other pollutants.

Colstrip Units 1&2 coal ash ponds actually sit within the area’s water table. Talen Energy’s RER plan for the Units 1&2 ponds as submitted to Montana DEQ is to simply cap the ponds in place. **This is totally unacceptable.** No matter what cap is placed on *top* of the pond, polluted water will continue to spread down into the ground and into the region’s aquifer. Pumping the groundwater back into the ponds as is currently being done will have to be done in perpetuity – and that will never solve the problem. Talen Energy’s plan must remove the coal ash from the ponds and store it properly – dry – to even begin to solve the problem.

The coal ash ponds MUST be drained, and the coal ash dried out, dug up, and then stored in an approved, lined waste facility high above the water table. Aquifer pumping must continue – and the water treated – until the aquifer is restored to its original cleanliness. This “high and dry” method will result in a permanent solution to the toxic waste disaster at Colstrip. Bipartisan legislatures in North Carolina, South Carolina, Illinois, and Virginia have all passed laws mandating that coal ash ponds having contact with the water table be excavated. Montana needs to join that list of responsible states.

DEQ is the state agency responsible for holding the corporate owners of Colstrip accountable for this pollution. These owners have made billions of dollars while operating the power plant through the years even as they have failed to ever propose an effective solution to the leaking coal ash ponds. The State of Montana is already dealing with major corporate pollution legacies – in Libby, Butte, and Zortman-Landusky to name just a few – and getting the money out of liquidated or bankrupt corporations is not an option. We the people end up paying. Do NOT let this happen at Colstrip. The corporate owners are still there. These owners MUST pay for the mess they made. They must clean up the pollution and restore the aquifer. Do It Right! This time, the corporate polluters must pay. Do not shift this toxic waste legacy onto the taxpayers.

Thank you for consideration of my comments.

Beth Kaeding, 1024 Boylan Road, Bozeman, Montana 59715    kaedingl@aol.com
Ms. Edinberg,

I'm writing to request that the DEQ approve a Remedy Evaluation Report that provides a permanent solution to the groundwater pollution associated with the Units 1&2 ash ponds and the continuing adverse effects on groundwater from the 3&4 ponds at Colstrip. Talen Energy has proposed to cover the ponds with the coal ash left inside (cap-in-place) and expand its current groundwater capture system, augmented with freshwater injection wells, rather than remove the waste and contaminated soil. A complete solution will involve removal of the source of contamination and remediating the impacted groundwater.

The 1 & 2 and plant site ponds were originally constructed with a mixture of clay, compacted soil, and hypalon liners because, for many decades, the industry standard was to build ponds without liners, or with liners that are extremely permeable, ultimately resulting in leakage. In the cases where compacted soil and clay was used, this is the only barrier between the effluent slurry and the surrounding bedrock and soils. Liners originally constructed with Hypalon, partial clay, clay-lined, and a compacted bentonite/soil mixture are largely considered inadequate.

The 3 & 4 ponds were originally constructed without liners under the assumption that the leachate collection system installed beneath the pond and the concrete slurry wall would prevent most of the seepage.

During the years of Montana Power Company’s ownership of the Colstrip generating units, I had literally first-hand knowledge of the effects of coal ash slurry placed in ponds on the local groundwater. As an employee of MPC’s consultant in the 1980’s, I was involved in the preparation of hydrologic investigation work plans and developed groundwater monitoring networks for MPC’s coal-fired power plant and associated effluent holding ponds. Installation, sampling, and aquifer testing of monitoring wells were part of MPCs ongoing monitoring program at the Colstrip plants. The project involved several investigations of leaking process ponds, construction and expansion activities that were occurring at that time, and the preparation of annual hydrologic monitoring reports for review by state regulatory agencies. I watched as the 3&4 EHP’s perimeter slurry wall was being constructed and the pond basin clay-lined. After the groundwater monitoring network peripheral to the EHP was installed, I also reviewed data that
showed the immediate effects to the area groundwater - hydrostatically and chemically - as the fly ash effluent had begun to be impounded within the newly constructed EHP.

The 1&2 and 3&4 process water ponds have been leaking since their construction more than 30 years ago and consequently the plume of leaked plant process water has expanded significantly through the years. The groundwater capture wells seem to be holding the plume at its current extent for the most part, but the wells do not capture all of the leakage and wells that have subsequently been installed have revealed newly contaminated areas.

At the Units 1&2 ponds, groundwater contaminant plumes with very high levels of boron, total dissolved solids, and sulfates extend more than 1,000 feet from the closed ponds and, in addition, the contaminant plume has affected several private water wells. Impacted groundwater has been identified in several downgradient locations from the Units 3 & 4 EHP ponds, including in the alluvium of Cow Creek and South Fork Cow Creek. Wells just outside the EHP walls have shown boron levels from 75 mg/L and as high as 148 mg/L in alluvium. Monitoring wells south of the ponds in alluvium have shown boron levels up to 13.3 mg/L, exceeding background screening levels for boron in the area’s groundwater in the range of 0.818 - 4 mg/L.

The bedrock geology consists of generally flat-lying sediments of the Fort Union formation, but some of these sediments are slightly altered locally fractured. These fractures can affect groundwater flow direction and vertical and horizontal velocities. The sedimentary bedrock underlying the Colstrip area shows large horizontal changes in the parameters that govern groundwater flow. This is especially true within the shallowest coal seam, Rosebud Coal, which has naturally burned in the area in an irregular pattern resulting, in certain locations, extensively altered hard, highly fractured material. The only option for discontinuing the migration of groundwater is to fully de-water all ponds with aggressive pumping, including wells drilled into the ash itself and horizontal capture wells beneath the underdrain.

When the Units 1&2 Flyash Pond (A and B Ponds) when originally constructed, the pond basin was covered with the three-foot clay layer - but not uniformly. The three-foot minimum liner was installed on the sides of the pond and alluvial deposits that were present in the pond bottom were removed and backfilled with compacted clay. Where siltstone/shale was already present on the pond bottom, it was compacted and left in place but not covered with additional clay materials. I will add here that the “clay” used in the early pond construction came from area siltstones and mudstones that were determined to have enough clay content to qualify as pond clay liner. I have never thought that they had adequate clay development.

Personal experience monitoring groundwater on the periphery of process ponds, has led me to only conclude that I have never met a pond that didn’t leak. And the Colstrip ponds will continue to leak as long as bedrock is in contact with saturated coal combustion materials present in the impoundments and effluent and process water from the generating units.

Despite all of the seepage velocity calculations and flow models that have been presented for the 1&2 Evaporation Ponds and 3&4 EHP, the real proof is what we see downgradient in the bedrock and alluvium. The hydraulic conductivities of the native “clay” lining material has been altered in transport and “compaction”. No one should be surprised that the Units 1&2 Stage One
pond is still affecting local groundwater. I submit that, no matter what cap has been installed, there will always be seepage through the coal combustion materials into the underling bedrock and alluvium as long as the coal combustion materials remain in place.

An adequate remedy to lessen and minimize area groundwater needs to include releasing the head pressure of the ponds, dewatering of underlying sedimentary bedrock and unconsolidated sediments by utilizing underdrains and a well capture system, and removal and excavating of coal combustion materials from the ponds. Dewatering will allow removal of the materials with a temporary, artificially lowered water table. An effective prescribed cap will need to be installed following the removal.

Sincerely,

Daniel Shaffer
Helena, Montana
Montana DEQ  
P.O. Box 200901  
Helena, MT 59620  

RE: Comments on Colstrip Units 1 & 2 Ponds and the Plant Site  

To Whom It May Concern:  

I lived in the Superfund city of Anaconda with my husband and children, moving there shortly after the closure of the smelter. The pollution was both visible and more insidiously, invisible. It was easy to see the vast areas east, north and south of the site that were affected by a hundred years of smelting. Less visible was the damage to soil and water and the legacy of health problems left from the smelter. DEQ needs to protect the citizens of Colstrip and the land and water that they and agriculture depend on. Talen Energy needs to pay for long-term closure solutions that if not adequate, could negatively affect agriculture and the health of people, land and water.  

A “clean and healthful environment” is guaranteed by the Montana Constitution. Ensure that Rosebud County residents can claim their constitutional rights by requiring Talen Energy to clean up the ash ponds in the safest possible way.  

**High and Dry Solution**  
Cap-in-place failed in 1997. The pond for Units 1 and 2 was capped in 1997 and continues to leak 12,000 gallons of wastewater per day. Cap-in-Place is at best a poor short-term solution and a completely inadequate long-term solution. Full dewatering and excavation of coal ash (“high and dry”) at Units 1 & 2 ponds and the Plant Site is a permanent solution. A case study on coal ash cleanup projects across the United States revealed that removing coal ash and dewatering ash ponds that are above the water table is a proven method to stop contamination quickly and permanently. Require Talen to do it right so it doesn’t have to be done later, after pollution has caused problems to the aquifer.  

**Talen Energy, NOT Montana Taxpayers, Should Pay for “Fix It Forever” Solutions**  
If Talen Energy is allowed to use the “pollute in place” short-term solution, Montana taxpayers will eventually end up paying for the long-term solutions. Even more importantly, the people of Rosebud County will be stuck with the health problems and soil and water pollution that resulted from the cap-in-place temporary solution.  

**Safe, Permanent Cleanup Creates Jobs**  
Talen Energy has had years to plan for site clean-up. It is estimated that doing it right will cost Talen approximately $243 million. A few years ago, Talen paid a bonus of $500 million to its shareholders. Talen should be able to afford the $243 million to protect the people who worked for them and the land they used. Talen’s proposal will require approximately 92 yearly direct jobs from 2020 to 2030 and about 40 yearly direct jobs from 2030-2069. Doing the job right – which means aggressive pond and soil dewatering and capping of all ash ponds – will result in approximately 219 direct jobs from 2020 – 2030 and 66 direct jobs from 2030-2040.  

Responsible cleanup is a common-sense solution for ranchers, Colstrip residents, and the taxpayers of Montana.
Thank you for the opportunity to comment.

Sincerely,
Marylis Filipovich
Helena, Montana
Hi, Sara –

This comment came in over the DEQ Communications email. Usually when this occurs on other projects, I believe our MEPA folks just roll them in with other comments that come in over the designated email.

Thanks,

Paul D

From: J.may@live.com [mailto:J.may@live.com]
Sent: Wednesday, December 11, 2019 10:02 AM
To: DEQ Communications Team <DEQCommunicationsTeam@mt.gov>
Subject: General Comment,

Hi,

In regard to Talen’s proposed closure and cleanup plan for Colstrip 1 and 2: DEQ needs to require a proper cleanup which would include removal of ash, drying of ash and placement into lined landfills. It’s beyond my understanding why this coal ash was ever allowed to be placed into unlined ponds which naturally precipitated a migration into the groundwater. A continuation of the current recycling process is not a solution. Thank you.

- Jody B May
Dear Friends at Montana DEQ,

RE: Costrip Units 1 & 2 Ash Pond Cleanup

I write in support of digging out and removing all of the coal ash in the Unit 1 and 2 ponds and putting all of it in a new lined landfill that is entirely above the ground water table. The present Colstrip ash ponds are huge and deep, and they have been leaking toxic and dangerous heavy metals into the groundwater at the rate of thousands of gallons a day almost since their inception. The ground water underneath the community of Costrip was poisoned years ago and it continues to be a threat to ranchers and farmers in the surrounding area.

Montana has a history of corporations coming into our state, taking the riches out of the earth, making millions upon millions of dollars for their top executives and shareholders, and then leaving a toxic mess for Montana taxpayers to clean up. Some of them, like Zortman-Landusky will never be cleaned up, and we--the citizens of Montana--will be paying forever to manage what corporations left behind after they took the money and left the state. We already have enough Superfund sites in Montana. If the coal ash clean is not done right, Montana taxpayers will again end up paying millions of dollars to deal with the environmental and financial results. And I believe Colstrip will eventually become yet another Zortman-Landusky if this is not done right.

There is absolutely no justification (giving in to corporate pressure is not a justification) to just capping the ash and leaving it in place where it will, no doubt, continue to leak into and severely pollute the ground water. Although at first glance, removal may seem like a more costly option, in reality, in the long term, it is actually the less costly option. Doing this right now will save Montana millions of dollars for years and years to come. It is also the best outcome for the community of Costrip. The removal option will create good jobs for Colstrip workers who are about to lose their jobs when Units 1 & 2 shut down, and it will help the town weather and be better able to survive the upheaval the town is about to endure. This is hugely important!

Please do the right thing for Colstrip and for all of Montana. Dig out and remove Colstrip 1 and 2 ash and put it in a new, lined pond out of contact with the water table.

Please include my comments in the official record.
Thank you,
Adela Awner
1109 Delphinium Drive
Billings, MT 59102
I am concerned about the future of the Colstrip electrical generating facility. I believe that shutting down these coal fired electrical generators is a positive step into the future and that step should leave an environmentally clean past. Talen should not be allowed to exit the scene without fully addressing the groundwater contamination created by their coal ash. This means:

- Full dewatering and excavation of coal ash at Units 1 & 2 ponds and the Plant site.
- Assurance that a similar problem does not exist at Colstrip 3 & 4.
- Aggressive pond and soil dewatering and capping at Units 3 & 4.
- Groundwater treatment.

Sincerely,

Paul Pacini

303 State Street
Helena, Montana 59601-5788
U.S.A.

406.443.7730 - hm
406.431.7306 - cll
ppacini47@gmail.com
Sara,

Don't let us down on remediation of the ash ponds resulting from Colstrip 1 and 2. Zortman-Landusky is costing Montana and our nation billions of dollars and the issues will never be totally resolved.

But, at Colstrip, you have a chance to make sure the companies that have profited from the plants for years be responsible for remediating the damage to our water to the highest degree possible. Make sure the companies are required to:

- Excavate and move all coal ash in the Unit 1&2 ponds to a new, lined landfill.
- Provide bonding to pump water beyond 2070 in ensure Montana taxpayers are not required obligated to pay remediation costs that are attributable to the companies' operations.

--
Senator Sue Malek
Senate District 46
1400 Prairie Way
Missoula, MT  59802
Dear Sara and DEQ

I apologize for using email in lieu of a formal letter on stationary, but my computer is in the repair shop.

I want to encourage the DEQ to make sure the clean up method selected will leave the groundwater for the future in drinkable and useable condition. I have been born and raised in Eastern Montana and water is in short supply and necessary for agriculture production. The farmers and ranchers in my area that I most respect have been on the same land for four and five generations and can notice changes to their land in production of crops, cattle, and water quality. I want my farm and ranch constituent's concerns to be handled, as the ag industry is our number one industry and will still be here when the plants are no longer needed for electricity.

I am most concerned with the pond that is below the water table, as all liners leak at some point.

I want adequate clean up, so we don't have problems that would be more costly down the road.

I want to thank you for making sure Montana will be healthy in the future and considering my comments.

Sincerely,
Geraldine Custer
Rep. HD 39

Legislators are publicly elected officials. Legislator emails sent or received involving legislative business may be subject to the Right to Know provisions of the Montana Constitution and may be considered a "public record" pursuant to Montana law. As such, email, sent or received, its sender and receiver, and the email contents, may be subject to public disclosure, except as otherwise provided by Montana law.